

Distr.: General 13 February 2023

Original: English

Seventy-seventh session Agenda item 148 Report on the activities of the Office of Internal Oversight Services

> Outcome evaluation of the support provided by the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic for the fight against impunity, the extension of State authority and the rule of law in the Central African Republic

Report of the Office of Internal Oversight Service

Summary

The Office of Internal Oversight Service (OIOS) evaluated the relevance, coherence and effectiveness of the support provided by the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic (MINUSCA) for the fight against impunity, the extension of State authority and the rule of law in the Central African Republic.

During the period covered by the evaluation (2016–2022), MINUSCA played a vital role in strengthening the fight against impunity, the institutional presence and activities of the State and the rule of law across the Central African Republic, thereby establishing relative peace and security. MINUSCA achieved these results despite recurring cycles of violence and armed rebellion, political tensions and the slow progress of the peace process. Other major challenges to mandate implementation included poor infrastructure, including road and communication networks; inadequacy of political will; corruption; the limited operational and logistical capacity of institutions; inadequate budgetary support for national institutions; and the illegal exploitation of natural resources.

The support provided by MINUSCA was in conformity with its Security Council mandate. MINUSCA advanced the fight against impunity by improving accountability, and the restoration and extension of State authority by enhancing its presence and effectiveness across the country. The Mission also strengthened the rule of law by promoting the independence, equality, accessibility and delivery of justice. The support of MINUSCA was aligned with government priorities except where the Mission did not meet the expectation of adopting a proactive posture against armed





groups, with a divergence of views on the need to rely on a predominantly military approach to conflict resolution.

The support provided by MINUSCA significantly met the needs of the population of the Central African Republic, specifically in the areas of security, conflict resolution, humanitarian support, human rights, access to justice and critical basic social services. MINUSCA significantly advanced partnerships with relevant stakeholders in the implementation of joint planning and programming and implementing joint priorities, despite limitations.

Transformational change was hampered, however, by the slow pace of reforms, the scale of assistance required and continued instability. Accountability challenges in connection with the continued human rights violations and abuses, low conviction rates, the release of some high-profile alleged perpetrators and the infringement of the independence of the judiciary persisted.

Major internal challenges included the inadequacy of resources allocated for mandate implementation; limited deployment of resources in the field offices and forward bases; inadequate coordination and integration among different mission components; inadequate monitoring and evaluation capacity; and inadequate joint planning and implementation by mission components.

In the rule of law area, security challenges and weak institutional capacities limited effectiveness, thereby rendering support provided by MINUSCA to the institutions of the Central African Republic only partially sustainable. MINUSCA actively advocated for and supported the rule of law outcomes through gender mainstreaming, advancing the Sustainable Development Goals, disability inclusion and environmental protection, although it lacked a systematic approach.

To further strengthen the relevance and effectiveness of the support provided by MINUSCA for the fight against impunity, the extension of the State authority and the strengthening of the rule of law in the Central African Republic, OIOS makes four important recommendations focusing on the capacity-building of the State institutions to strengthen the rule of law, strengthening the triple-nexus approach, increasing the resource allocation for mandate implementation, and strengthening joint planning, coordination and integration within the Mission.

I. Introduction

1. The objective of the evaluation was to determine, as systematically and objectively as possible, the relevance and effectiveness of the support provided by the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic (MINUSCA) for the fight against impunity, the extension of State authority and the rule of law in the Central African Republic.

2. The evaluation covered the period from July 2016 to June 2022, using the criteria of relevance, coherence and effectiveness, while examining how MINUSCA contributed to durable peace, security and stabilization. State institutions were the primary beneficiary, while the population was the ultimate beneficiary, of the support provided by MINUSCA.

3. Comments were sought from MINUSCA and the Department of Peace Operations (see annex).

II. Background

4. Overview and role. MINUSCA was established by the Security Council on 10 April 2014, pursuant to its resolution 2149 (2014). Acting under chapter VII of the Charter of the United Nations, the Security Council authorized MINUSCA to take all necessary means to carry out its mandate, within its capabilities and its areas of deployment. The priority tasks of MINUSCA included the protection of civilians; use of good offices and support to the peace process, including the implementation of the ceasefire and the Political Agreement for Peace and Reconciliation in the Central African Republic; facilitation of the immediate, full, safe and unhindered delivery of humanitarian assistance; and the protection of the United Nations. Other tasks of MINUSCA included the support for the extension of State authority, the deployment of security forces and the preservation of territorial integrity; the promotion and protection of human rights; the republican dialogue and the elections in 2023; security sector reform; disarmament, demobilization, reintegration and repatriation; and the support for national and international justice, the fight against impunity, and the rule of law.¹

5. **Evaluation focus**. The evaluation was primarily focused on the outcomes of the support provided by MINUSCA to fight against impunity and to extend State authority and the rule of law.² Specific areas covered included: the effectiveness of the criminal justice chain, accountability of institutions, delivery of justice, prison administration, the promotion and protection of human rights, transitional justice, community protection, social cohesion, the support provided for the extension of the State authority (specifically to the judicial, penitentiary, police, gendarmerie and military institutions and the civil administration at all levels), as well as relevant aspects of security sector reform and disarmament, demobilization, reintegration and repatriation. The evaluation also considered aspects of human rights (including disability inclusion), gender mainstreaming, the Sustainable Development Goals (in particular Goal 16) and environmental protection in the programming of support for the rule of law and security institutions.

6. **Strategic vision**. MINUSCA was mandated to advance a multi-year strategic vision to create the political, security and institutional conditions conducive to national reconciliation and durable peace through implementation of the Political Agreement for Peace and Reconciliation in the Central African Republic and the

¹ Security Council resolution 2659 (2022).

