



INTERNAL AUDIT DIVISION

REPORT 2013/143

Audit of corrections advisory activities
in the United Nations Stabilization
Mission in Haiti

Overall results relating to the effective management of corrections advisory activities in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti were initially assessed as partially satisfactory. Implementation of one important recommendation remains in progress

FINAL OVERALL RATING: PARTIALLY
SATISFACTORY

23 December 2013
Assignment No. AP2013/683/07

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. OBJECTIVE AND SCOPE	1-2
III. AUDIT RESULTS	2-4
A. Project management	2-4
IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	5
ANNEX I Status of audit recommendations	
APPENDIX I Management response	

AUDIT REPORT

Audit of corrections advisory activities in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

I. BACKGROUND

1. The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of corrections advisory activities in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH).
2. In accordance with its mandate, OIOS provides assurance and advice on the adequacy and effectiveness of the United Nations internal control system, the primary objectives of which are to ensure: (a) efficient and effective operations; (b) accurate financial and operational reporting; (c) safeguarding of assets; and (d) compliance with mandates, regulations and rules.
3. MINUSTAH was established by Security Council resolution 1542 of 30 April 2004 and was mandated, among others, to strengthen the capacity of the Directorate of Prison Administration to provide safe, secure and humane prison system in Haiti.
4. The MINUSTAH Corrections Section reported to the Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary-General. The Section was headed by a chief at the P-4 level who was supported by 2 international staff, 4 national staff, 1 United Nations volunteer, and 61 government-provided personnel. The budget for the financial year 2012/13 for staffing costs and payment of mission subsistence allowances to government-provided personnel was \$7.1 million. As at 30 June 2013, there were 9,739 prisoners in 17 Haitian prisons out of which, 455 were women and 281 were juveniles.
5. Comments provided by MINUSTAH are incorporated in italics.

II. OBJECTIVE AND SCOPE

6. The audit was conducted to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of MINUSTAH governance, risk management and control processes in providing reasonable assurance regarding the **effective management of corrections advisory activities in MINUSTAH**.
7. The audit was included in the OIOS 2013 risk-based work plan due to the operational and reputational risks of MINUSTAH not achieving its mandate to support the government in strengthening the corrections system in Haiti.
8. The key control tested for the audit was project management. For the purpose of this audit, OIOS defined this control as the one that provides reasonable assurance that there is sufficient project management capacity such as financial resources, human resources and appropriate project management tools to achieve mandates.
9. The key control was assessed for the control objectives shown in Table 1.
10. OIOS conducted the audit from May to September 2013. The audit covered the period from 1 July 2012 to 30 June 2013.

11. OIOS conducted an activity-level risk assessment to identify and assess specific risk exposures, and to confirm the relevance of the selected key control in mitigating associated risks. Through interviews, analytical reviews and tests of controls, OIOS assessed the existence and adequacy of internal controls and conducted necessary tests to determine their effectiveness.

III. AUDIT RESULTS

12. The MINUSTAH governance, risk management and control processes examined were initially assessed as **partially satisfactory** in providing reasonable assurance regarding the **effective management of corrections advisory activities in MINUSTAH**. OIOS made one recommendation to address issues identified. MINUSTAH supported the strengthening of the national corrections authorities, and attained its goal of mentoring and training national corrections personnel. MINUSTAH prepared strategic plans identifying additional areas to support the Haitian corrections system including improving prison conditions and strengthening the Directorate of Prison Administration. While MINUSTAH targets to support the Directorate of Prison Administration were, in the most part, being met, MINUSTAH needed to further reinforce its plans and coordinate with other United Nations agencies and international partners/donors to mobilize and allocate additional funding to assist the Government in strengthening the prison service.

13. The initial overall rating was based on the assessment of the key control presented in Table 1 below. The final overall rating is **partially satisfactory** as implementation of one important recommendation remains in progress.

Table 1: Assessment of key control

Business objective	Key control	Control objectives			
		Efficient and effective operations	Accurate financial and operational reporting	Safeguarding of assets	Compliance with mandates, regulations and rules
Effective management of corrections advisory activities in MINUSTAH	Project management	Partially satisfactory	Satisfactory	Not assessed	Satisfactory
FINAL OVERALL RATING: PARTIALLY SATISFACTORY					

A. Project management

MINUSTAH mentored and trained the Haitian corrections officers

14. The United Nations Security Council through its resolution 1840 (2008) and 1892 (2009) requested MINUSTAH to remain engaged in supporting the mentoring and training of corrections personnel and strengthening of institutional and operational capacities.

