

INTERNAL AUDIT DIVISION

REPORT 2018/095

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

The logistics support strategy and framework needed to be reassessed and revised in agreement with the police and substantive components to increase efficiency and effectiveness of support services for the Mission

16 October 2018

Assignment No. AP2018/685/02

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti (MINUJUSTH) to assess their adequacy and effectiveness. The audit covered the period from 16 October 2017 to 30 June 2018 and addressed higher and medium risk areas in support services, which included: logistics support provided to police and substantive components, medical evacuations and referrals, storage and supply of fuel and rations and operations and maintenance of facilities and equipment.

MINUJUSTH has made significant efforts to leverage the existing infrastructure and assets of the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti to establish logistical support functions. However, the logistics support strategy and framework needed to be reassessed and revised in agreement with the police and substantive components to increase efficiency and effectiveness of support services for the Mission.

OIOS made 10 recommendations. To address issues identified in the audit, MINUJUSTH needed to:

- Clearly define the Mission's aviation requirements in collaboration with the relevant Mission components;
- Assign United Nations police officers and contingent personnel to support movement control activities;
- Allocate resources to enhance the operational capacity of the United Nations clinic;
- Provide feedback to the Medical Services Division on the status of implementation of recommendations of the 2017 technical assessment mission to review the appropriateness of actions taken by the Mission to address identified medical risks;
- Improve monitoring of vehicle usage by scrutinizing the consumption of fuel, kilometre readings and car log data to ensure the optimal utilization of vehicles;
- Develop an action plan in coordination with the contractor to dispose of surplus food rations;
- Implement adequate procedures such as spot checks to verify the appropriateness of the disposal of damaged and expired rations by the contractor and its subcontractors;
- Implement its standard operating procedures for invoice processing to ensure invoices are paid expeditiously to take advantage of prompt payment discounts;
- Assess the requirement for renovation of camps and offices and develop a strategy to complete the necessary renovation work; and
- Allocate resources to complete minor vehicle repairs in-house and only utilize outsourcing contracts to complete major vehicle repairs.

MINUJUSTH accepted the recommendations and initiated action to implement them.

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	1-2
III. AUDIT RESULTS	2-10
A. Logistics support provided to police and substantive components	2-3
B. Medical evacuations and referrals	3-5
C. Storage and supply of fuel and rations	5-8
D. Operations and maintenance of facilities and equipment	8-10
IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	10
 ANNEX I Status of audit recommendations	
 APPENDIX I Management response	

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

I. BACKGROUND

1. The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti (MINUJUSTH).
2. In its resolution 2350 (2017), the Security Council mandated the establishment of MINUJUSTH to: (a) assist the Government of Haiti to strengthen rule of law institutions in Haiti, further support and develop the Haitian National Police; (b) engage in human rights monitoring, reporting, and analysis; (c) protect civilians under imminent threat of physical violence, within the capabilities of the Mission and areas of deployment, as needed; and (d) take into account gender mainstreaming as a crosscutting issue throughout its mandate and to assist the Government of Haiti in ensuring the participation, involvement and representation of women at all levels.
3. The Chief of Mission Support is responsible to provide effective and efficient logistical services in support of the implementation of the Mission's mandate. Support is to be provided to the authorized strength of 980 personnel in seven Formed Police Units, 295 Individual Police Officers as well as 395 international staff, 200 national staff and 15 United Nations Volunteers. The range of logistics support comprise air and surface transportation, maintenance and construction of office and accommodation facilities, storage and supply of fuel and rations, and provision of information and communication technology and health care.
4. The 2017/18 budget for MINUJUSTH totaled \$98.1 million, including \$38.1 million for police personnel, \$27.8 million for civilian personnel and \$32.2 million in operational costs.
5. Comments provided by MINUJUSTH are incorporated in italics.

II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

6. The objective of the audit was to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in MINUJUSTH.
7. This audit was included in the 2018 risk-based work plan of OIOS due to the financial and operational risks related to the provision of logistics support services to police and substantive components of the Mission.
8. OIOS conducted this audit from March to July 2018. The audit covered the period from 16 October 2017 to 30 June 2018. Based on an activity-level risk assessment, the audit covered higher and medium risk areas in support services, which included: logistics support provided to police and substantive components, medical evacuations and referrals, storage and supply of fuel and rations and operations and maintenance of facilities and equipment.
9. The audit methodology included: (a) interviews of key personnel, (b) reviews of relevant documentation, (c) analytical reviews of data, and (d) sample testing of 654 engineering work orders, 117 police vehicles and 166 generators using a judgmental sampling approach.

10. The audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing.

III. AUDIT RESULTS

A. Logistics support provided to police and substantive components

Strategic documents necessary for aviation support planning were not adequately prepared

11. The Department of Peacekeeping Operations/Department of Field Support (DPKO/DFS) Aviation Manual requires aviation planners, in developing the Aviation Support Plan, to obtain relevant and up-to-date information on required aviation logistical support from the Police Concepts of Operations and other documents to adequately plan each year's aviation requirements.