² A/76/572 (component 3).

elimination of the threat posed by armed groups through a comprehensive approach and proactive and robust posture without prejudice to the basic principles of peacekeeping.³

7. External challenges. The unresolved root causes of conflict, including the illicit exploitation and trade of natural resources, the recurring cycles of violence and armed rebellion, the marginalization of civilians from specific communities, concerns of national identity, issues related to transhumance and local grievances were among the challenges faced by MINUSCA with regard to the effective implementation of its mandate. MINUSCA also had to overcome other challenges to effectively implement its mandate, such as the strained relationship between the Government and MINUSCA in 2020 and 2021,⁴ lack of trust in MINUSCA by the national military and police institutions, violations of the status-of-forces agreement, misinformation or disinformation campaigns, hate speech and incitement to hatred and violence; negative public sentiments also limited the ability of MINUSCA to function effectively. The Government's use of other security personnel and the violations of international humanitarian law and human rights abuses perpetrated by them, the use of explosive ordnance by inimical forces (49 incidents, of which 5 incidents affected MINUSCA, injuring six peacekeepers),⁵ the cross-border criminal activities by armed combatants and the trafficking of arms and conflict minerals further imposed limitations.⁶ Moreover, the limited State budgetary resources exacerbated by the decrease of foreign aid, weak institutional capacities and poor infrastructure in the country restricted service delivery.

III. Methodology

8. The evaluation used mainly primary data, including direct observation during a field trip, individual and group interviews with representatives of beneficiaries, regional entities, government officials, civil society organizations, MINUSCA, the Department of Political and Peacebuilding Affairs, the Department of Peace Operations and the United Nations country team. Overall, OIOS engaged in 60 individual and 15 group interviews, reaching over 300 respondents. An electronic survey was conducted with the participation of 183 respondents (48 per cent response rate) from MINUSCA, the Department of Peace Operations, government institutions and civil society organizations. To gauge the perceptions and experiences of the population of the Central African Republic, the evaluation benefited from perception surveys conducted by the Harvard Humanitarian Institute from 2016 to 2021, funded jointly by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and MINUSCA, as well as the World Bank Group Country Opinion Survey of 2020.

9. **Evaluation limitations**. Only four of the seven identified MINUSCA bases were visited owing to adverse weather conditions. The data required were not always available from the government institutions.

³ United Nations Peacekeeping Operations: Principles and Guidelines, 2008.

⁴ S/2022/491; and government and MINUSCA interviewees.

⁵ June 2020 to June 2022.

⁶ Of those violations, 45 per cent were perpetrated by State actors, 50 per cent by the armed groups signatories to the Political Agreement for Peace and Reconciliation in the Central African Republic and 5 per cent by others (Human Rights Division quarterly report of July–September 2022).

IV. Evaluation results

A. The support provided by MINUSCA for the fight against impunity, the extension of State authority and the rule of law was aligned with its Security Council mandate, the priorities of the Government and the needs of the people

1. The support provided by MINUSCA was aligned with its Security Council mandate

10. The support provided by MINUSCA was aligned with its Security Council mandate and operationalized through the implementation of the mission concept, strategic and component level concept of operations and plans, programmes and activities. MINUSCA strengthened the rule of law by promoting the independence, equality, accessibility and delivery of justice; supported the restoration and extension of State authority by enhancing State presence and effectiveness across the Central African Republic; and advanced the fight against impunity by improving the accountability of State institutions. Most members of the United Nations country team, government officials and representatives of civil society organizations expressed great appreciation for the predominant role played by MINUSCA in securing relative peace and stability in the Central African Republic. The relevance and coherence of the support provided by MINUSCA with the United Nations mandate, government priorities and the needs of the population were rated as the top attributes by OIOS survey respondents (see figure I).

2. The support provided by MINUSCA was aligned and coherent with government priorities, despite some areas of divergence

11. The alignment and coherence of the support provided by MINUSCA with government priorities were fostered and enhanced by organizing and implementing the priorities of the Bangui Forum on National Reconciliation, the development and implementation of the National Recovery and Peacebuilding Plan, and the implementation of the Political Agreement for Peace and Reconciliation in the Central African Republic and the joint road map for peace in the Central African Republic adopted by the International Conference on the Great Lakes Region. However, key interviewees pointed to some areas of divergence between MINUSCA and government priorities,⁷ including the Government's expectation of MINUSCA to adopt a more proactive posture against the armed groups and the former's continued reliance on a predominantly military approach to conflict resolution.

⁷ S/2022/491.



Figure I Attributes of the support provided by MINUSCA identified by OIOS survey respondents

3. The support provided by MINUSCA was aligned with the needs of the population of the Central African Republic

12. The support provided by MINUSCA was aligned with the needs of the population of the Central African Republic, specifically in the areas of security, conflict resolution, humanitarian support, human rights, access to justice and critical basic social services. To identify and address those needs, MINUSCA engaged extensively with civil society organizations; religious, tribal, women and youth leaders; community members, people's representatives, and civil administration officials at the national, prefectural and sub-prefectural levels. The top priorities of the population according to successive MINUSCA-UNDP-Harvard Humanitarian Institute perception surveys were consistent with the MINUSCA priority areas of support and aligned with its mandate; they included disarmament, demobilization and reintegration, bringing perpetrators to justice, ensuring security, supporting the development of the country, ensuring the State's presence and building the rule of law (see figure II). Similarly, in the World Bank Group Country Opinion Survey of 2020, security, stabilization, reconstruction and public sector governance and reforms were featured as the top priorities for the population of the Central African Republic.

Figure II



Priorities of the people on the actions to be taken for the establishment of lasting peace in the Central African Republic

Source: MINUSCA-UNDP-Harvard Humanitarian Institute perception surveys.

4. MINUSCA advanced partnerships with relevant stakeholders, despite limitations

13. In interviews, representatives of global and regional partners, government officials, civil society organizations, community members and the United Nations country team expressed high appreciation for the partnerships with MINUSCA in the fight against impunity and the extension of State authority and the rule of law in the Central African Republic. The majority of OIOS survey respondents and interviewees rated the unity of vision and unity of effort among the stakeholders as satisfactory, good or very good.

