



INTERNAL AUDIT DIVISION

REPORT 2017/133

Audit of camp closure and environmental clean-up in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

The Mission developed and implemented an action plan for the closure of camps but needed to consolidate Mission camps in Port-au-Prince to realize some cost savings and allocate additional resources to dispose of hazardous and non-hazardous waste

12 December 2017
Assignment No. AP2017/683/09

Audit of camp closure and environmental clean-up in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of camp closure and environmental clean-up in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH). The objective of the audit was to determine whether MINUSTAH had established and implemented procedures to effectively manage activities related to the closure of camps and environmental clean-up during the drawdown and liquidation period.

The audit covered the period from 13 April to 15 October 2017 and included a review of activities related to camp closure, termination of lease contracts and environmental clean-up.

The Mission developed and implemented an action plan for the closure of camps but needed to consolidate Mission camps in Port-au-Prince to realize some cost savings and allocate additional resources to dispose of hazardous and non-hazardous waste.

OIOS made five recommendations. To address issues identified in the audit, the MINUSTAH Liquidation Team needed to:

- Allocate resources to consolidate Mission facilities, in order to limit the number of occupied premises and realize cost savings for the Organization;
- Actively engage the Host Government to obtain a final and consolidated environmental clearance certificate from the Ministry of Environment covering all locations the Mission operated from since its inception as required by the Liquidation Manual.
- Conduct an inventory of the hazardous and non-hazardous waste stored at the Mission's property disposal yard and allocate additional staffing resources to the Property Disposal Unit during the liquidation period to enable the unit to safely dispose of the waste;
- Obtain supporting documentation to confirm that contractors dispose of waste at approved sites or facilities in accordance with international standards and safety measures and following local rules and regulations; and
- Officially notify the Host Government of the presence of errant unexploded ordnance at the Ganthier site and establish follow-up mechanisms to ensure that the site is free from ammunition or explosives.

The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team accepted all recommendations and has initiated action to implement them.

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	2
III. AUDIT RESULTS	2-6
A. Camp closure activities	2-3
B. Environmental clean-up	3-6
IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	6
 ANNEX I Status of audit recommendations	
 APPENDIX I Management response	

Audit of camp closure and environmental clean-up in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

I. BACKGROUND

1. The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of camp closure and environmental clean-up in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH).
2. The Security Council, by resolution 2350 (2017), authorized withdrawal of all military personnel of MINUSTAH by 15 October 2017 and established the United Nations Mission for Justice Support in Haiti (MINUJUSTH) as a follow-on peacekeeping mission, which is authorized to retain 7 formed police units reduced from MINUSTAH's current 11.
3. In a facsimile dated 10 May 2017, the Under-Secretary-General for Field Support decided that appointments of all MINUSTAH staff will end on 15 October 2017 and liquidation activities of MINUSTAH will be carried out by MINUJUSTH from 16 October through 31 December 2017 under a single support structure. However, the drawdown activities should commence immediately and be completed to the extent possible by 15 October 2017.
4. Additionally, in a facsimile dated 5 October 2017, the Under-Secretary-General for Field Support approved the retention of 51 posts (33 of which are to be retained until 30 November 2017) against MINUSTAH funding for tasks related to the liquidation. The functional support required for the Police, Engineering and Transport Sections, which totaled 18 posts, were extended until 31 December 2017.
5. Comments provided by the MINUSTAH Liquidation Team are incorporated in italics.

II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

6. The objective of the audit is to determine whether MINUSTAH has established and implemented procedures to effectively manage activities related to the closure of camps and environmental clean-up during the drawdown and liquidation period.
7. This audit was included in the 2017 risk-based work plan of OIOS due to the scheduled drawdown and closure of MINUSTAH and the related reputational and financial risks to the Organization.
8. OIOS conducted this audit in September and October 2017. The audit covered the period from 13 April 2017 to 15 October 2017. Based on an activity-level risk assessment, the audit covered higher and medium risks in the Mission's liquidation activities including the review of camp closure and environmental clean-up.
9. The audit methodology included: (a) interviews of key personnel, (b) reviews of relevant documentation, (c) analytical reviews of data, (d) random sample testing of five closed sites, and (e) physical inspection of camp closure activities at four sites located in Port-au-Prince, including the Mission disposal yard.
10. The audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing.