12. The MINUJUSTH Mission Support Concept prepared in July 2017 had not been updated to take into account the aviation requirements of the Mission. For example, the Mission Support Concept indicated that the Mission will have commercially provided air assets comprising one civilian fixed wing aircraft and two civilian medium utility rotary wing aircraft. However, the contract for the fixed wing aircraft was discontinued in February 2018 as an analysis conducted by Aviation personnel indicated that it was not cost-effective to maintain, resulting in cost savings of \$1.1 million per year. The Mission Support Concept also indicated that MINUJUSTH could replace the two commercial helicopters with an aviation unit provided by a contingent. In March 2018, the Special Representative of the Secretary-General rejected the request for a police helicopter unit mainly due to lack of funds. The Mission was spending about \$4.5 million per year for the two commercial helicopters while the cost for the police helicopter unit was estimated at \$10 million per year. In addition, the MINUJUSTH Police Concepts of Operations only indicated that the MINUJUSTH Chief of Mission Support would be responsible for managing air assets without stating the Mission's requirements for aviation support in terms of number of passengers, frequency of trips, base flight hours and flight objectives. The other substantive units, organized in mobile teams, had not yet provided their requirements for aviation support. As a result, their movements were mostly conducted by road.

13. The above occurred because, since the start of the Mission, MINUJUSTH senior management had not been able to work in close collaboration to establish a linkage between the Mission Support Concept, Police Concepts of Operations and the mobile team concept to clearly define the requirements for aviation support services and revise the relevant portion of the Mission Support Plan accordingly. As a result, air assets were not adequately utilized. For example, the two rotary wing aircrafts were only utilized at about 38 per cent of the capacity (272 out of 707 budget flight hours used) in fiscal year 2017/18.

(1) MINUJUSTH should revise the Mission Support Plan to ensure that the Mission's aviation requirements are clearly defined in collaboration with the relevant Mission components.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 1 and stated that the flight requirements in support of the Mission mandate were integrated into the 2017/18 Aviation Support Plan. Recommendation 1 remains open pending receipt of the revised Aviation Support Plan.

Need for effective collaboration with the Police component to provide critical aviation services

14. The Aviation and Aviation Safety Manuals require, for flight safety reasons, that MINUJUSTH: (i) screen cargo and passengers before boarding an aircraft; (ii) secure the helicopter landing site to prevent

inadvertent entry or other potentially dangerous situations from arising during landing; and (iii) assign a sufficient number of staff at appropriate levels to perform aviation safety functions.

15. The Mission operated 14 regular flights to and from five field locations every week. OIOS field visit to the Movement Control (MovCon) terminal in Port-au-Prince indicated that passengers were properly security screened before boarding the aircraft. Since there were no Mission staff in the regions, MovCon implemented a mitigating measure of assigning a monitor to each flight to ensure effective check-in and embarkation on returning flights from the regions. However, a review of the flight manifests indicated that MovCon did not assign a monitor for 4 out of 148 flights conducted between 16 October and 30 June 2018. As a result, the passengers were allowed on board without proper security screening and cargo loaded from these locations was also not screened and separated from dangerous goods. The Mission also utilized 11 helicopter landing sites located throughout Haiti to support police operations, mobile team activities and medical/casualty evacuations. However, discussions with logistics personnel indicated that the Mission Support component had not established arrangements with the contingents to provide security at all the helicopter landing sites prior to the arrival of the aircraft.

16. The above resulted due to staffing constraints within MovCon and Aviation Safety Units and the current MINUJUSTH staffing structure, which reflects a light footprint with mobile elements carrying out mandated activities through regular travel across the country. As a result, in its 2017/18 budget, MINUJUSTH did not propose the establishment of additional posts for the Units. During the audit period, MINUJUSTH assigned and trained United Nations police officers and contingent personnel to provide security at helicopter landing sites, perform the duties of on-board flight monitors and perform MovCon functions at the regional destinations. However, MovCon needed additional United Nations police officers to oversee passenger movement operations and implement additional security and safety measures at the MovCon passenger terminal.

17. Inadequate screening of passengers and cargo exposed Mission personnel to aviation safety risks.

(2) MINUJUSTH should work collaboratively and in an integrated manner with the Police component to assign United Nations police officers and contingent personnel to adequately screen passenger and cargo at the MovCon Passenger terminal.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 2 and stated that it would request the incoming Police Commissioner to assign two United Nations police officers to the Mission Support Division to support operations at the MovCon Passenger Terminal. Recommendation 2 remains open pending receipt of evidence that MINUJUSTH has assigned additional United Nations police officers to improve security and safety measures at the MovCon passenger terminal.

B. Medical evacuations and referrals

Need to enhance the operational capacity of the United Nations clinic

18. The Medical Support Manual for United Nations Peacekeeping Operations has standardized the levels of medical support and specified treatment capability with minimum requirements of manpower and equipment for each level of medical facility. Accordingly, a Level 1 medical unit should provide first line health care, emergency resuscitation, basic field laboratory and ambulance and evacuation set.

19. Level 1 medical care was being provided at the MINUJUSTH clinic in the Log Base in Port-au-Prince. Site visits at the clinic indicated serious shortcomings which prevented the clinic from becoming fully operational. For example, the clinic was not operating on a 24-hour basis. It was only open during

regular working hours from 7:30 am to 4:30 pm. The Mission did not provide emergency medical services after hours and the clinic was also closed during weekends and holidays. Furthermore, the medical laboratory was not functional, so the clinic was not able to perform microscopic and bacteriological tests of human blood, tissue or fluids for diagnosis purposes. The site visits also indicated that the Mission inherited equipment and medical supplies from the former United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH) Level 2 hospital; however, these items were not being utilized and were kept in containers pending a physical verification to identify the required equipment and supplies that can be issued to the clinic.