14. The strategic partnerships between the Government, the United Nations country team, MINUSCA and other partners resulted in the adoption and implementation of the National Recovery and Peacebuilding Plan, as well as the establishment of the Special Criminal Court and the Truth, Justice, Reparation and Reconciliation Commission. Most interviewees opined the partnership between the regional entities and MINUSCA were vital in advancing the peace process, generating international commitment, fostering regional cooperation in addressing cross-border dimensions of the conflict, and mobilizing bilateral and multilateral support for the furtherance of peace and stability in the Central African Republic.⁸ These regional efforts resulted in the reactivation of three mixed commissions and two cross border mechanisms aimed at addressing cross border issues.

⁸ S/2022/762.

15. The partnership with the United Nations country team facilitated the joint planning, programming and implementation of joint priorities in the peace and security as well as peacebuilding domains. These were aligned with the United Nations Peacebuilding and Development Assistance Framework for 2018–2022 and in preparation for the United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework for 2023–2027 (see figure III). While joint mechanisms were considered largely effective (72 per cent), other elements had room for improvement. The United Nations country team benefited from the presence and dedicated support of MINUSCA through the good offices of the mission leadership, enhanced security and protection, humanitarian access, support for development activities, capacity-building initiatives, logistical arrangements and joint programming in the extension of State authority, strengthening the rule of law and the fight against impunity.

16. For example, MINUSCA effectively partnered with: the International Organization for Migration and the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees on internally displaced persons and refugee matters; UNDP on the restoration and extension of State authority, rule of law, the Special Criminal Court, security sector reform, capacity-building, and electoral support; the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) in the provision of services to victims of sexual violence in conflict and monitoring and reporting arrangements; the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) in child protection and the monitoring and reporting mechanism, the United Nations Mine Action Service in addressing threats of explosive ordnance and construction of armouries; the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime in capacity-building and cross border issues; the United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women (UN-Women) in electoral support, gender equality and addressing sexual and gender-based violence; and the World Bank in supporting peacebuilding and disarmament, demobilization, reintegration and repatriation programmes in the Central African Republic.

Figure III

Key elements of MINUSCA partnerships (percentage of agreement in the OIOS survey)



17. The comprehensive advancement of the humanitarian-development-peace nexus (triple nexus) to secure durable peace and stability in the Central African Republic was limited by: the resumption of hostilities and insecurity following the Coalition des patriotes pour le changement rebellion in 2021; inadequate presence of and development activities by the United Nations country team outside Bangui; the freezing of direct budgetary support by the donor community and international

financial institutions; the limited government budget to implement the National Recovery and Peacebuilding Plan and other people-centric development priorities; and limited budget within MINUSCA for providing programmatic, quick-impact projects and community violence reduction support to the population. In 2021/22, MINUSCA had a budget of \$1.03 billion, of which only 1 per cent was allocated for programmatic activities. In 2020 and 2021, a strained relationship between MINUSCA and the Government was witnessed, including through violations of the status-of-forces agreement and disinformation campaigns that affected MINUSCA mandate implementation,⁹ although the situation has improved significantly since mid-2022 with the Combined efforts of the MINUSCA and government leaderships. Partnerships with the United Nations country team and the Government of the Central African Republic were also affected by differences in organizational cultures, financial rules and regulations, agendas and priorities, and gaps in coordination and information-sharing.

B. The support provided by MINUSCA contributed to the fight against impunity, the extension of State authority and the strengthening of the rule of law, but the pace of reforms, the scale of assistance required and continued instability hampered transformational change

1. The support provided by MINUSCA advanced the fight against impunity, but accountability challenges remained

18. MINUSCA supported the enactment of laws and ratification of international legal instruments by the National Parliament and assisted the Government in the creation of legal structures, mechanisms, strategies and plans that contributed to strengthening the strategic framework of the fight against impunity and the rule of law (see table 1). MINUSCA provided support to the Government to facilitate the gradual and still ongoing establishment of a functional criminal justice chain, which resulted in the reactivation of police stations, gendarmerie brigades, the courts of appeal, the courts of first instance and prisons.

Table 1

Strategic framework supported by MINUSCA

Domain	Strategic guidance and framework	
Laws enacted	Charter of ethics for magistrates, code of military justice, code of conduct for prison officials, national child protection code, code of good conduct for electoral processes, law on parity, law on communities, law on human trafficking, law on legal aid, law on the establishment and functioning of the high council for national security, law on the freedom of communication, and abolishment of the death penalty.	
Conventions and protocols ratified	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict, Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, and Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and Optional Protocol thereto.	

⁹ S/2021/867.

Domain	Strategic guidance and framework
Structures and mechanisms created	Special Criminal Court, Truth, Justice, Reparation and Reconciliation Commission, joint rapid response unit to prevent sexual violence against women and children, National Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms Commission, national committee on the prevention of genocide, war crimes and crimes against humanity and discrimination, special investigation commission/special commission of enquiry, inclusive commission, Adviser to the President on sexual and gender-based violence and sexual violence in conflict, Minister and Adviser to the President on disarmament, demobilization and reintegration, strategic committee to prevent and respond to conflict- related sexual violence, Executive Monitoring Committee, National Implementation Committee, prefectural implementation committees, technical committee on security, ^a the coordination mechanism under the auspices of the Prime Minister on the implementation of the joint road map for peace in the Central African Republic adopted by the International Conference on the Great Lakes Region, Minister Councillor to the Presidency on security sector reform, and the Security Sector Coordination Committee.
Strategies and policies instituted	National policy on human rights, national restoration and extension of State authority strategy, national policy on decentralization and local development, justice sector reform policy, policy and strategy on demilitarization of prisons, national security policy, national security sector reform strategy, national strategy of the National Commission to Combat the Proliferation and Illegal Movement of Small Arms and Light Weapons, national disarmament, demobilization, reintegration and repatriation strategy and programme, national community violence reduction strategy, national action plan to comba public incitement to violence, policy on community-oriented policing model ir the Central African Republic, strategy for victim and witness protection for the Special Criminal Court, prisoner classification handbook, and national strategy on legal aid.
Plans developed	National action plan of the National Commission to Combat the Proliferation and Illegal Movement of Small Arms and Light Weapons, internal security forces capacity-building and development plan, internal security forces global resizing and redeployment plan, internal security forces five-year training plan and integrated security plan for elections.