III. AUDIT RESULTS

A. Camp closure activities

MINUSTAH had developed and implemented an action plan for the closure of camps

11. The Liquidation Manual requires MINUSTAH to develop a written liquidation plan containing the parameters of the Mission's liquidation, including the closure of offices and the final withdrawal and disposal of the Mission's United Nations-owned assets. The Liquidation Manual also requires the Mission's engineering and procurement staff to arrange joint inspections of the premises with the landlord prior to handing over and agreeing on any repairs or refurbishment necessary. The MINUSTAH leases with private landowners require the Mission to restore the premises to their initial condition.

12. MINUSTAH prepared a liquidation plan, which included appropriate mitigation measures to ensure risks were well managed during its execution. The Chief of Mission Support appointed a Liquidation Coordinator and established two working groups, reporting to the Coordinator, responsible for camp closure and asset disposal. The Camp Closure Working Group comprised 10 staff, representing their respective self-accounting units (SAUs), who met 17 times during the audit period to: (a) identify activities related to the closure of camps; (b) establish a timetable to hand over 65 premises (including 33 United Nations Police co-locations) to their respective owners; and (c) discuss progress and challenges related to the camp closure activities. Staff on the Camp Closure Working Group also assisted their respective SAUs in preparing their activities in line with the liquidation plan.

13. A review of inspection records for a sample of five closed camps indicated that MINUSTAH staff from the Engineering and Procurement Sections and the Joint Logistics Operations Centre attended the site inspections and the landowners were either present or represented in all cases. The inspections of the premises were comprehensive and resulted in agreement on handover timelines and identification and documentation of actions that needed to be completed to ensure successful closure of the camps. As a result, the Mission successfully closed 57 premises and handed them back to their respective owners by 15 October 2017. MINUSTAH also obtained signed agreements from the owners clearing the United Nations from future claims for restoration works.

14. However, the Mission had not been able to close six military sites located in the Jaborandy camp and hand them over before 15 October 2017 as planned in agreement with the landowner. A site visit to the camp on 13 October 2017 conducted by the Environmental Compliance Unit indicated the dismantling of prefabricated buildings and the removal of bricks and concrete slabs were still ongoing. Furthermore, United Nations-owned equipment such as fuel tanks, drinking water bladders, water pipes and wooden boxes had not yet been removed from the camps.

15. The above occurred because of the late departure of military units due to the arrival of hurricane Irma. Also, MINUSTAH had not procured the required restorations services and did not have adequate staffing resources within the Engineering Section to carry out the necessary works after the departure of those military units. During the liquidation period, MINUSTAH allocated additional staffing resources to the Engineering Section to enable the Section to complete renovation works at the Jaborandy camp and restore the premises to their initial condition in agreement with the landowner. As a result, the Mission successfully closed the six military camps and handed them back to the owner on 7 November 2017.

16. OIOS concluded that MINUSTAH had developed and implemented an action plan for the closure of camps.

Need to consolidate Mission camps in Port-au-Prince to realize some cost savings for the Organization

17. The Liquidation Manual requires the Liquidation Team to assess the office space requirement in consideration of the drawdown plan of personnel and consolidate staff to limit the number of occupied premises to the absolute minimum.