20. The above occurred because the clinic was not staffed to the required level. At the time of the audit, it only had one medical doctor at the P-3 level who was also performing administrative tasks. Moreover, key positions of the Medical Service Unit had been vacant during most of the audit period, including the posts of Chief Medical Officer and Laboratory Technician. The Mission had deployed an aero-medical evacuation team (AMET) at a cost of \$423,969 to conduct medical evacuation using the commercial helicopters contracted by the Mission; however, there were not enough medical evacuation cases (one or two per month) to justify the presence of an AMET team. Also, the contract did not provide for the AMET team to work within the clinic, so the team remained on stand-by for most of the time. MINUJUSTH indicated that it discontinued the contract for aero-medical evacuation services in July 2018.

21. Inadequate staffing and equipment at the United Nations clinic may lead to ineffective delivery of medical services and the Mission not being able to respond effectively to a medical emergency. As at 30 June 2018, the clinic had made 120 referrals to local medical facilities.

(3) MINUJUSTH should enhance the operational capacity of the United Nations clinic in Port-au-Prince by increasing the staffing capacity of the clinic to enable it to provide more effective medical services to United Nations personnel.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 3 and stated that it had increased medical staffing at the clinic from 8 to 13; commenced a 24-hour service, except on weekends and holidays when on-call doctors and nurses will provide coverage; and initiated action to recruit an additional doctor. Recommendation 3 remains open pending the recruitment of the additional doctor.

Need to provide feedback on the implementation of recommendations of the technical assessment mission

22. The Medical Support Manual requires the Medical Services Division at United Nations Headquarters to carry out periodic technical assessment missions to monitor and evaluate the Mission's medical services and facilities.

23. The Medical Services Division conducted an assessment mission of the medical facilities in Haiti in April 2017 and issued seven recommendations, six of which were still pending at the time of the audit. MINUJUSTH still had to establish: a joint medical service with the United Nations Country Team (UNCT) along with a cost sharing mechanism; memoranda of understanding (MOU) with three Level 2 medical facilities to treat medical and surgical conditions that do not require transport out of the country; and a service agreement with an air ambulance to fly critically ill or injured patients to emergency medical care providers throughout the country. The Mission had an agreement with a recommended Level 2 hospital; however, it is located between two to three hours from the Mission's headquarters depending on the road traffic making patient transportation not convenient.

24. MINUJUSTH indicated that one of the recommended Level 2 medical facilities was not interested in a contractual agreement due to the limited number of potential clients from the Mission. However, it could not provide any correspondence or other evidence showing its attempt to establish a contractual

agreement with the medical facility. MINUJUSTH also indicated that the other recommended medical facility had very limited services to provide, although the assessment report had stated that it was a trauma hospital with a humanitarian mandate that could be used for the purposes of resuscitation and stabilization of patients until referral to a Level 3 hospital. MINUJUSTH advised that it decided not to enter into a service agreement with an air ambulance to fly critically ill or injured patients to emergency medical care providers throughout the country; instead, it had put on standby one of the two Mission-contracted helicopters for medical evacuation purposes even though they could not fly at night. Moreover, MINUJUSTH had not provided a detailed cost benefit analysis to justify that this arrangement is in the best interest of the Organization.

25. MINUJUSTH also indicated that an MOU exists with the UNCT for the use of the clinic on a cost recovery basis. In fact, it was referring to an MOU signed in 2016 by the UNCT and the former peacekeeping mission (MINUSTAH) and the purpose of this MOU was not to establish a joint medical service with the budget from both the Mission and the UNCT as recommended by the assessment team.

26. As a result, medical risks were not properly addressed. For example, a review of medical records indicated that at least three out of seven medical evacuations to the Level 3 hospital in Santo Domingo were not justified since the patients could have received the required treatment within the country had proper arrangements been in place with the recommended Level 2 hospitals. Due to the absence of a joint medical facility with UNCT, MINUJUSTH had not complied with the Secretary-General's vision for "one United Nations" resulting in duplication of efforts and waste of resources.

(4) MINUJUSTH should provide feedback to the Medical Services Division at United Nations Headquarters on the status of implementation of recommendations of the 2017 technical assessment mission to review appropriateness of actions taken by the Mission to address identified medical risks.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 4 and stated that most of the recommendations had been implemented and it was awaiting responses from hospitals to complete the task. Recommendation 4 remains open pending receipt of evidence that MINUJUSTH has reviewed and agreed with the Medical Services Division, the appropriateness of actions taken to implement recommendations from the 2017 technical assessment mission.

C. Storage and supply of fuel and rations

Local and strategic fuel reserves were available in the quantities stipulated in the contract

27. The DPKO/DFS Fuel Operations Manual and MINUJUSTH fuel standard operating procedures require the Fuel Unit to develop a contingency plan. The fuel contract also requires the vendor to maintain an agreed level of strategic and local reserves.

28. MINUJUSTH had developed a contingency plan for ground and aviation fuel which identified a primary and an alternate source of fuel relying both on local procurement and neighboring countries to source its fuel requirements. Upon its establishment and following the departure of MINUSTAH troops, MINUJUSTH also conducted an analysis of its fuel requirements, and on 16 February 2018, it requested the Procurement Division to amend the fuel contract to reduce: (i) strategic diesel reserve to 591,500 litres and strategic Jet A-1 reserve to 73,000 litres in Port-au-Prince; (ii) local diesel reserve to 12,000 litres in Jeremie; and (iii) local diesel reserve to 10,000 litres and local jet A-1 reserve to 5,000 litres in Cap Haitian. With these reductions, it was anticipated that the Mission would consume the excess fuel reserves and realize cost savings. OIOS physical verification of fuel reserves in Port-au-Prince indicated that the level

of strategic and local reserves was at the required level and MINUJUSTH conducted periodic physical checks of fuel balances as required by its procedures. Therefore, OIOS concluded that MINUJUSTH has implemented adequate procedures over the monitoring of strategic and local fuel reserves.