^{*a*} To strengthen the implementation of the Political Agreement for Peace and Reconciliation in the Central African Republic at the strategic and prefecture levels.

19. The MINUSCA Human Rights Division and the United Nations police officials monitored, reported and supported investigations of human rights violations and abuses, including through the monitoring and reporting mechanism and monitoring and reporting arrangements to strengthen the fight against impunity. The Human Rights Division and the United Nations police maintained respectively a database on human rights violations and abuses and a database on the overall crime situation in the Central African Republic, which facilitated the investigation, prosecution and conviction of perpetrators. Through urgent temporary measures, as mandated, United Nations police arrested 645 alleged suspects (2016–2022) and handed them over to the government authorities for prosecution. The Justice and Corrections Section, as well as the United Nations police, supported investigations by national authorities into crimes against peacekeepers and, exceptionally and under the urgent temporary measures, carried out such investigations directly. MINUSCA also arrested 10 high-

profile armed group leaders and handed them over to the International Criminal Court (four), the courts of appeal (five) and the Special Criminal Court (one).

20. A total of 340 criminal trials¹⁰ were organized in the courts of appeal from 2015 to 2022, resulting in 518 convictions. In addition, in 2021, the military tribunals and court martial proceedings convicted 27 military officials out of 39 charged with crimes. Strengthening the accountability for crimes against peacekeepers, MINUSCA advocacy and investigative support resulted, in 2020, in the Bangui Court of Appeal convicting 28 armed group elements for killing 10 peacekeepers.¹¹ Cases were registered to bring to justice the perpetrators of malicious acts that caused the killing of another 41 other peacekeepers. The criminal trials, including emblematic trials of armed group leaders conducted in the International Criminal Court, the Special Criminal Court and the courts of appeal, were broadcast live and reported by national media and the MINUSCA radio station, Guira FM, including through social media, to foster accountability, transparency and the delivery of justice. The Special Criminal Court sentenced 3 armed group leaders in October 2022, while another 15 were under investigation, and 48 arrest warrants were pending execution. The Special Criminal Court received 237 complaints from victims of armed attacks, which signalled the hope of the population and their access to criminal justice in the Central African Republic. MINUSCA human rights, justice and corrections, child protection and United Nations police officials regularly monitored illegal and pretrial detainees and detention conditions in the police stations, courts and prisons, which resulted in the speedy judicial process and release of several illegal detainees during the period covered by the present report. The support provided by MINUSCA for prisons contributed to improved security, administration, partial demilitarization and the application of the United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners (the Nelson Mandela Rules). MINUSCA, together with partners, established three human rights community houses, four safe houses for victims and witnesses of sexual violence and 10 legal clinics to support victims in their fight against impunity.

21. Nevertheless, human rights violations and abuses committed by State and non-State actors continued unabated, and accountability and impunity for those crimes remained a challenge. The armed groups that are non-compliant with the peace process continued to operate in or near their strongholds or usual areas of operation and committed human rights abuses. The military offensive undertaken by the State forces and other security personnel, as well as their occasional use of proxies, also contributed to increased human rights violations and abuses.

22. Certain vulnerable sections of the population of the Central African Republic (such as minorities, women and girls) continued to experience insecurities and discrimination. The United Nations police crime database included 92,163 recorded cases for the period 2016–2022, which resulted in 52,810 arrests and 6,970 convictions (13 per cent). Human rights violations and abuses reported by the Human Rights Division included 9,489 recorded cases involving 18,417 victims, which resulted in 518 convictions (5 per cent) for serious crimes (see figure IV).¹² This included 1,916 cases of conflict-related sexual violence involving 2,014 victims and 3,840 cases of grave violations against children involving 2,873 victims. In addition,

¹⁰ MINUSCA budget performance reports (A/72/637, A/73/654, A/74/621, A/75/620 and A/76/572).

¹¹ A total of 26 investigations into attacks against peacekeepers were ongoing and two had been concluded (S/2022/119).

¹² The increase in human rights violations and abuses in 2021 was attributable to electoral violence, an armed rebellion by the Coalition des patriotes pour le changement, and military operations by State actors.

between January and September 2022, 17,831 cases of sexual and gender-based violence were recorded.¹³



Figure IV Criminal incidents and human rights violations and abuses (2016–2022)

Source: MINUSCA Human Rights Division and United Nations police data (based on annual data collected from several sources, including budget performance reports, reports of the Secretary-General, monthly Human Rights Division reports and public reports).

23. Many alleged perpetrators were not, however, arrested and brought to justice. The conviction rates for criminal activities and human rights violations and abuses remained low at 13 per cent and 5 per cent, respectively.¹⁴ There were allegations of undue interference resulting in the arbitrary release of five high-profile alleged perpetrators (four by courts of appeal and one by the Special Criminal Court). The disciplinary oversight mechanisms in the national military, the national police and the gendarmerie remained understaffed, adversely affecting their effectiveness. The capacity to handle the scale of criminal cases by the courts was seriously hampered owing to the limited number of judicial officials. Institutional accountability was rated low by respondents to the OIOS survey (internal security forces – 35 per cent; judiciary – 35 per cent; prisons – 38 per cent; territorial administration – 26 per cent; and military – 25 per cent).

2. The support provided by MINUSCA contributed to the restoration and extension of State authority, but several factors limited the effective functioning of the State authority in areas outside Bangui

24. MINUSCA provided operational, technical, financial and logistics support to the Government for the restoration and extension of State authority. In this regard, MINUSCA worked closely with the National Committee for the Restoration and Extension of State Authority in the Prime Minister's Office and developed a national strategy for the restoration and extension of State authority (2017). MINUSCA components assisted the Ministries of Justice and Human Rights, Interior, Defence and Territorial Administration in the recruitment, capacity-building and deployment (through MINUSCA air and surface transport) of respective officials in various prefectures and sub-prefectures.

¹³ Gender-based Violence Information Management System.

¹⁴ MINUSCA data.