18. The Liquidation Team had conducted an assessment of the office space requirement and determined that MINUSTAH facilities at the Delta camp, Container yard, and Transport office could be consolidated into the Log Base, Log Yard and the Jaborandy camp. The assessment indicated that it would take about 3.5 months to complete the relocation of these facilities. However, it was not implemented because staffing requirements of MINUJUSTH were not determined until July 2017. As a result, MINUSTAH did not allocate the required resources to execute the consolidation plan. The assessment conducted by the Liquidation Team also indicated that the implementation of the plan would require the Mission to spend \$130,000 a month for: (i) the recruitment of 66 individual contractors including technicians to operate 29 United Nations-owned forklifts to move containers between different locations; and (ii) one international and two national staff to provide guidance and supervision to individual contractors; and (iii) the rental of heavy plant equipment to compensate for the departure of the Military engineering units.

19. In August 2017, the Engineering Section had initiated action to obtain the services of a contractor to rent heavy plant equipment, including motor grader, wheel backhoe and vibratory road roller. However, as of 15 October 2017, the procurement exercise was still at the technical evaluation phase and the case file was missing because the Procurement Officer who was working on the case had left the Mission and the handover was not properly done. Subsequent to the audit, the Mission initiated a new procurement exercise and established a contract effective 20 November 2017.

20. Due to the inability to consolidate all MINUSTAH facilities into the Log Base, Log Yard and the Jaborandy camp during the drawdown period, the Mission could not realize cost savings related to rent payments and maintenance expenses totaling \$258,000 per month.

(1) The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should allocate resources to consolidate Mission facilities, in order to limit the number of occupied premises and realize cost savings for the Organization.

The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team accepted recommendation 1 and stated that implementation of the consolidation plan was ongoing, with a deadline of 31 December 2017. However, MINUJUSTH had decided to revise the original consolidation plan provided by MINUSTAH. Recommendation 1 remains open pending notification that Mission premises have been consolidated to meet the operational requirements of MINUJUSTH.

B. Environmental clean-up

Need to actively engage the Host Government to obtain environmental clearance certificate

21. The Liquidation Manual requires MINUSTAH, in coordination with the Host Government, to engage an independent surveyor to verify compliance with appropriate environmental standards; obtain a clearance certificate countersigned by a duly authorized representative of the Host Government for each vacated site; and to obtain a final environmental certificate from the Ministry of Environment.

22. MINUSTAH undertook environmental clean-up and obtained an environmental clearance certificate for each of the 11 vacated sites. For the five privately owned sites, the certificates were signed by the respective owners; and for the six government owned sites, the certificates were signed by individuals

duly authorized by the Prime Minister at the respective locations. A duly authorized representative signed all certificates on behalf of the Mission.

23. However, the Mission had not: (i) carried out joint site visits to all 11 vacated sites with representatives from the Ministry of Environment to observe the condition of sites before and after they were vacated and returned to the respective government entities; and (ii) engaged an independent surveyor and/or initiated discussion with the Host Government to agree on the modalities for obtaining a final and consolidated environmental clearance certificate from the Ministry of Environment covering all locations where the Mission has operated since its inception.

24. The above occurred because MINUSTAH had not actively engaged the Host Government to seek the appointment of representatives from the Ministry of Environment who will coordinate with the Mission on environmental related issues. As a result, there was a risk that appropriate environmental standards were not met at all vacated premises, risk of financial loss and reputational risk to the Organization in the event of dispute.

(2) The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should actively engage the Host Government to obtain a final and consolidated environmental clearance certificate from the Ministry of Environment covering all locations the Mission operated from since its inception as required by the Liquidation Manual.

The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team accepted recommendation 2 and stated that the Mission tried to contact the Host Government on various occasions without receiving a reply. However, an environmental certificate was obtained for every location that was handed over, countersigned by the property owner for private land and by a representative of the Government of Haiti for government properties. Recommendation 2 remains open pending receipt of evidence of efforts made by the MINUSTAH Liquidation Team to obtain a final and consolidated environmental clearance certificate from the Ministry of Environment covering all locations the Mission operated from since its inception.

