



INTERNAL AUDIT DIVISION

REPORT 2019/087

Audit of capacity-building of the Haitian National Police by the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

**The Mission needed to develop a
comprehensive transition strategy and action
plan and assess the effectiveness of the
capacity-building programme**

**30 September 2019
Assignment No. AP2019/685/05**

Audit of capacity-building of the Haitian National Police by the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of the capacity-building of the Haitian National Police (HNP) by the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti (MINUJUSTH). The objective of the audit was to assess the effectiveness of the design and implementation of the MINUJUSTH capacity-building programme to support and develop the HNP. The audit covered the period from 16 October 2017 to 31 May 2019 and included strategy and design of the HNP capacity-building programme; coordination; and implementation and monitoring of HNP capacity-building activities.

MINUJUSTH, within certain funding constraints, was providing support to the Government to build the operational and institutional capacity of HNP in several policing areas. MINUJUSTH also established adequate internal coordination mechanisms for police capacity-building activities. With its upcoming closure, the Mission needed to develop a comprehensive transition strategy and action plan and assess the effectiveness of the capacity-building programme.

OIOS made two recommendations. To address issues identified in the audit, MINUJUSTH needed to:

- Develop, in coordination with the United Nations Country Team and HNP, a comprehensive transition strategy and action plan for the capacity development of the HNP in support of the HNP Strategic Development Plan 2017-2021; and
- Conduct an independent assessment of the effectiveness of its capacity-building programme and identify best practices and lessons learnt to better inform the design and implementation of any future police capacity-building programme in Haiti.

MINUJUSTH accepted the recommendations and has initiated action to implement them.

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	1-2
III. AUDIT RESULTS	2-5
A. Strategy and design of the capacity-building programme	2-3
B. Coordination of the capacity-building programme	3
C. Implementation and monitoring of capacity-building activities	3-5
IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	5
ANNEX I Status of audit recommendations	
APPENDIX I Management response	

Audit of capacity-building of the Haitian National Police by the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

I. BACKGROUND

1. The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of the capacity-building programme of the Haitian National Police (HNP) by the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti (MINUJUSTH).

2. Security Council resolution 2350 (2017) establishing MINUJUSTH mandated it to further support and develop the HNP. To implement this mandate, the Police Component of the Mission focused on activities in support of the implementation of the HNP Strategic Development Plan (SDP) for 2017-2021 through a Mentorship and Advisory Programme (MAP). Areas of focus included: (a) police administration and command and control; (b) technical and specialized management and criminal investigation skills; (c) strengthening of accountability mechanism of the HNP, including its General Inspectorate; (d) strategic planning; (e) support for gender mainstreaming within HNP; and (f) sexual and gender-based violence prevention programmes.

3. The MINUJUSTH Police Component is headed by a Police Commissioner at the D-2 level who reports to the Special Representative of the Secretary-General. The Police Commissioner is assisted by a Deputy Police Commissioner and Chiefs of Operations, Support and Capacity-building Pillars. The Capacity-building Pillar is composed of four sections namely: Strategic Planning, Technical Services, Judicial Police, and Administration and General Services. The Capacity-building Pillar is led by a Senior Police Adviser at P-5 level and supported by nine international staff posts and 82 individual police officers (IPOs). In close coordination with the HNP, these personnel have been responsible for supporting the key priorities of the HNP SDP, primarily on the institutional development of the HNP through technical support and the MAP.

4. MINUJUSTH did not have any non-post budget allocation for police capacity-building except for the overall allocation of \$1.5 million under quick impact projects and joint rule of law activities implemented under a memorandum of understanding with the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). The Police Component also coordinated with the United Nations Country Team (UNCT) and other partners (bilateral donors) in pooling additional resources to implement the capacity-building programme, as provided for in the financing plan of the SDP.

5. Comments provided by MINUJUSTH are incorporated in italics.

II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

6. The objective of the audit was to assess the effectiveness of the design and implementation of the MINUJUSTH capacity-building programme to support and develop the HNP.