25. Through programmatic funds, quick-impact projects and community violence reduction programmes that were integral to MINUSCA, the Mission, at times with the United Nations country team and other partners, supported the construction, rehabilitation and extension of institutions (including courts, prisons, civil administration offices, police stations, gendarmerie brigade headquarters, military camps, police and military training centres); the provision of equipment for institutions, social services (such as schools, municipality or community halls, victim centres, legal clinics, protection houses, landfills, medical care facilities, water supply, market places and electrification); mobility assistance (including airfields, helipads, roads, bridges and ferries); and accommodation for government officials. The Mission also provided various equipment and materials to the State authorities, including computers, printers, furniture, forensic equipment, office stationery and motorcycles. Government-provided corrections personnel and United Nations police officials serving with MINUSCA were placed with the prisons and the internal security forces, respectively, and contributed to monitoring mentoring, advocacy and the technical capacity-building of State officials.

26. The support provided by MINUSCA facilitated the deployment and extension of the presence and control of the State authority in prefectures and sub-prefectures, thereby significantly reducing the area that was under the control¹⁵ of the armed groups. OIOS field visits observed that the State institutions and their representatives were functional, accessible and responsive to the needs of the people, albeit with limited staffing and meagre resources. Overall, the civil society organization interviewees were appreciative of the support provided by MINUSCA in creating a conducive environment and in deploying the State officials in the forward areas. Civil society organizations and community members expressed trust and confidence in the State institutions and their legitimacy and requested additional capacity-building support from MINUSCA.

27. The support provided by MINUSCA for the restoration and extension of State authority resulted in the deployment of civil administration officials in 16 prefectures and 71 sub-prefectures,¹⁶ and the reactivation of 22 courts out of 31 and 12 prisons out of 38. The number of civil administration and services officials increased from 1,315 in 2015 to 3,418 in 2019, and 4,549 in 2022.¹⁷ The number of women represented in the civil administration increased from 329 in 2019 to 577 (13 per cent of the workforce) in 2022. As monitored and reported by MINUSCA every month, approximately 70 per cent of the civil administration officials were present in the prefectures and sub-prefectures on average.

28. To support the enhancement of the Government's outreach to the communities across the Central African Republic and to strengthen strategic communication, MINUSCA installed 20 antennas (14 of MINUSCA and 6 of the Government) in MINUSCA operating bases. MINUSCA media platforms launched programmes to promote better understanding of the Mission's role and its mandate, while raising public awareness on human rights and access to justice, as part of its communication strategy to counter disinformation and misinformation and shape public perceptions.

29. Major challenges were faced, however, in relation to the restoration and extension of State authority. Most interviewees described that the State institutions

¹⁵ Armed groups controlled a large part of the territory during the period 2016–2020. According to data from the Comprehensive Planning and Performance Assessment System, the number of localities in which armed groups collected illegal taxes decreased in 2021.

¹⁶ In 2021, the Government delineated 20 prefectures and 84 sub-prefectures in the Central African Republic.

¹⁷ MINUSCA budget performance reports and joint civil administration mapping reports (2019 and 2022).

beyond Bangui lacked basic infrastructure, such as office buildings (despite the rehabilitation of 272 administrative buildings among a total of 706 quick-impact projects since 2015), accommodation for the officials, electric supply, banks for disbursement of salaries, office equipment and stationery and medical care and educational facilities. Moreover, the State's institutional infrastructure was frequently pillaged or destroyed by the armed groups each time they took control of population centres. Interviewees noted that the institutions also lacked qualified and professional managers and personnel, had budgetary constraints to pay salaries on time, and were unable to manage and monitor deployments and rotations resulting in low levels of motivation. Insecurity also resulted in desertions.

30. Most interviewees expressed the continued need for capacity-building support for the State institutions to deliver effectively. The State had a limited budget that made basic service delivery in the prefectures and subprefectures difficult (only 16 per cent of OIOS survey respondents agreed that local administration provided basic services to the communities). Although the provision by MINUSCA of infrastructure and materials support was well appreciated by the State officials and communities, OIOS noted instances of poor quality in materials used for construction, use of unskilled implementing partners due to lack of local capacities, inadequate documented client consultation and project management issues, including incessant delays, which affected sustainability.

3. The support provided by MINUSCA strengthened the rule of law, but security challenges and weak institutional capacities limited effectiveness

31. The support provided by MINUSCA reinforced the independence, accountability, transparency and effectiveness of the national police, judicial and penitentiary systems. MINUSCA provided technical capacity-building support to the State authorities to identify, investigate and prosecute those responsible for crimes involving violations of international humanitarian law and violations and abuses of human rights. The support provided by MINUSCA for the criminal justice system improved the access to and delivery of justice through fair trial standards. The support provided by MINUSCA, which ensured the restoration and extension of State institutions, strengthened the criminal justice chain, which was not functional in areas beyond Bangui in the aftermath of the armed conflict in 2013 and 2014. Accordingly, the trust of the population in the ordinary (formal justice), alternative (local conflict resolutions and mediation) and traditional (by village chiefs, administrative and traditional entities) justice mechanisms increased over time (see figure V).

Figure V Trust of the population of the Central African Republic in justice systems and the Special Criminal Court over time



(% confident) Poll 2 (Nov. 2017) Poll 4 (Dec. 2018) Poll 5 (Feb. 2020) Poll 6 (Dec. 2020)

Source: MINUSCA-UNDP-Harvard Humanitarian Institute data.

32. The technical, logistical and financial support provided by MINUSCA for the conduct of national elections in 2016 and 2020 paved the way for democratization, establishment of relative peace, stability and restoration of the rule of law. The key facilitation role played by MINUSCA in the advancement of the comprehensive peace process, including the organization of the Bangui Forum in 2015, the signing of the Political Agreement for Peace and Reconciliation in the Central African Republic in 2019, the adoption of the joint road map for peace in the Central African Republic of the International Conference on the Great Lakes Region in 2021 and the initiation of the inclusive republican dialogue in 2022 provided a strong foundation for strengthening the rule of law.