Waste management and disposal procedures were not adequate

25. The Liquidation Manual requires MINUSTAH to properly dispose of all residual waste, create a waste collection schedule and collection points for different types of waste and follow up on where waste is disposed of throughout the Mission deployment area.

26. The Property Disposal Unit was responsible for disposing of contingents' waste through selected United Nations contractors. However, a site visit to the Mission's disposal yard on 11 October 2017 indicated the presence of large amounts of hazardous and non-hazardous waste that were pending disposal. For example, MINUSTAH had not disposed of:

- Medical waste ash deposits, which will require encapsulation prior to landfill;
- Fourteen concrete drums of medical waste that had already been encapsulated;
- Military kits such as flak jackets, helmets and a diverse range of broken equipment and furniture;
- Oil filters, solvents, lead acid batteries and other electronic waste;
- Used tyres, used oil drums, spent fluorescent lamps and other waste stored in an open area without roofing; and
- Large quantities of unidentified chemicals that needed to be treated on site prior to disposal.

27. Although waste disposal contractors had collected a total of 323,414 kilograms of scrap metal during the audit period, the Property Disposal Unit had not conducted site inspections or obtained

supporting documentation to confirm that the contractors had safely removed the scrap metals from the designated area and smelted or compacted the metal at approved sites or facilities in accordance with international standards, safety measures and local rules and regulations. This meant that MINUSTAH could not confirm whether contractors were disposing of waste at authorized disposal sites and in accordance with applicable requirements.

28. The above occurred because MINUSTAH did not adequately assess the quantity of waste held at the property disposal yard or allocate commensurate staffing resources to the Property Disposal Unit during the drawdown period to dispose of them. This happened even though it had been anticipated that departing contingents will hand over to the Property Disposal Unit large quantities of waste that had been accumulated over a long period of time. On 11 October 2017, the Property Disposal Unit comprised a national staff, a United Nations Volunteer and six individual contractors. These staff members were functioning without adequate guidance and supervision as the Chief of Property Management left the Mission in August 2017 on medical leave. Also, the morale of the staff was low as the Mission was approaching the end of its mandate and this had negatively impacted on their productivity. On 16 October 2017, the Mission's property disposal yard was closed since all the MINUSTAH staff had departed while the MINUSTAH staff had not yet arrived in the Mission. Subsequent to the audit, the Liquidation Team assigned two staff members to the Property Disposal Unit.

- (3) The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should conduct an assessment of the volume of hazardous and non-hazardous waste held at the Mission's property disposal yard and allocate additional staffing resources to the Property Disposal Unit during the liquidation period to enable the unit to safely dispose of the waste.**

The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team accepted recommendation 3 and stated that a memorandum for the hiring of additional individual contractors to carry out the tasks including the incineration of medical waste and the encapsulation of incineration ashes had been approved. Recommendation 3 remains open pending receipt of evidence that adequate human resources have been deployed to safely dispose of hazardous and non-hazardous waste.

- (4) The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should obtain supporting documentation to confirm that contractors dispose of waste at approved sites or facilities in accordance with international standards and safety measures and following local rules and regulations.**

The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team accepted recommendation 4 and stated that it would contact the scrap contractor to get confirmation that the waste collected had been disposed of in accordance with the laws and regulations of Haiti. Recommendation 4 remains open pending receipt of copies of the documentation.

Need to notify the Host Government of the presence of errant unexploded ordnance at the Ganthier site

29. The Liquidation Manual requires MINUSTAH to dispose of waste from explosive ordnance dumps by qualified military explosive ordnance disposal personnel in a safe, orderly and fully documented manner.

30. In August 2017, at the request of MINUSTAH, a team from the United Nations Mine Action Services (UNMAS) destroyed expired ammunition to clear the Ganthier site previously used by the Mission for the demolition of expired ammunition and explosives. The team provided a battle area clearance certificate to MINUSTAH as evidence that no ammunition or explosives remained at the site. However, a review of the UNMAS report indicated the presence of significant quantities of errant unexploded ordnance in the surrounding areas. The UNMAS teams had also determined that the quantity and types of

ammunitions found at the site pre-dated the deployment of MINUSTAH and they were possibly fired by the former Haitian Armed Forces.