Need to effectively monitor fuel consumption and car log data to achieve optimal fleet utilization

29. The DPKO/DFS Fuel Operations Manual requires the Life Support Unit: (i) to maintain a list of vehicles and equipment that can draw fuel; (ii) obtain fuel consumption reports from self-accounting units; and (iii) monitor fuel consumption using the information from the electronic fuel management system (eFMS) and fuel consumption reports from contingent logistics officers.

30. A review of the Life Support Unit's records indicated that the Mission maintained an up-to-date list of MINUJUSTH vehicles and equipment that can draw fuel from the distribution points. Records maintained by the Unit as of June 2018 showed that MINUJUSTH had 457 United Nations-owned and 394 contingent-owned vehicles and equipment. The Mission implemented eFMS to compile fuel consumption data and the Life Support Unit provided eFMS training to contingents and fuel consuming sections. These entities were required to submit daily returns to the Life Support Unit through the eFMS system.

31. A review of eFMS indicated that the contingents provided: (i) beginning and ending fuel balances and the quantities issued to vehicles and generators; (ii) odometer readings of equipment and vehicles in all cases; and (iii) generator barcodes or serial number. The Life Support Unit monitored fuel consumption and analyzed information from eFMS to detect unusual consumption patterns and was conducting a further review and investigation for three cases. However, a review of car log data of 22 out of 62 police vehicles based in Port-au-Prince with an average fuel consumption of less than 100 litres (26 gallons) per month indicated that these vehicles were only operational for less than an hour on average per day (mostly during peak periods) from the period from 1 April to 30 June 2018. Records maintained by the Police component indicated that the 22 police vehicles were mostly utilized for commuting purposes by individual police officers performing administrative or advisory functions. This diverted vehicles from being used to carry out mandated activities. In a memorandum addressed to the Chief of Mission Support dated 15 November 2017, the Police Commissioner indicated that the Police component was facing a shortage of vehicles to carry out its duties and requested 23 additional vehicles under a general ratio of two officers per vehicle.

32. The above occurred because MINUJUSTH did not: (i) effectively monitor vehicle usage by scrutinizing fuel consumption, kilometre readings and car log data to ensure optimal utilization of vehicles; and (ii) make pooled dispatch vehicles available to individual police officers for commuting purposes.

(5) MINUJUSTH should implement measures to ensure more efficient use of its vehicle fleet, including: (i) scrutinizing fuel consumption, kilometre readings and car log data to ensure the optimal utilization of vehicles; and (ii) making pooled dispatch vehicles available to individual police officers for commuting purposes.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 5 and stated that it had: (i) started monitoring vehicle usage and fuel consumption for vehicles with high consumption rates; (ii) engaged a contractor to monitor vehicle and fuel usage; and (iii) issued a mini-bus to the Police component and was refurbishing a medium-sized bus to be allocated to individual police officers for commuting purposes. Recommendation 5 remains open pending receipt of the first report on the monitoring of vehicle usage and fuel consumption for vehicles with high consumption rates and evidence that buses had been issued to the Police component.

Need for appropriate action to dispose of surplus food rations and verify the contractor's disposal of damaged and expired rations

33. The rations contract and MINUJUSTH rations standard operating procedures require the Life Support Unit to ensure that the rations contractor maintains no less than 28-day supply of operational stock and 28-day supply of strategic reserves of dry, canned, chilled and frozen food rations for the number of troops deployed. The rations contract also requires the contractor to dispose of damaged and expired rations in accordance with the local environmental laws and regulations. MINUJUSTH is required to be represented to witness and verify in writing all disposal actions.

34. A review of 10 out of 33 weekly stock reports indicated that the contractor had the required levels of operational stock and strategic reserves. MINUJUSTH also implemented adequate procedures such as spot checks to verify the quantities of available rations. However, interviews with key Life Support personnel and an analysis of inventory reports indicated that the contractor maintained significant stocks of food items expiring during 2018 with no future demand. These included 3.5 tons of frozen chicken breast; 1.9 ton of dairy yogurt; 1.9 ton of yerba mate tea; 1.8 ton of pork products; 1.3 ton of pineapples; and 1.2 ton of Japonica rice. The surplus food items resulted from orders that were made for repatriated MINUSTAH troops which were not part of the menu of the current contingents. The high quantities were mainly due to the contractor's internal practice of maintaining a 60-day buffer stock in addition to the strategic reserve and operational stock. Life Support personnel advised that the contractor had transferred some surplus food items to other peacekeeping missions where it had operations following a cost-benefit analysis. However, some low-cost products specifically designed for Latin American troops were not transferred due to the high freight cost and the non-availability of potential consumers at the destination.

35. Additionally, a review of two disposal actions and related certificates indicated that MINUJUSTH did not observe actual disposals by the contractor and its subcontractors to confirm that they were conducted in accordance with established standards and local regulations. Rather, MINUJUSTH relied on assurances and certificates from the disposal contractor.

36. The above occurred because MINUJUSTH had not: (i) developed an action plan in coordination with the contractor to dispose of surplus food items; and (ii) established adequate procedures, including controls and oversight on the disposal of damaged and expired rations.

(6) MINUJUSTH should develop an action plan in coordination with the contractor to dispose of surplus food rations.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 6 and stated that the contractor had reduced the surplus food rations by coordinating with contingent commanders to consume some of them, disposing those close to their expiry date or for which there was no demand, and shipping others to peacekeeping mission in Mali. Recommendation 6 remains open pending receipt of evidence of the disposal of surplus food rations.