7. This audit was included in the 2018 risk-based work plan of OIOS due to the reputational, financial and operational risks resulting from the failure to effectively accomplish the capacity-building mandate.

8. OIOS conducted this audit from April to July 2019. The audit covered the period from 16 October 2017 to 30 May 2019. Based on an activity-level risk assessment, the audit covered higher and medium risk areas in the capacity-building programme of the HNP, which included: (i) strategy and design of HNP capacity-building programme; (ii) coordination; and (iii) implementation and monitoring of HNP capacity-building activities.

9. The audit methodology included: (a) interviews of key personnel, (b) reviews of relevant documentation, (c) analytical reviews of data, (d) sample testing of weekly activity reports using a random sampling approach, and (e) visits to HNP training facilities and infrastructure that are supported by the Mission.

10. The audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing.

III. AUDIT RESULTS

A. Strategy and design of the capacity-building programme

Need for a comprehensive transition strategy and implementation plan to support capacity-building of the HNP

11. The Government of Haiti developed a five-year (2017-2021) police SDP approved by the Prime Minister on 5 July 2017 in his capacity as President of the Superior Council of the National Police. The SDP contained 25 activities comprising 133 priority actions to strengthen the capacity of the HNP. In line with its mandate and concept of operations, the MINUJUSTH Police Component was required to support the implementation of this plan regarding capacity-building.

12. The Police Component developed a strategy in July 2017, immediately after the adoption of the SDP, for implementing the MAP to support and develop the capacity of the HNP. This strategy took into account the reduction in the authorized strength of IPOs from 951 to 295 and the transition from the previous Mission to MINUJUSTH. The Police Component, jointly with the HNP, implemented the strategy in a phased manner, following a co-location mentorship approach. As per this approach 205 IPOs worked directly with 150 middle to upper cadres of the HNP at 20 co-location sites, to coach, mentor and provide technical advice to the HNP, when required. The Police Component established an organization structure to mirror that of the HNP. This enabled the Police Component to enhance the capacity of the individual HNP officers they were paired with and to strengthen and develop their capacity in several policing areas. However, lack of qualified IPOs and inadequate logistical support to ensure the proper functioning of the co-location sites delayed the full implementation of the MAP.

13. In July 2018, the Police Component jointly with the HNP conducted an evaluation of the MAP that led to structural and functional readjustment of the mentoring structures, wherein 219 IPOs worked directly with an increased number of 171 counterparts in the HNP. As this transition was ongoing, in February 2019 the Police Component once again revised its approach and shifted its focus from mentoring individual officers to strengthening the institutional capacity of HNP to lead its own mentorship programme, with limited presence of co-located IPOs. However, the Police Component faced challenges in articulating the transition strategy and action plan with relevant indicators and the detailed activities required to achieve the overall objectives of the revised mentorship approach. The revised approach could not be fully implemented in all the departments of the HNP due to a lack of: i) formal agreement on the revised approach with the leadership of HNP; ii) adequate time to implement the approach; and iii) clarity on the concept amongst some capacity-building sections of the Police Component. Furthermore, due of the planned closure of MINUJUSTH on 15 October 2019, the Police Component progressively ceased its capacity-building activities in June 2019 and continued to withdraw the co-located IPOs.

14. At the time of the audit, the Mission was assessing the areas that would require continued support after the end of its mandate on 15 October 2019, since neither the follow-on United Nations special political mission, the United Nations Integrated Office in Haiti (BINUH), nor the UNCT will have the capability to provide operational support to the HNP. UNCT had expressed interest in taking on new responsibilities in areas such as transfer of management competencies, maintenance and rehabilitation of some police infrastructures, enhancing the capacity of personnel in gender-based violence units within police stations, building and equipping border police stations and monitoring the implementation of sanctions against police officers (police oversight). The development of a well-defined transition strategy and action plan with relevant indicators, before the end of MINUJUSTH's mandate, along with a funding arrangement would enhance the coordination mechanism with the UNCT and BINUH.