To ensure accountability for past crimes and reparation for victims, as well as 33. access to fair and equal justice for all in line with the conclusions of the Bangui Forum, MINUSCA supported the establishment of the Truth, Justice, Reparation and Reconciliation Commission in 2021. Owing to multiple challenges, the Commission was partly operational in discharging its mandate on transitional justice. MINUSCA promoted peace reconciliation initiatives at the regional, national, prefectural and local levels to address marginalization and local grievances, including through dialogue with armed groups and communities in conflict. MINUSCA consultation with communities; mediation and reconciliation efforts; engagement with religious, tribal, women, youth leaders and civil society organizations; as well as bringing together the State officials and community members to discuss and resolve local issues, strengthened social cohesion and stability. In October 2022, four community conflicts related to cross-border transhumance and conflicting political and economic interests were peacefully resolved through community dialogue supported by MINUSCA (115 since 2016).¹⁸

34. MINUSCA supported the national, prefectural and sub-prefectural authorities to effectively deliver their administrative roles to foster confidence among communities through capacity-building and material assistance. The support provided by MINUSCA resulted in the development of community protection plans, the

¹⁸ S/2022/762.

establishment of 83 community-based protection committees and 109 protection networks supported by 78 community liaison assistants deployed in 42 MINUSCA operating bases and 12 field offices and assisted by 5,575 (1,078 women) civil society volunteers. That support enhanced early-warning arrangements, risk mitigation (mapping of hotspots, creation of protection plans and deployment of surge teams), protection (73 per cent response rate to complaints)¹⁹ and reconciliation.²⁰ MINUSCA helped to establish 29 local peace and reconciliation committees in almost all the main towns, fostering local reconciliation between Muslim and Christian communities in a "bottom-up" approach to establishing peace.²¹

35. The consistent efforts of MINUSCA enhanced the promotion and protection of human rights and increased human rights awareness among the people, including through the strengthening of the capacity of civil society organizations. The advocacy of and the infrastructure, technical and logistics support provided by MINUSCA resulted in the establishment of the National Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms Commission in 2017. MINUSCA provided support to the Victims' Association Coordination and the Working Group on Transitional Justice in the Central African Republic between 2019 and 2022, to enhance awareness of human rights and access to justice.

36. As part of the application of the human rights due diligence policy on United Nations support to non-United Nations security forces,²² during 2016–2022, MINUSCA received 553 requests that resulted in the screening of 18,892 military, police and gendarmerie personnel, of whom 18,790 were cleared. In addition, MINUSCA supported the vetting of 14,135 military personnel during 2017–2022. Seven officers and 32 soldiers were identified to have committed human rights violations during the risk assessments conducted between January 2018 and March 2022.²³ While the respect for and awareness of human rights were rated as high in the OIOS survey, the reduction in violations and abuses, the safety of human rights defenders and service provision to victims were rated as low (see figure VI).

Figure VI

Human rights standards in the Central African Republic (percentage of agreement in the OIOS survey)



^{0/0 10/0 20/0 50/0 40/0 50/0 00/0 /0/0 00/0}

²⁰ MINUSCA Civil Affairs Section data.

¹⁹ OIOS report No. IED-18-010.

²¹ S/2019/822.

²² MINUSCA Human Rights Division data.

²³ S/2022/449.

37. Overall, owing to the political tensions, slow progress in the peace process, the insecurity created by armed groups, economic instabilities and inadequate capacities of the State institutions, the rule of law situation in the Central African Republic remained precarious and unpredictable. The perception of security by the population improved from 7 per cent in 2017/18 to 30 per cent in 2020/21, yet 70 per cent of the population remained unsure of their security.²⁴ The number of attacks and armed clashes between the parties to the conflict dropped in 2018/19, increased during the post-election armed rebellion in 2020/21 and marginally reduced in the 2021/22 period. On the humanitarian front, the number of people in need of humanitarian assistance remained stable at 3.1 million, and the number of refugees from the Central African Republic to neighbouring countries increased from 419,000 in 2014 to 746,000 in 2022. At the same time, the number of internally displaced persons increased from 430,000 in 2014 to an average of 670,000 between 2017 and 2021, before decreasing to 505,000 in 2022 owing to the improved security situation in the aftermath of the State forces operations against armed groups.²⁵

38. MINUSCA provided strategic and technical advice to the authorities of the Central African Republic to implement the national strategy on security sector reform and the national security policy and the internal security forces capacity-building and development plan, which were developed with the Mission's assistance. Advocacy by MINUSCA resulted in the designation of a Minister Councillor to the Presidency on security sector reform, the creation of a coordination cell for security sector reform in the Presidency and the establishment of a Security Sector Coordination Committee in 2021. However, the coordination and implementation of security sector reform in the Central African Republic remained a challenge, including the vetting of defence and internal security elements, as well as parallel recruitments.

39. Most of the interviewees and survey respondents opined that lasting peace and security in the Central African Republic cannot be achieved without a combination of political, security, peacebuilding and sustainable development efforts benefiting all regions of the Central African Republic, crystallization and securing a concurrent progress of the country through a strong and systematic humanitarian-development-peace nexus (triple-nexus) approach, as well as the full, effective and inclusive implementation of the Political Agreement for Peace and Reconciliation in the Central African Republic.

Case study

The proactive and constructive engagement of MINUSCA, as well as the monitoring and reporting of human rights abuses committed by armed groups, strengthened the rule of law and the fight against impunity and furthered the peace process.

MINUSCA facilitated the signing of the Political Agreement for Peace and Reconciliation in the Central African Republic by the Government and 14 armed groups in 2019. However, six armed groups withdrew and formed the Coalition des patriotes pour le changement to undertake an armed rebellion against the Government in 2021. Through its engagement, MINUSCA, together with its partners, helped to revitalize the peace process for a negotiated settlement.

²⁴ MINUSCA Situational Awareness Geospatial Enterprise data.

²⁵ Data from the Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees and the International Organization for Migration.

To augment the fight against impunity, MINUSCA, under urgent temporary measures, arrested and brought to justice several armed group leaders and combatants. In addition, three armed groups were listed as parties that committed grave violations affecting children and two armed groups listed as credibly suspected of committing or being responsible for patterns of rape or other forms of sexual violence in situations of armed conflict in the respective reports of the Secretary-General to the General Assembly and the Security Council (S/2022/493 and S/2022/272).