(7) MINUJUSTH should implement adequate procedures such as spot checks to verify the appropriateness of the disposal of damaged and expired rations by the contractor and its subcontractors.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 7 and stated that the contractor regularly invites the Mission to attend the food disposal sessions, but the Rations Unit did not sign the disposal certificate. MINUJUSTH had implemented a number of measures to reinforce the control mechanism over the appropriate disposal of products. Recommendation 7 remains open pending receipt of evidence of implementation of these measures.

Invoices were not paid in a timely manner

37. The rations and fuel contracts entitled MINUJUSTH to a 3 per cent and a 0.5 per cent payment discount respectively, on all payments made within 30 days from receipt of invoice and supporting documentation.

38. A review of payments to the contractor from 16 October 2017 to 31 May 2018 for fuel and rations invoices totalling \$7.2 million indicated that invoices were appropriately verified and certified by designated finance and Life Support officers for accuracy and completeness of supporting documents and payments processed accordingly. However, MINUJUSTH did not make all payments within the 30-day period and lost prompt payment discounts totalling \$52,311. This occurred because the Budget and Finance Unit did not allocate funds to each of the various cost centers to allow self-accounting units to monitor the funds budgeted for their respective operations. Instead, the distribution of allotments was maintained at the class level in Umoja. Moreover, MINUJUSTH had not developed standard operating procedures with invoice processing timelines, and an invoice tracking mechanism to ensure that invoices were processed within 30 days.

39. Subsequent to the audit, MINUJUSTH distributed the allotment for the 2018/19 financial year to the various cost centers in Umoja. In May 2018, MINUJUSTH also developed standard operating procedures with invoice processing timelines; however, it had not been implemented. As a result, during June and July 2018, MINUJUSTH lost prompt payment discounts totalling \$18,673.

(8) MINUJUSTH should implement its standard operating procedures for invoice processing to ensure invoices are paid expeditiously to take advantage of prompt payment discounts.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 8 and stated that following the promulgation of standard operating procedures on invoice processing and introduction of an invoice tracking sheet, it would arrange a follow-up meeting to review and improve overall processing. Recommendation 8 remains open pending the implementation of actions to improve payment of invoices and to take advantage of prompt payment discounts.

D. Operations and maintenance of facilities and equipment

Need to develop a strategy to complete repair and maintenance works at Mission camps

40. The DPKO/DFS Engineering Support Manual and the MINUJUSTH standard operating procedures on repair and maintenance of facilities require the Engineering and Facilities Management Unit to: (i) operate and maintain water facilities and conduct regular chemical and bacteriological testing of water at all production and dispensing points in line with World Health Organization standards; and (ii) complete all engineering-related repair and maintenance requests in a timely manner.

41. Discussions with the Water and Sanitation personnel and a review of maintenance records of all 15 water distribution plants indicated that the Engineering and Facilities Management Unit had put in place adequate operational procedures for drinking water. However, a review of the e-Request system used to track and manage repair and maintenance for facilities showed that the Engineering and Facilities Management Unit had not:

- Completed 75 (or 11 per cent) of the 654 repair and maintenance requests relating to leaking roof, inoperable toilets and electrical and air conditioning problems that were made during the audit period, including 64 requests that had remained open for more than two months; and

- Renovated all 15 water wells including: (i) removing sand and other sediments and objects that had fallen into the borehole; and (ii) replacing and repairing water raising devices (pumps) and their spare parts.

42. The above occurred because MINUJUSTH inherited from MINUSTAH prefabricated buildings and equipment that had exceeded their useful life. Moreover, at the inception of the Mission and given its limited staffing resources, MINUJUSTH did not: (i) assess the requirements for renovation of camps and offices; and (ii) develop a strategy to complete the required works.

43. Because of the above, MINUJUSTH was unable to deliver repair and maintenance services for facilities, water and sanitation effectively and in a timely manner, thus negatively impacting on the living and working conditions of Mission personnel. The staff were also exposed to health and hygiene risks as the water was used for washing utensils and sanitation.

(9) MINUJUSTH should assess the requirements for the renovation of camps and offices and develop a strategy to complete the required works.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 9 and stated that at their latest meeting, the Police component had expressed its appreciation of MINUJUSTH support activities as there were no outstanding critical issues related to camp management. In addition, MINUJUSTH had developed or was developing various plans for regular maintenance works and camp closures. Recommendation 9 remains open pending receipt of these plans.

Need for proper arrangements to repair and maintain vehicles in a timely manner

44. The DPKO/DFS Surface Transport Manuel requires MINUJUSTH Transport Unit to develop a vehicle maintenance plan and perform routine vehicle maintenance in accordance with the manufacturers' requirements.

45. MINUJUSTH had a vehicle maintenance plan that required each vehicle to undergo scheduled maintenance every 5,000 kilometres. A review of maintenance records of all 114 police vehicles indicated that the Transport Unit was performing routine maintenance on vehicles in accordance with the maintenance plan. However, a review of 31 of the vehicle repairs done during the audit period indicated that it took an average of 15 days to complete service maintenance and an average of 33 days to complete other repairs. The maintenance contractors could not achieve a faster turnaround time because they did not have sufficient capacity to repair and maintain the Mission's 291 vehicles. Also, the Mission placed heavy reliance on outsourced contracts to provide all maintenance and repairs services even though it could enhance its in-house capacity to perform service maintenance and minor repairs using the facility and equipment inherited from MINUSTAH. Furthermore, the Mission had not established mobile teams to travel to the regions to complete the maintenance of vehicles using the facilities of the contingents. Due to ageing fleet and a lack of workshop facilities in the regions, United Nations police officers were often required to travel to Port-au-Prince for repairs.

