



INTERNAL AUDIT DIVISION

REPORT 2014/030

Audit of movement control operations in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

Overall results relating to the effective management of movement control operations in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti were initially assessed as partially satisfactory. Implementation of two important recommendations remains in progress

FINAL OVERALL RATING: PARTIALLY
SATISFACTORY

7 May 2014
Assignment No. AP2013/683/03

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. OBJECTIVE AND SCOPE	1-2
III. AUDIT RESULTS	2-5
A. Regulatory framework	2-4
B. Coordinated management	4-5
IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	5
ANNEX I Status of audit recommendations	
APPENDIX I Management response	

AUDIT REPORT

Audit of movement control operations in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

I. BACKGROUND

1. The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of movement control operations in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH).
2. In accordance with its mandate, OIOS provides assurance and advice on the adequacy and effectiveness of the United Nations internal control system, the primary objectives of which are to ensure: (a) efficient and effective operations; (b) accurate financial and operational reporting; (c) safeguarding of assets; and (d) compliance with mandates, regulations and rules.
3. The Movement Control (MovCon) Section in MINUSTAH played a critical role in providing efficient multi-modal transportation operations to meet the Mission's mandate. The Section was responsible for planning, managing and controlling the movement of passengers and cargo for MINUSTAH and its activities were governed by the Department of Peacekeeping Operations (DPKO)/Department of Field Support (DFS) Movement Control Manual. The MovCon Section's approved budget for 2012/13 was \$31 million. The Section was headed by a Chief at the P-4 level, and was supported by 11 international staff, 2 United Nations volunteers and 34 national staff. During the period from 1 July 2011 to 30 June 2013, the MovCon Section transported 63,019 passengers and 31 million kilograms of cargo.
4. Comments provided by MINUSTAH are incorporated in italics.

II. OBJECTIVE AND SCOPE

5. The audit was conducted to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of MINUSTAH governance, risk management and control processes in providing reasonable assurance regarding the **effective management of movement control operations in MINUSTAH**.
6. The audit was included in the OIOS 2013 risk-based work plan because of the operational and financial risks relating to movement control operations.
7. The key controls tested for the audit were: (a) regulatory framework; and (b) coordinated management. For the purpose of this audit, OIOS defined these key controls as follows:
 - (a) **Regulatory framework** – controls that provide reasonable assurance that policies and procedures: (i) exist to guide movement control operations; (ii) are implemented consistently; and (iii) ensure the reliability and integrity of financial and operational information.
 - (b) **Coordinated management** – controls that provide reasonable assurance that potential overlaps in the movement of troops, cargo and personnel are mitigated and that issues affecting or involving other MINUSTAH sections are identified, discussed and resolved in a timely manner.
8. The key controls were assessed for the control objectives shown in Table 1.

9. OIOS conducted this audit from September 2013 to January 2014. The audit covered the period from 1 July 2011 to 30 June 2013.

10. OIOS conducted an activity-level risk assessment to identify and assess specific risk exposures, and to confirm the relevance of the selected key controls in mitigating associated risks. Through interviews, analytical reviews and tests of controls, OIOS assessed the existence and adequacy of internal controls and conducted necessary tests to determine their effectiveness.

III. AUDIT RESULTS

11. The MINUSTAH governance, risk management and control processes examined were initially assessed as **partially satisfactory** in providing reasonable assurance regarding the **effective management of movement control operations in MINUSTAH**. OIOS made three recommendations to address the issues identified. MINUSTAH established procedures to ensure that all cargo movements were properly recorded and tracked, contracts for transport of goods were renewed on a timely basis, staff were provided necessary training, and activities were adequately coordinated with key sections involved in the movement of passengers and cargo. However, MINUSTAH needed to: (a) formally address with the Haitian Government the lack of immigration officers at the MINUSTAH terminal for international flights; (b) reinforce security measures at air terminals; and (c) adequately screen contingent personnel baggage and stores of equipment to prevent unauthorized movement of United Nations-owned equipment.