(1) MINUJUSTH should, in coordination with the United Nations Country Team and the Haitian National Police (HNP), develop a comprehensive transition strategy and action plan that includes definable and measurable goals and performance indicators for the capacity development of the HNP in support of the HNP Strategic Development Plan 2017-2021.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 1 and stated that as part of the planning process to set up BINUH, efforts were ongoing, in close coordination with the HNP and UNCT, to develop a set of commonly shared goals and objectives for the United Nations' future support to the HNP. Recommendation 1 remains open pending receipt of the finalized police capacity-building transition strategy and action plan.

B. Coordination of the capacity-building programme

Mechanisms were in place to coordinate police capacity-building activities within the Mission

15. The MINUJUSTH Police Component coordinated with the various substantive sections such as Human Rights, Political Affairs and Rule of Law, Gender and Community Violence Reduction on the capacity-building initiatives and received their inputs and assistance. For example, the MINUJUSTH Police Component: i) liaised periodically with the Human Rights Section to ensure human rights principles were adequately considered in providing training and technical support to the HNP; ii) sent HNP capacity-building project proposals for training, construction of infrastructure and provision of equipment to the Mission Project Review Committee for their review and approval; iii) implemented joint rule of law activities involving all the Mission components and UNDP and iv) effectively utilized a forum at which common issues were discussed and feedback on the capacity-building initiatives was received from the various sections of the Mission.

16. OIOS concluded that MINUJUSTH has established adequate internal coordination mechanisms to conduct police capacity-building activities with the assistance of the substantive component of the Mission.

C. Implementation and monitoring of capacity-building activities

Need to assess the effectiveness of the capacity-building programme

17. In line with its Concept of Operations, the MINUJUSTH Police Component conducted training activities for HNP personnel (2,464 cadets including 476 women and 141 officers including 4 women) and implemented 33 projects valued at \$1.5 million, including the construction and renovation of HNP offices in 29 locations. The MINUJUSTH Police Component assisted HNP officers in implementing recruitment

policies and procedures to reach the targeted staffing level and supported the Police School training instructors to standardize and organize materials. Ten per cent of HNP was composed of women (against a target of 12 per cent by 2021), while women formed 36 per cent of its civilian workforce. The implementation of MAP enhanced the capacity of the individual HNP officers, which contributed to the development of HNP capacity in several policing areas such as leadership, command and control, strategic planning, accountability, internal oversight mechanisms and protection of human rights. The Police Component also prepared monitoring reports for various capacity-building activities, which were being produced weekly, monthly, quarterly and bi-annually.

18. A review of the co-location deployment table, HNP organizational structure, and 30 out of 84 weekly activity reports of the Police Component, as well as discussions with the officers indicated that the MINUJUSTH Police Component prioritized development activities with its limited resources to ensure adequate coverage of all areas of HNP operations. However, this was not fully effective in developing the capacity of the HNP in the areas of training, procurement, maintenance of assets and infrastructure, weapons control and criminal intelligence to combat gang-related activities. For example, OIOS noted capacity gaps as the MINUJUSTH Police Component had not adequately:

- Coordinated with the management of the HNP to offer refresher training to serving police officers, including through identifying officers with good pedagogical skills to become home-grown trainers and delivering training of trainers' courses, as a means to address disciplinary cases involving human rights violations and misconduct;
- Developed the capacity of the HNP in procurement to prepare procurement plans and implement established procurement rules and procedures in an effective, economical and transparent manner. Therefore, they were not able to confirm whether the HNP had followed proper procurement procedures to ensure best value for money;
- Worked in close collaboration with the HNP to develop a fleet management system that would provide long-range planning for both equipment and identify additional funding sources to address HNP operational budget deficit. At the time of the audit, there were over 200 vehicles at the HNP transport workshop waiting to be repaired; and
- Coordinated with the management of the HNP and donor partners to develop the criminal intelligence capacity of the HNP. The HNP officers responsible for criminal intelligence lacked adequate office space, vehicles and computers with Internet access to facilitate the collection and sharing of information.