46. The delays in repair services resulted in 114 police vehicles being off the road for an average of 62 days at the end of fiscal year 2017/18.

(10) MINUJUSTH should enhance its in-house capacity to perform service maintenance and minor repair work on vehicles using the facility and equipment inherited from MINUSTAH and only utilize outsourced contracts for major repairs.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 10 and stated that it had engaged mechanics including a field service team to repair vehicles in the regions and was constructing the main workshop rubble hall, while temporarily using the small rubble hall within the Log Base. Recommendation 10 remains open pending receipt of evidence of the completion of the main workshop in the Log Base.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

47. OIOS wishes to express its appreciation to the management and staff of MINUJUSTH for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.

(Signed) Eleanor T. Burns
Director, Internal Audit Division
Office of Internal Oversight Services

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
1	MINUJUSTH should revise the Mission Support Plan to ensure that the Mission's aviation requirements are clearly defined in collaboration with the relevant Mission components.	Important	O	Receipt of the revised Aviation Support Plan.	30 November 2018
2	MINUJUSTH should work collaboratively and in an integrated manner with the Police component to assign United Nations police officers and contingent personnel to adequately screen passenger and cargo at the MovCon Passenger terminal.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that MINUJUSTH has assigned additional United Nations police officers to improve security and safety measures at the MovCon passenger terminal.	30 November 2018
3	MINUJUSTH should enhance the operational capacity of the United Nations clinic in Port-au-Prince by increasing the staffing capacity of the clinic to enable it to provide more effective medical services to United Nations personnel.	Important	O	Recruitment of the additional doctor.	31 December 2018
4	MINUJUSTH should provide feedback to the Medical Services Division at United Nations Headquarters on the status of implementation of recommendations of the 2017 technical assessment mission to review appropriateness of actions taken by the Mission to address identified medical risks.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that MINUJUSTH has reviewed and agreed with the Medical Services Division, the appropriateness of actions taken to implement recommendations from the 2017 technical assessment mission.	31 December 2018
5	MINUJUSTH should implement measures to ensure more efficient use of its vehicle fleet, including: (i) scrutinizing fuel consumption, kilometre readings and car log data to ensure the optimal utilization of vehicles; and (ii) making pooled dispatch vehicles	Important	O	Receipt of the first report on the monitoring of vehicle usage and fuel consumption for vehicles with high consumption rates and evidence that buses had been issued to the Police component.	30 November 2018

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

³ C = closed, O = open

⁴ Date provided by MINUJUSTH in response to recommendations.

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical/ Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
	available to individual police officers for commuting purposes.				
6	MINUJUSTH should develop an action plan in coordination with the contractor to dispose of surplus food rations.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of the disposal of surplus food rations.	30 November 2018
7	MINUJUSTH should implement adequate procedures such as spot checks to verify the appropriateness of the disposal of damaged and expired rations by the contractor and its subcontractors.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of implementation of control mechanisms over the appropriate disposal of products.	30 November 2018
8	MINUJUSTH should implement its standard operating procedures for invoice processing to ensure invoices are paid expeditiously to take advantage of prompt payment discounts.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of implementation of actions to improve payment of invoices and to take advantage of prompt payment discounts.	30 November 2018
9	MINUJUSTH should assess the requirements for the renovation of camps and offices and develop a strategy to complete the required works.	Important	O	Receipt of plans related to maintenance works and camp closures.	30 November 2018
10	MINUJUSTH should enhance its in-house capacity to perform service maintenance and minor repair work on vehicles using the facility and equipment inherited from MINUSTAH and only utilize outsourced contracts for major repairs.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of the completion of the main workshop in the Log Base	31 December 2018

APPENDIX I

Management Response

Management Response

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ⁵ / Important ⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
1	MINUJUSTH should revise the Mission Support Plan to ensure that the Mission's aviation requirements are clearly defined in collaboration with the relevant Mission components.	Important	Yes	Chief of Mission Support	Implemented	In coordination with relevant mission components, the flight requirements in support of the mission mandate were integrated into the 17/18 Aviation Support Plan.
2	MINUJUSTH should work collaboratively and in an integrated manner with the Police component to assign United Nations police officers and contingent personnel to adequately screen passenger and cargo at the MovCon Passenger terminal.	Important	Yes	Chief Movcon	30 November 18	In addition to the 2 UNDSS staff who are currently supporting Movcon operations, a request will be submitted to the new incoming PC for 2 UNPOLs to be assigned to MSD in support of operations at the MOVCON Passenger Terminal – one to oversee the passenger movement operations and the second for Security/Safety and Liaison.
3	MINUJUSTH should enhance the operational capacity of the United Nations clinic in Port-au-Prince by increasing the staffing capacity of the clinic to enable it to provide more effective medical services to United Nations personnel.	Important	Yes	Chief Medical officer	31 December 18	Currently, Medical staffing has increased from 8 to 13. Three doctors are already on board (additional 1 doctor is under recruitment processes). As of 1 October 2018, a 24 hours service has commenced except on weekends and holidays when on call doctor and nurse provides coverage.
4	MINUJUSTH should provide feedback to the Medical Services Division at United Nations Headquarters on the	Important	Yes	Chief Medical Officer	31 December 2018	Most of the recommendations are implemented. However, response for Official Memo to hospitals is awaited to complete the task.