12. The initial overall rating was based on the assessment of key controls presented in Table 1 below. The final overall rating is **partially satisfactory** as implementation of two important recommendations remains in progress.

Table 1: Assessment of key controls

Business objective	Key controls	Control objectives			
		Efficient and effective operations	Accurate financial and operational reporting	Safeguarding of assets	Compliance with mandates, regulations and rules
Effective management of movement control operations in MINUSTAH	(a) Regulatory framework	Partially satisfactory	Partially satisfactory	Partially satisfactory	Partially satisfactory
	(b) Coordinated management	Partially satisfactory	Partially satisfactory	Partially satisfactory	Partially satisfactory
FINAL OVERALL RATING: PARTIALLY SATISFACTORY					

A. Regulatory framework

Lapses in control by the Haitian immigration authorities needed to be brought to their attention

13. The DPKO/DFS Movement Control Manual required the Mission to provide reliable movement of personnel within and outside of MINUSTAH, including maintaining records of no-show passengers, and liaising with local immigration and customs authorities to complete formalities for international flights.

14. A review of 344 movement of personnel forms selected from the 8,872 that were raised during the audit period indicated that adequate procedures were in place to ensure that travel requests were approved and properly completed prior to travel. Moreover, the MovCon Section: (a) broadcasted passenger load lists on the intranet one day prior to travel as required; (b) prepared load lists for all movement of personnel forms based on available seats, and booked passengers according to operational priority; and (c) ensured that non-MINUSTAH passengers signed the waiver of liability form before boarding United Nations flights.

15. OIOS observed that passengers boarded MINUSTAH international flights to Santo Domingo from Port-au-Prince without their passport being checked and stamped, which was a requirement of the Haitian immigration authorities. This was not being done as there was no host country immigration officer located at the point of departure. While the MovCon Section explained that this was a recurring issue, MINUSTAH had not formally raised this matter with the Haitian immigration officials to ensure regular presence of immigration officials at the MINUSTAH terminal prior to the boarding of international flights.

16. No record of no-show passengers was maintained. The MovCon Section discontinued this procedure in 2010 due to prioritization of resources and lack of guidelines for dealing with no-show passengers. Subsequent to the audit, as no-show passengers increased travel costs and took away seats from others planning to travel, MINUSTAH reinstated the procedure for monitoring no-show passengers and started issuing written notifications to those passengers who repeatedly failed to cancel their travel by the required date. OIOS was satisfied with the action taken.

(1) MINUSTAH should communicate with the Government of Haiti to ensure regular presence of immigration officials at the Mission air terminal for international flights.

MINUSTAH accepted recommendation 1 and stated that a draft letter was being finalized by Legal Affairs and would be submitted to the Office of the Director of Mission Support for review and approval. Recommendation 1 remains open pending receipt of a copy of the official correspondence sent from the Mission to the responsible government authority.

There was adequate control over cargo movement, vendor contract management and invoice certification

17. The MINUSTAH standard operating procedures for processing cargo required the MovCon Section to move cargo within the Mission area and from port of entry to the respective end-user in a timely and secured manner, and to ensure that all requisite documents relating to the transportation of cargo were completed.

18. A review of 46 cargo movement requests selected from the 1,949 issued during the audit period indicated that MINUSTAH properly documented and transported cargo to end-users on a timely basis accompanied with the required documentation. There were no cases of lost cargo reported in the period under review.

19. Moreover, a review of 46 invoices for movement of cargo by third-party logistics contractors indicated that the MovCon Section ensured that cargo movements were approved and each had a completed service certification report and confirmation that services were rendered in accordance with the contract. The MovCon Section completed vendor appraisals prior to the extension of any contract and periodic performance reports were forwarded to the Procurement Section. OIOS concluded that the MovCon Section had established an adequate mechanism to ensure: all cargo movements were recorded, tracked, labeled and packaged; and cargo manifests were duly approved.

Need to improve safety and security of movement of personnel and cargo

20. The DPKO/DFS Movement Control Manual required the Security Section to supervise the safe clearing of weapons of uniformed personnel before boarding an aircraft. The security personnel were also required to screen passengers and cargo using equipment such as X-ray machines, walk through body scanners and hand held metal detectors.