MINUSCA engagement with armed groups resulted in the disarmament and demobilization of 3,877 (219 women) ex-combatants (55 per cent of the case load) through the national disarmament, demobilization, reintegration and repatriation programme (2018–2022) and the collection of over 2,775 weapons of war, 136,879 rounds of ammunition, 1,526 grenades, 560 other explosives and 656 magazines.^{*a*} A total of 7,245 children associated with armed groups were released and an additional 2,750 children were self-demobilized.^{*b*} A total of 666 ex-combatants (374 in 2019/20 and 292 in 2020/21) were integrated into the national defence forces and the internal security forces. During the 2016–2022 period, the pre-disarmament, demobilization and reintegration and community violence reduction programmes^{*c*} benefited 31,480 ex-combatants (9,148 women), youth at risk and other community members.

However, the national disarmament, demobilization, reintegration and repatriation programme remained a major challenge and a priority for advancing the peace process. The lack of sustainable socioeconomic reintegration of ex-combatants, lack of transparent integration by the national security institutions, the potential use of ex-combatants as proxies in the ongoing conflict, and a lack of systematic follow-up of the disarmed and demobilized ex-combatants remained a challenge. In addition, the special mixed security units bringing together the ex-combatants with the national forces failed to become fully operationalized. Furthermore, government officials and civil society organization representatives interviewed opined that MINUSCA had not adopted a proactive posture to eliminate the threat posed by the armed groups; the response to incidents of physical violence had reportedly been delayed; and government infrastructure had not been protected from pillaging and destruction by armed groups. Despite concerted efforts by all stakeholders, the threat posed by the armed groups remained significant in some areas.

4. The support provided by MINUSCA to the institutions of the Central African Republic was partially sustainable

40. The institutional, technical, operational and logistics support provided by MINUSCA to the State institutions, civil society organizations and communities enhanced the sustainability of the programmes. Most facilities, equipment and assets provided by MINUSCA that were inspected as part of the evaluation appeared to be operational and used optimally. MINUSCA also mobilized additional financial resources to enhance the sustainability of critical rule of law programmes through the United Nations country team, the Peacebuilding Fund (\$13.6 million), the Global

^{*a*} MINUSCA Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration Section data.

^b MINUSCA Child Protection Section data.

^c MINUSCA administered 30 per cent quota for women in community violence reduction projects.

Focal Point for the Rule of Law (\$ million), the European Union (€19.5 million) and the World Bank (\$ million).

41. However, many inhibiting factors affected the sustainability of these programmes. State institutions lacked regular budgetary support and resources to function effectively and maintain infrastructure. The rule of law mechanisms supported by MINUSCA and partners, such as the Special Criminal Court, the Truth, Justice, Reparation and Reconciliation Commission, legal clinics and special mixed security units continued to face severe resource constraints. Sustainability was also constrained by the inadequacy of the funds of available to the United Nations country team to support development, and the freezing of direct budgetary support by key partners and international financial institutions exacerbated the situation. Sustainability was rated as the lowest attribute of the support provided by MINUSCA in the OIOS survey (36 per cent agreement).

C. Mandate implementation was affected by internal challenges

42. MINUSCA faced internal challenges that affected its mandate implementation. Several interviewees pointed to gaps in integrated planning, coordination and information-sharing, and the organizational placements of the Human Rights Division, the Security Sector Reform Service and the Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration Section under the Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary-General's pillar and the Justice and Corrections Section and the Civil Affairs Section under the Resident Coordinator/Humanitarian Coordinator's pillar being cited as limiting integration. Figure VII depicts the internal challenges cited by respondents of the OIOS survey as those limiting mandate implementation.

Figure VII Major internal challenges of MINUSCA (percentage of agreement in the OIOS survey)



D. MINUSCA actively advocated for and supported the rule of law outcomes through gender mainstreaming, the advancement of Sustainable Development Goal 16, disability inclusion and environmental protection

1. A gender perspective was adequately mainstreamed and promoted

43. MINUSCA leadership engaged with members of the Government and civil society at the national and provincial levels to improve the representation and participation of women in the parliament, peace mechanisms and in administrative positions. The Mission's assessments, programmes, plans and reports reflected an adequate gender mainstreaming approach and contained data disaggregated by sex. MINUSCA advocacy and support together with partners resulted in the enactment of a law on parity in 2016, which specified a 35 per cent quota for female candidates (only 15.6 per cent was achieved in the 2020 elections); increased the participation of women in the elections as voters (46 per cent of women registered); increased the representation of women in the National Assembly from 8 per cent to 12 per cent; resulted in the provision of birth certificates to 3,185 women to provide voter eligibility; and increased the proportion of women in ministerial positions from 8.6 per cent in 2017 to 12.9 per cent in 2021. The representation of women was increased in the civil administration (329 in 2017 to 577 in 2022),²⁶ the national police (25 per cent), the gendarmerie (15 per cent), the early-warning mechanisms (49 per cent), the Truth, Justice, Reparation and Reconciliation Commission (45 per cent), the local committees for peace and reconciliation (35 per cent), the republican dialogue $(17 \text{ per cent})^{27}$ and the peace negotiation (eight women as part of a 78-member delegation). MINUSCA also supported the creation of the joint rapid response unit to prevent sexual violence against women and children; established working groups addressing gender-based violence at the field office levels; strengthened women's and youth leaders and civil society organizations; and helped in creating separate living areas for women and juvenile inmates in prisons. MINUSCA capacity-building initiatives specifically targeted female officials and community members. Female engagement teams interacted with local communities to sensitize protection issues to tailor collective responses. Fifty-eight per cent of OIOS survey respondents agreed that the full, equal, meaningful and safe participation of women in the prevention, management and resolution of conflicts and peace process in the Central African Republic had increased.