15. MINUSTAH worked with the Directorate of Prison Administration on a number of projects, including those related to health, sanitation and general prison administration. MINUSTAH had 61 government-provided personnel with specialized skills in training, medicine, registry, human rights, and administration. Of the 61 government-provided personnel, 48 were located at all the 17 Haitian prisons to facilitate on-the-job capacity-building on a daily basis. During the period from 1 July 2011 to 30 June

2013, MINUSTAH organized 65 training courses and trained 1,097 officials in various areas, such as, use of force, sentence management, crisis management, human rights, registry and prison management. MINUSTAH also trained 300 new recruits and 17 officers for the role of instructors. Overall, MINUSTAH achieved its goal of training and mentoring Haitian corrections officers.

The Mission needed to continue reinforcing its plans to strengthen the capacity of the Government of Haiti to improve prison conditions

16. MINUSTAH, in developing its plans to strengthen the Haiti corrections systems, based its benchmarks on the established standards and norms reflected in the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners.

17. MINUSTAH developed annual work plans that were based on the MINUSTAH 2012-2016 integrated Strategic Framework, which was aligned with the Government of Haiti's Strategic Development Plan. The objectives of the work plans for 2012-2016 were to: (a) improve prison conditions and reduce overcrowding; and (b) strengthen the Directorate of Prison Administration. The status of the main activities included in the MINUSTAH 2012/13 work plan was as follows:

- MINUSTAH planned to increase inmate space by 25 per cent per year. MINUSTAH coordinated with donors to build a prison in one location and extended cell spaces in two other prisons. This increased the overall cell space by 30 per cent from 4,558 to 5,958 square metres. However, during the same period, the prisoner population grew by 57 per cent and as a result the additional prison space did not have an impact on reducing prisoner cell space. There was a need for MINUSTAH to provide continual support to the Directorate of Prison Administration to reduce overcrowding in Haiti prisons.
- MINUSTAH planned to assist the Directorate of Prison Administration in separating juveniles from adults in prisons. MINUSTAH established a target for 2012/13 to decrease the number of juveniles held in adult prisons by 168 persons. This initial target was not met, due to the overall lack of adequate space; however, through the continued support and guidance provided by MINUSTAH to Haitian corrections officers, the number of juveniles held in adult prisons was reduced by 148.
- MINUSTAH planned to support the Directorate of Prison Administration in improving the health of inmates through ensuring that each inmate had access to health services, and this included assigning a nurse in each prison. MINUSTAH provided advice and guidance to the Government of Haiti and worked with other health partners to produce a policy directive on the treatment of inmates requiring medical, dental or psychological interventions. The Directorate of Prison Administration also assigned at least one nurse in each prison. However, although MINUSTAH achieved its targets, further support was required, as in some prisons a nurse was responsible for more than 450 prisoners, impacting on the ability to provide adequate medical care.
- MINUSTAH planned to support the Directorate of Prison Administration in providing education to illiterates and young prisoners. MINUSTAH supported the introduction of education programmes to two prisons in Port-au-Prince accommodating juveniles. However, juveniles in prisons located outside of Port-au-Prince lacked opportunities for education. Some 53 per cent (148 of 281) of the juveniles as at 30 June 2013 did not receive any education. MINUSTAH attributed this to lack of infrastructure and centres for juveniles in the regions.

(1) MINUSTAH should reinforce its plan to enhance the capacity of the Government of Haiti in improving the conditions of inmates in prisons through: (a) coordinating with other United Nations agencies and international partners/donors to mobilize and allocate additional funding for prison improvement projects; and/or (b) tap into the quick-impact project funds to finance more prison improvement projects.

MINUSTAH accepted recommendation 1 and stated that the Mission had initiated discussions with international stakeholders with the aim of soliciting additional funds for prison development projects. The Mission was also planning to embark on other quick impact projects to support the Directorate of Prison Administration to improve prison conditions. Recommendation 1 remains open pending receipt of evidence that MINUSTAH has reinforced its plans to strengthen the capacity of the Directorate of Prison Administration.

The Mission assisted the Directorate of Prison Administration in reducing the number of inmates on pretrial detention

18. The MINUSTAH 2012/13 work plan, based on its integrated Strategic Framework, planned to assist in reducing the percentage of inmates held in pretrial detention to 72 per cent in Port-au-Prince and 42 per cent in the regions.