⁵ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

⁶ Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

Management Response

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ⁵ / Important ⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
	status of implementation of recommendations of the 2017 technical assessment mission to review appropriateness of actions taken by the Mission to address identified medical risks.					
5	MINUJUSTH should implement measures to ensure more efficient use of its vehicle fleet, including: (i) scrutinizing fuel consumption, kilometre readings and car log data to ensure the optimal utilization of vehicles; and (ii) making pooled dispatch vehicles available to individual police officers for commuting purposes.	Important	Yes	Chief Transport officer	Implemented	MINUJUSTH started monitoring vehicle usage and fuel consumption analysis for vehicles with high consumption. A copy of April analysis is attached and a carlog expert has also been engaged through Trygin contract to monitor vehicle and fuel usage of the MINUJUSTH fleet through carlog monthly reporting beginning September 18 onwards. MINUJUSTH issued a mini-bus to UNPOL and is in the process of refurbishing a Medium bus for allocation to the Police in addition to the currently allocated mini-bus for commuting purposes.
6	MINUJUSTH should develop an action plan in coordination with the contractor to dispose of surplus food rations.	Important	Yes	Chief Rations Unit	Implemented	In accordance with the Ecolog rations contract PD/C0107/14 the mission monitors the level and quality of UN food reserve and the (28) days operational stock that are periodically reviewed during the preparation of Bulk Orders and Final Food Orders submitted to the contractor before the feeding cycle. However, during MINUSTAH, as part of its internal business continuity plan and beyond any contractual obligations, Ecolog took the initiative to procure additional sixty (60) days of food rations to serve as buffer stock in case of supply chain interruption. Months before the closure of MINUSTAH as the situation was evolving, Ecolog was kept abreast of the mission draw down plan, to allow them to better

Management Response

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ⁵ / Important ⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments								
						<p>manage the existing stock and limit new purchase of food rations that could not be consumed by departing Military and FPU contingents.</p> <p>Despite the contractor’s full responsibility over the excess buffer stock procured out of the contractual agreement, the issue was brought to Rations Unit attention during several meetings. In the attempt to limit the potential loss of food, several solutions are being implemented:</p> <p><u>1. Utilization of the excess food for the Ecolog Bistro contract, the Cafeteria in Log Base.</u></p> <p><u>2. Life Support informally requested FPU Commanders</u> -and within their religious/cultural habits- to look into the possibility to adjust their food orders to accommodate the excess food to be absorbed (attachment 1). A meeting took place on 27 September with FPUs Logistics Officers and their contingent commanders to assess possible integration of some food line items into the future requisition. It was then agreed to visit the Ecolog Warehouse to show the excess items.</p> <p>The following major line items will be proposed for discussion</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="1339 1219 1841 1365"> <thead> <tr> <th>CODE</th> <th>DESCRIPTION</th> <th>Excess Qty (Kgs)</th> <th>Action/ Proposal</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1116</td> <td>BEEF RUMP BONELESS FROZEN</td> <td>412.40</td> <td>Proposed to FPU for Substitution</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	CODE	DESCRIPTION	Excess Qty (Kgs)	Action/ Proposal	1116	BEEF RUMP BONELESS FROZEN	412.40	Proposed to FPU for Substitution
CODE	DESCRIPTION	Excess Qty (Kgs)	Action/ Proposal											
1116	BEEF RUMP BONELESS FROZEN	412.40	Proposed to FPU for Substitution											

Management Response

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ⁵ / Important ⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments				
						1119	BEEF STRIPLOIN BONELESS FROZEN	2,483.30	Proposed to FPU for Substitution	<p>3. Out of 83 tones that was excess in October 2017, 6.5 tones were absorbed by the Mission through food substitution proposed to FPU, 2.4 tones were utilized in Ecolog Cafeteria, 450 Kilograms were utilized by Ecolog staff, 32 tones were disposed-of as a result of non-compliance (near expiry date, non-demand) and 20</p>
						1123	BEEF STEWING BONELESS FROZEN	492.30	Proposed to FPU for Substitution	
						1128	CHICKEN BREAST BONELESS FROZEN	1,132.10	Proposed to FPU for Substitution	
						1150	DAIRY ICE CREAM STRAWBERRY	448.00	Proposed to FPU for Substitution	
						1155	DAIRY MILK EVAPORATED WITHOUT SUGAR	380.00	Proposed to FPU for Substitution	
						1178	FISH POLLOCK FILLET FROZEN	292.20	Proposed to FPU for Substitution	
						2102	BISCUITS SODA CRACKERS	458.40	Proposed to FPU for Substitution	
						2136	COFFEE INSTANT	323.20	Proposed to FPU for Substitution	
						2164	RICE LONG GRAIN WHITE	450.00	Proposed to FPU for Substitution	

Management Response

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ⁵ / Important ⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
						tones are still available as of 25 September 2018. Ecolog later on informed that they took the initiative to ship 21.7 tons of food to the UN Mali Mission, where they have a contract (Ecolog has been requested to provide evidence of the shipment and related formalities).
7	MINUJUSTH should implement adequate procedures such as spot checks to verify the appropriateness of the disposal of damaged and expired rations by the contractor and its subcontractors.	Important	Yes	Chief Rations Unit	Implemented	<p>In compliance with its contractual obligations, Ecolog regularly invites Rations Unit to attend the food disposal sessions, consisting of crashing with compressor truck of the expired/non-compliant food products and final disposal at a government provided site. This activity is performed by Ecolog's disposal sub-contractor (attachments 2)</p> <p>However, Rations Unit does not sign on disposal certificate which is signed by Ecolog Quality Control Staff and disposal sub-contractor.</p> <p>In order to reinforce the control mechanism on the appropriate disposal of products, the following measures have been added for immediate implementation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Rations Unit to sign on disposal attendance records (reference Attachment 3- <u>21 September 2018 Disposal Documentation</u>) - Site visit of disposal site to ensure that all proper procedures are followed during final disposal (reference Attachment 4- <u>Monthly Ration Program October 2018</u>)