21. The Security Section in conjunction with the MovCon Section provided security personnel at all five airport terminals. A review of security measures at all air terminals and visits to two air terminals indicated that X-ray machines and other security equipment such as body scanners in four out of the five terminals had not been operational for the past year due to lack of regular servicing. As a result, the Security Section did not electronically scan passengers and goods, including dangerous goods prior to boarding/loading the aircraft at the four terminals that did not have equipment. OIOS also observed some uniformed personnel carrying service weapons on board the United Nations aircraft without clearing them as required by MovCon Section procedures.

(2) MINUSTAH should reinforce security measures at its air terminals by ensuring that: (a) all X-ray screening machines are operational and regularly serviced; and (b) procedures for clearing weapons carried by uniformed personnel before boarding United Nations flights are enforced.

MINUSTAH accepted recommendation 2 and stated that from 1 April 2014, equipment had been repaired and armed personnel (Police and Military) were reminded of procedures for clearing weapons prior to boarding United Nations flights. Based on the action taken by MINUSTAH, recommendation 2 has been closed.

Movement control staff were trained on handling dangerous goods

22. The DPKO/DFS Movement Control Manual required movement control staff to be properly trained on handling dangerous goods. MINUSTAH ensured that staff were adequately trained, which resulted in 41 of the 48 staff in the MovCon Section being trained on handling dangerous goods. OIOS concluded that movement control staff members were being trained on the handling of dangerous goods.

B. Coordinated management

The Movement Control Section was adequately coordinating with and supporting other sections involved in its operations

23. To carry out its mandated tasks, the MovCon Section was required to coordinate with and receive support from other sections in MINUSTAH namely the Communication and Information Technology, Transport and Aviation Sections.

24. A review of the MovCon Section's coordination mechanisms indicated that the Communication and Information Technology Section maintained secure electronic systems for booking passengers and cargo movement. A review of 344 movement of personnel forms, 46 cargo movement requests and 51 special flight requests indicated that access to both databases were adequately secured and only accessible through an authorized user name and password. The Transport Section made available 34 United Nations-owned medium and heavy-duty trucks and 12 forklifts for the movement of cargo by road to other regions and the Aviation Section provided adequate support to the MovCon Section for the movement of

passengers and cargo by aircraft. OIOS concluded that the MovCon Section was adequately coordinating the movement of passengers and cargo with other sections involved in movement control operations.

Deployment, rotation and repatriation of formed military and police units needed improvement

25. The DPKO/DFS Movement Control Manual required military police at contingent locations to inspect unit stores and personal baggage of contingents, one day prior to their rotation. The inspection was needed to ensure that United Nations-owned equipment and prohibited articles were not removed from the Mission. In addition, the MovCon Section was required to check contingent baggage to ensure that they complied with the authorized weight and volume allowed on flights.

26. During the audit period, the MovCon Section facilitated the movement of 57,080 troops in coordination with the Movement Coordination Section of DFS. A review of 50 of the 157 rotations/deployment carried out using United Nations chartered aircraft indicated that requisite processes and procedures were complied with, including ensuring that only the authorized weight and volume of baggage was allowed on flights and that there were sufficient safeguards implemented to prevent unauthorized movement of United Nations-owned equipment or prohibited articles.

27. However, for rotations/deployment of troops using aircraft under letters of assist, OIOS observed that there were inadequate: (a) procedures to ensure that only the authorized weight and volume of baggage was allowed on flights; and (b) safeguards to prevent unauthorized movement of United Nations-owned equipment or prohibited articles. This was because the MovCon Section was not involved in the preparation of troops for departure when aircraft were provided under a letter of assist, although the DPKO/DFS Movement Control Manual required such involvement. The MovCon Section explained that they did not comply with the standard procedures due to the absence of instructions from DFS who arranged flights under letters of assist.

(3) MINUSTAH should implement local procedures to ensure that troops being repatriated using aircraft provided under letters of assist are properly screened before boarding aircrafts.