2. MINUSCA contributed to advancing Sustainable Development Goal 16, but without a systematic approach

44. The human rights, rule of law, gender and institutional support programmes of MINUSCA and relevant partners contributed to and reinforced the advancement of Sustainable Development Goal 16 in the Central African Republic. While the Resident Coordinator Office, the United Nations country team and national stakeholders pursued the Goals in a broad sense, there was a lack of synergy and a systematic approach and coordinated plan for the implementation of Goal 16.

3. The Mission engaged actively with the Government to establish a framework for disability inclusion in the Central African Republic

45. Persons with disabilities were among the most vulnerable during the armed attacks in the Central African Republic. MINUSCA advocacy resulted in the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in 2016 by the Government, although the national disability law and strategy were yet to be

²⁶ MINUSCA Gender Unit data.

²⁷ A/77/573.

adopted.²⁸ To advance the interests and rights of persons with disabilities, MINUSCA provided technical assistance and supported the annual advocacy campaign of the National Organization for Persons with Disabilities (ONAPHA), a civil society organization in the Central African Republic. MINUSCA, along with partners, provided programmatic support to persons with disabilities in terms of mobility assistance, basic necessities, medical care and recreational facilities, among other areas. Fifty-one per cent of OIOS survey respondents agreed that persons with disabilities have been protected from human rights violations and abuses, including conflict-related sexual violence.

4. Environmental aspects were considered in programme planning and implementation of some projects

46. Some of the community violence reduction programmes and quick-impact projects implemented by MINUSCA reflected environmental protection considerations that enhanced security, community welfare and administrative abilities. Some notable contributions were in the form of the installation of solar panels for electrification to enhance security in State institutions, roads and public places; rainwater harvesting arrangements in the buildings that were constructed or rehabilitated; provision of borehole water supply systems for the communities; tree plantation, including fruit trees; and preventing or reducing negative effects on the environment, in particular pollution of soil and air and of groundwater (for example, Bangui landfill).

V. Recommendations

47. OIOS makes the four important recommendations contained in table 2.

Recommendation	Туре	Indicator of achievement	
1. MINUSCA, through its good offices and in coordination with partners, should enhance the strategic, operational, technical and logistical support to the police, judicial, penitentiary, gendarmerie, military and territorial administration institutions in strengthening the rule of law.	Important	 a. Police, judicial, penitentiary, gendarmerie, military and territorial administration institutions deployed in an increasing number of prefectures and subprefectures and functional; b. Progress made in the implementation of the Political Agreement for Peace and Reconciliation in the Central African Republic and the joint road map for peace in the Centra African Republic adopted by the International Conference on the Great Lakes Region with regard to security sector reform, justice and penitentiary reforms, disarmament, demobilization, reintegration and repatriation programmes, and operationalization of the Truth, Justice, Reparation and Reconciliation Commission in accordance with the agreed timeline; 	

Table 2 Recommendations of the Office of Internal Oversight

²⁸ MINUSCA Human Rights Division data.

A/77/739

Recommendation	Туре	Indicator of achievement
Keelommendulion	Туре	 c. Impunity for human rights violations and abuses (including conflict-related sexual violence and grave violations against children) committed by State and non-State actors reduced and perpetrators brought to justice to create conducive political, security and institutional conditions to achieve national reconciliation and durable peace.
2. MINUSCA should collaborate with the United Nations country team and relevant partners to build the triple-nexus approach for comprehensive, concurrent, and mutually reinforcing progress in	Important	 a. A triple-nexus approach finalized with the integrated office, the Resident Coordinator Office and the United Nations country team; b. Joint or coordinated plans developed, resources and priorities identified, and programmes implemented;
the peace, development and humanitarian domains for durable peace and stability.		c. Conditions facilitated to increased presence and activities of the United Nations country team to deliver peace dividends.
3. The Department of Peace Operations and MINUSCA should review the resource	Important	a. A joint Department of Peace Operations- MINUSCA comprehensive assessment of resources requirement carried out;
requirements in accordance with the Security Council mandate and mobilize commensurate		b. A resource mobilization and mandate implementation plan developed and rolled out;
resources together with key stakeholders.		c. Advocacy support to mobilize resources for the United Nations Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework provided.
4. MINUSCA should strengthen joint planning, cross-	Important	a. An integrated whole-of-mission plan developed and rolled out;
pillar and cross-section coordination and integration among relevant mission components ^a to enhance the effectiveness of mandate implementation.		b. Common mandated objectives and tasks defined, joint priorities identified with a coordinated division of labour, and collective implementation monitored and adjusted for the accomplishment of desired outcomes.

^{*a*} Including the Justice and Corrections Section, the Human Rights Division, the United Nations police, the Civil Affairs Section, the Political Affairs Division, the Security Sector Reform Service, the Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration Section, the force and the Strategic Communication and Public Information Service.

Annex

Comments received from entities on the draft report

Special Representative of the Secretary-General for the Central African Republic and Head of the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic

With reference to your inter-office memorandum from Friday, 3 February 2023 on the above-mentioned subject, please find the response of the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic (MINUSCA).

I take this opportunity to thank you and your team for the hard work and effort put into conducting this evaluation, as well as the findings and recommendations elaborated in the report.

I concur with the findings of the evaluation report, and I note the report was extensively reviewed by the Mission during the drafting stages, and thus requires no further comment.

The recommendations are likewise accepted and progress indicators noted as such, although these shall be considered in the broader context that MINUSCA is but one of several key actors necessary to achieve them.

I am mindful of the scale of the evaluation, and the Mission will provide the action plan separately, noting the recent arrival of the new Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary-General (Resident Coordinator/Humanitarian Coordinator). Also, I will liaise closely with my colleagues in the Department of Peace Operations to ensure the cross-cutting recommendations are addressed in an integrated manner.

I would like to thank you and your staff for the excellent cooperation and guidance during this process.

Under-Secretary-General for Peace Operations

I refer to the draft final report on the support provided by the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic (MINUSCA) for the fight against impunity, the extension of State authority and the rule of law in the Central African Republic.

The Department of Peace Operations acknowledges receipt of and concurs with the report and its recommendations and will support MINUSCA in their implementation.

I would like to take this opportunity to thank you and your staff for the excellent cooperation and the constructive approach taken throughout this process.