19. The Mission attributed some of the above capacity gaps to the lack of adequate funding available for HNP. However, the MINUJUSTH Police Component was monitoring its performance only by the number of activities implemented in support of the SDP such as increase in the number of HNP officers, number of police officers trained, number of facilities built and equipped, number of disciplinary cases dealt with by the HNP and number of joint meetings conducted. As a result, MINUJUSTH was unable to measure the impact of its capacity-building activities and identify the best practices and lessons learned that could better inform the design and implementation of the capacity-building programme of BINUH and the UNCT.

(2) MINUJUSTH should conduct an independent assessment of the effectiveness of its capacity-building programme and identify best practices and lessons learned to better inform the design and implementation of any future police capacity-building programme in Haiti.

MINUJUSTH accepted recommendation 2 and stated that with the support of Standing Police Capacity in the Department of Peace Operations, a report was being developed on the legacy of the Mission's support to HNP to capture, among others, lessons learned and best practices of the capacity-building programme. Recommendation 2 remains open pending receipt of the assessment report.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

20. OIOS wishes to express its appreciation to the management and staff of MINUJUSTH for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.

(Signed) Eleanor T. Burns
Director, Internal Audit Division
Office of Internal Oversight Services

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of capacity-building of the Haitian National Police by the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
1	MINUJUSTH should, in coordination with the United Nations Country Team and the Haitian National Police (HNP), develop a comprehensive transition strategy and action plan that includes definable and measurable goals and performance indicators for the capacity development of the HNP in support of the HNP Strategic Development Plan 2017-2021.	Important	O	Receipt of the finalized police capacity-building transition strategy and action plan	15 October 2019
2	MINUJUSTH should conduct an independent assessment of its capacity-building programme and identify best practices and lessons learnt to better inform the design and implementation of any future police capacity-building programme in Haiti.	Important	O	Receipt of the assessment report	15 October 2019

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

³ C = closed, O = open

⁴ Date provided by MINUJUSTH in response to recommendations.

APPENDIX I

Management Response

Management Response

Audit of capacity-building of the Haitian National Police by the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
1	MINUJUSTH should, in coordination with the United Nations Country Team and the Haitian National Police (HNP), develop a comprehensive transition strategy and action plan that includes definable and measurable goals and performance indicators for the capacity development of the HNP in support of the HNP Strategic Development Plan 2017-2021.	Important	Yes	Chief, Capacity-Building Pillar, MINUJUSTH Police Component	15 October 2019	<p>As part of the planning process for the start-up of the follow-on special political mission (United Nations Integrated Office in Haiti, BINUH), there are ongoing joint efforts between MINUJUSTH, HNP and UNCT to develop a set of commonly shared goals and objectives for the UN support to HNP in the future.</p> <p>In this context, a strategic planning workshop was organized in Port-au-Prince from 3 to 5 September with the participation of the UNCT, MINUJUSTH, and representatives of the BINUH Advance Team, EOSG, DCO, DPPA and DPO to take stock of achievements, challenges, and lessons learned from the work of MINUSTAH and MINUJUSTH. Key priorities for the UN System in line with the BINUH mandate were also defined.</p>

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided about the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

Management Response

Audit of capacity-building of the Haitian National Police by the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
						As the next steps, MINUJUSTH Police Component will continue to play an active role to ensure that the new UN Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework (UNSDCF) for Haiti (former UNDAF) or the Integrated Strategic Framework (ISF) for BINUH incorporates comprehensive and achievable targets for the capacity development of the HNP in support of the HNP Strategic Development Plan 2017-2021.
2	MINUJUSTH should conduct an independent assessment of its capacity-building programme and identify best practices and lessons learnt to better inform the design and implementation of any future police capacity-building programme in Haiti.	Important	Yes	Police Commissioner, MINUJUSTH Police Component	15 October 2019	A report on the legacy of MINUJUSTH support to HNP is being developed with the support of Standing Police Capacity in the Department of Peace Operations. This report will capture the lessons learnt and best practices of capacity-building programmes among other activities of MINUJUSTH Police Component towards the benefit of the Haitian National Police (HNP). The outcomes of this report will feed into the design and execution of any future police capacity-building programme in support of HNP.