MINUSTAH accepted recommendation 3 and stated that coordination meetings would be held with the Military Chief of Staff and revised procedures would be included in the next Movement Order for rotation under letters of assist. Troops would be checked via the MovCon Section's rotation terminal as per procedures for rotation under commercial charter flight. Recommendation 3 remains open pending receipt of evidence that the MovCon Section are involved in the screening process for troops rotated by flights provided for under letters of assist.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

28. OIOS wishes to express its appreciation to the Management and staff of MINUSTAH for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.

(Signed) David Kanja
Assistant Secretary-General for Internal Oversight Services

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of movement control operations in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

Recom. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
1	MINUSTAH should communicate with the Government of Haiti to ensure regular presence of immigration officials at the Mission air terminal for international flights.	Important	O	Receipt of a copy of the official correspondence sent from the Mission to the responsible government authority.	April 2014
2	MINUSTAH should reinforce security measures at its air terminals by ensuring that: (a) all X-ray screening machines are operational and regularly serviced; and (b) procedures for clearing weapons carried by uniformed personnel before boarding United Nations flights are enforced.	Important	C	Action taken.	Implemented
3	MINUSTAH should implement local procedures to ensure that troops being repatriated using aircraft provided under letters of assist are properly screened before boarding aircrafts.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that the MovCon Section are involved in the screening process for troops rotated by flights provided for under letters of assist.	May 2014

¹ Critical recommendations address significant and/or pervasive deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

³ C = closed, O = open

⁴ Date provided by MINUSTAH

APPENDIX I

Management Response



TELEFAX TRANSMISSION

Outgoing fax msg no:	SRSG/14/11/10 615	Page 1 of 2
To:	Ms. Eleanor T. Burns Chief, Peacekeeping Audit Service, IAD, OIOS, UNHQ, NY	From: Sandra Honoré Special Representative of the Secretary-General MINUSTAH
Fax no:	3-3388 (via email)	Fax no: 7-9080
Info:	Ms. Amy Wong (wong6@un.org) Mr. Iswari Bhattarai (bhattarai2@un.org)	Date: 21 April 2014
		Ref: IAD: 12-683/03
Subject:	Assignment No AP2013/683/03 – Audit of Movement Control Operations in MINUSTAH	

1. Reference is made to your memorandum of 21 March 2014 on the above mentioned subject, under cover of which you forwarded the OIOS overall results relating to the effective management of movement control operations in MINUSTAH.

2. Please find attached MINUSTAH's comments on the recommendations as requested.

Best regards.

Drafted by:	G. Bien Aime, AA O/DDMS	Cleared by:	P. Compte, DDMS
-------------	-------------------------	-------------	-----------------

Management Response

Audit of movement control operations in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical/ Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
1	MINUSTAH should communicate with the Government of Haiti to ensure regular presence of immigration officials at the Mission air terminal for international flights.	Important	Yes	Chief Movement Control (MovCon) Section	21 April 2014	Draft letter is being finalized by Legal Affairs and will be submitted to the Office of Director of Mission Support on 21 April 2014 for review and approval.
2	MINUSTAH should reinforce security measures at its air terminals by ensuring that: (a) all X-ray screening machines are operational and regularly serviced; and (b) procedures for clearing weapons carried by uniformed personnel before boarding United Nations flights are enforced.	Important	Yes	Chief Security Advisor	01 April 2014	Equipment has been repaired and armed personnel (Police and Military) are being reminded of procedures for clearing weapons prior boarding United Nations flights.
3	MINUSTAH should implement local procedures to ensure that troops being repatriated using aircraft provided under letters of assist are properly screened before boarding aircrafts.	Important	Yes	Chief MovCon Section	01 May 2014	Coordination meetings will be held with Military Chief of Staff and revised procedures will be included in the next Movement Order for rotation under Letters of Assist and troops will be checked via MovCon Rotation Terminal as per procedures for rotation under commercial charter flight.

¹ Critical recommendations address significant and/or pervasive deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.