Management Response

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ⁵ / Important ⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments																																	
						<p>Ascertain compliance of disposal method to the Food Safety Management System guidelines</p> <p>Below is a summary of the excess stock.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Category</th> <th>Qty (Kgs)</th> <th>Qty (kgs)</th> <th>Remarks</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Excess Stock as at Oct 2017</td> <td>83,200</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td rowspan="4">Excess Stock Qty Distributed/ Used/ Consumed</td> <td></td> <td>21,700</td> <td>Send to Other mission</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>6,500</td> <td>Substitution and Amendments</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>2,400</td> <td>Utilized in Cafeteria</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>450</td> <td>Consumed in staff Kitchen</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total Distributed/ Used/ Consumed</td> <td></td> <td>31,050</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Disposed of (Total lost)</td> <td></td> <td>32,150</td> <td>Expired/ non-compliance</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Excess Stock Balance at 25 September 2018</td> <td>20,000</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Category	Qty (Kgs)	Qty (kgs)	Remarks	Excess Stock as at Oct 2017	83,200			Excess Stock Qty Distributed/ Used/ Consumed		21,700	Send to Other mission		6,500	Substitution and Amendments		2,400	Utilized in Cafeteria		450	Consumed in staff Kitchen	Total Distributed/ Used/ Consumed		31,050		Disposed of (Total lost)		32,150	Expired/ non-compliance	Excess Stock Balance at 25 September 2018	20,000		
Category	Qty (Kgs)	Qty (kgs)	Remarks																																				
Excess Stock as at Oct 2017	83,200																																						
Excess Stock Qty Distributed/ Used/ Consumed		21,700	Send to Other mission																																				
		6,500	Substitution and Amendments																																				
		2,400	Utilized in Cafeteria																																				
		450	Consumed in staff Kitchen																																				
Total Distributed/ Used/ Consumed		31,050																																					
Disposed of (Total lost)		32,150	Expired/ non-compliance																																				
Excess Stock Balance at 25 September 2018	20,000																																						

Management Response

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ⁵ / Important ⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
						The remaining excess stock totaling to 20 tones, will be proposed as substitution to FPU, considering that those items are very similar to the ones originally requested (i.e Beef Striploin substituting Goat meat or whole chicken replaced by chicken breast).
8	MINUJUSTH should implement its standard operating procedures for invoice processing to ensure invoices are paid expeditiously to take advantage of prompt payment discounts.	Important	Yes	Chief Finance & Budget officer Chief Contract Compliance and Monitoring Unit Chief Acquisition Management Chief Procurement Officer	24 th July 2018	<p>Mission Support takes note of this recommendation and wishes to state that an SOP for invoice processing was put in place since 24.05.2018.</p> <p>A broadcast was issued by office of CMS on 24.05.2018 informing all sections of the SOP and that all invoices should be sent to Finance section which would pass to CCMU for tracking and processing.</p> <p>A meeting was set up for all section chief with a copy of the SOP provided and information provided of the process.</p> <p>Invoice tracking sheet developed and implemented on the 1st July 2018 to monitor and track the invoice through CCMU. The tracking sheet now captures the PPD for the invoices that have the clause in their contract.</p> <p>A follow up meeting is arranged for this week with Finance Section to review the process and to make improvement to the overall processing</p>
9	MINUJUSTH should assess the requirements for the renovation of camps and offices and	Important	Yes	Chief Engineer	Implemented & Ongoing	- EFMU has started this process since the last week of February 2018.

Management Response

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ⁵ / Important ⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
	develop a strategy to complete the required works.					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Copies of action plan matrix and tracking/monitoring sheets were also shared with Resident Audit Office. - Copy of EFMU's strategic approach plan (attached) on this as agreed by different EFMU sub-units has also been shared with Resident Audit Office. - On our support activities for the Police and FPUs - as of last week of September 2018, the Police Component expressed their appreciation as they claimed that there were no more critical issues related to this. - On the camps consolidation, detailed action plan is included in the Camp Closure/Consolidation Plan dated 25 June 2018 and the Mission's Project Management Group, and now substantially complete. <p>We are now heading into the next phase – (1) Regular maintenance works (in case of UNPOL and FPUs, we have already shared with them target dates for the month of October 2018). (2) For LogBase, the Master Development Plan is now being updated and (3) for the closures of other camps (FPUs and Delta) plans are already being developed, including the final liquidation process for the entire Mission.</p>
10	MINUJUSTH should enhance its in-house capacity to perform service maintenance and minor repair work on vehicles using the facility and equipment inherited from MINUSTAH	Important	Yes	Chief Transport Officer	31 December 18	MINUJUSTH is currently constructing the Main Workshop rub-hall while temporarily using the small PDU rub-hall in area 5 within Logbase. MINUJUSTH has also engaged Mechanics through UNOPS including a Field service team for the repair of UNPOL vehicles in Regional co-locations. (Pictures of PDU rub-hall and Main workshop rub-hall attached).

Management Response

Audit of logistics arrangements for supporting mandate implementation in the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ⁵ / Important ⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
	and only utilize outsourced contracts for major repairs.					