19. To accomplish the plan of reducing pretrial detention, MINUSTAH reviewed pretrial cases. This resulted in the release of over 2,323 persons that had no further legal basis for continued detention. For example, petty offenders who had been in prison longer than what their sentence term would call for. MINUSTAH did not meet the established targets of reducing the overall percentage of inmates in pretrial detention because of: (a) the continual increase in arrest rates by the strengthened Haitian National Police; and (b) the slow process of reforming the justice system where bail procedures and imprisonment alternatives to discharge persons accused of petty offences were not yet established.

20. MINUSTAH was continuing to introduce new strategies to the Government of Haiti to address the issue of pretrial detention and advocate for the systematic implementation of pretrial reduction proposals. Therefore, no recommendation was made.

Safeguarding of prison records needed improvement

21. The MINUSTAH concept of operations required the corrections component to develop the Haitian organizational capacity, including the preservation and upkeep of prison records.

22. MINUSTAH assisted the Haiti Directorate of Prison Administration in developing a registry system that resulted in the creation and maintenance of individual files, including medical files for all prisoners. However, subsequent to this, in January 2010, the Directorate lost over 4,000 prisoners' files in two prisons due to fires. These files needed to be recreated. As MINUSTAH was collaborating with the United Nations Development Programme on this matter, as they were the United Nations global focal point in rule of law issues, no recommendation was made.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

23. OIOS wishes to express its appreciation to the Management and staff of MINUSTAH for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.

(Signed) David Kanja
Assistant Secretary-General for Internal Oversight Services

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of corrections advisory activities in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

Recom. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
1	MINUSTAH should reinforce its plan to enhance the capacity of the Government of Haiti in improving the conditions of inmates in prisons through: (a) coordinating with other United Nations agencies and international partners/donors to mobilize and allocate additional funding for prison improvement projects; and/or (b) tapping into the quick-impact project funds to finance more prison improvement projects.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that MINUSTAH has reinforced its plans to strengthen the capacity of the Directorate of Prison Administration.	1 July 2014

¹ Critical recommendations address significant and/or pervasive deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

³ C = closed, O = open

⁴ Date provided by MINUSTAH in response to recommendations.

APPENDIX I

Management Response



TELEFAX TRANSMISSION

Outgoing fax msg no:		Page 1 of 3
To:	Ms. Eleanor T. Burns Chief, Peacekeeping Audit Service, IAD, OIOS, UNHQ, NY	From: Sandra Honoré Special Representative of the Secretary-General, MINUSTAH, Port-au-Prince
Fax no:	3 3388 (via email)	Fax no: 7-9080
Info:	Ms. Amy Wong (wong6@un.org) Mr. Iswari Bhattarai (bhattarai2@un.org)	Date: 18 December 2013
		Ref: AP2013/683/05
Subject:	Assignment No AP2013/683/07 – Audit of Corrections Advisory Activities in MINUSTAH - Mission Response to the Overall Results of the Audit	

1. Reference is made to your memorandum dated 10 December 2013, on the above mentioned subject, under cover of which you forwarded the OIOS overall results relating to the audit of corrections advisory activities in MINUSTAH.

2. Please find attached MINUSTAH's comments on the recommendations as requested.

Best regards.

Drafted by: K. Zillner, AA O/DMS		Cleared by: N. Halde, SA to DSRSG	
-------------------------------------	--	--------------------------------------	--

Management Response

Audit of corrections advisory activities in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
1	MINUSTAH should reinforce its plan to enhance the capacity of the Government of Haiti in improving the conditions of inmates in prisons through: (a) coordinating with other United Nations agencies and international partners/donors to mobilize and allocate additional funding for prison improvement projects; and/or (b) tapping into the quick-impact project funds to finance more prison improvement projects.	Important	Yes	Corrections Advisory Unit	1 June 2013 1 July 2014	a) MINUSTAH Corrections Advisory Unit has initiated discussions with international stakeholders with the aim of soliciting additional funding for prison development projects aimed at improving detention and living conditions in prisons. b) MINUSTAH has been fulfilling its mandate to support the Directorate of Prison Administration (DAP) to improve on prison conditions through Quick Impact Projects (QIPs). In addition to existing QIPs, the Unit is planning to embark on other projects, details of which have been provided to the MINUSTAH Resident Auditors. In addition, strong efforts are being

¹ Critical recommendations address significant and/or pervasive deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

Management Response

Audit of corrections advisory activities in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
						made to secure funding from other sources which include international stakeholders such as the International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC) and Non-Governmental Organizations such as Health through walls.