31. The Mission was considering the possibility of officially notifying the Host Government of the situation. However, as at 15 October 2017, the Chief of Mission Support indicated that the issue had been raised to New York headquarters for guidance but could not confirm if the senior management had formally notified the Host Government due to the closure of the Mission. Since there were people living in close proximity to the site, there was an urgent need to engage the Host Government to clear the area of ammunition or explosives in order to prevent deaths or injuries of the local population and avert a potential reputation risk for the Mission, even though MINUSTAH was not responsible for the errant unexploded ordnance.

(5) The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should officially notify the Host Government of the presence of errant unexploded ordnance at the Ganthier site and establish follow-up mechanisms to ensure that the site is free from ammunition or explosive.

The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team accepted recommendation 5 and stated that the Mission would officially notify the Government of Haiti and establish follow-up mechanisms to ensure in liaison with UNMAS that the site is free from ammunition or explosives. Recommendation 5 remains open pending receipt of documentation confirming that the Host Government has been duly informed about the errant unexploded ordnance in order for it to take action to free the Ganthier site from ammunition or explosives.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

32. OIOS wishes to express its appreciation to the management and staff of MINUSTAH and MINUJUSTH for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.

(Signed) Eleanor T. Burns
Director, Internal Audit Division
Office of Internal Oversight Services

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of camp closure and environmental clean-up in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
1.	The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should allocate resources to consolidate Mission facilities, in order to limit the number of occupied premises and realize cost savings for the Organization.	Important	O	Receipt of notification that Mission premises have been consolidated to meet the operational requirements of MINUJUSTH.	31 December 2017
2.	The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should actively engage the Host Government to obtain a final and consolidated environmental clearance certificate from the Ministry of Environment covering all locations the Mission operated from since its inception as required by the Liquidation Manual.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of efforts made by the MINUSTAH Liquidation Team to obtain a final and consolidated environmental clearance certificate from the Ministry of Environment covering all locations the Mission operated from since its inception.	31 December 2017
3.	The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should conduct an assessment of the volume of hazardous and non-hazardous waste held at the Mission's property disposal yard and allocate additional staffing resources to the Property Disposal Unit during the liquidation period to enable the unit to safely dispose of the waste.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that adequate human resources have been deployed to safely dispose of hazardous and non-hazardous waste.	31 December 2017
4.	The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should obtain supporting documentation to confirm that contractors dispose of waste at approved sites or facilities in accordance with international standards and safety measures and following local rules and regulations.	Important	O	Receipt of documentation to confirm that contractors have disposed of waste at approved sites or facilities in accordance with international standards and safety measures and following local rules and regulations	31 December 2017
5.	The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should officially notify the Host Government of the presence of errant unexploded ordnance at the	Important	O	Receipt of documentation confirming that the Host Government has been duly informed about the errant unexploded ordnance in order for it to	31 December 2017

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

³ C = closed, O = open

⁴ Date provided by the MINUSTAH Liquidation Team in response to recommendations.

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of camp closure and environmental clean-up in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical/ Important²	C/ O³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date⁴
	Ganthier site and establish follow-up mechanisms to ensure that the site is free from ammunition or explosive.			take action to free the Ganthier site from ammunition or explosives.	

APPENDIX I

Management Response

Management Response

Audit of camp closure and environmental clean-up in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
1	The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should allocate resources to consolidate Mission facilities, in order to limit the number of occupied premises and realize cost savings for the Organization.	Important	Yes	Chief, Operations and Resource Management.	31 December 2017	Consolidation plan is ongoing, deadline is 31 December 2017, and below are the following action: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1- Jaborandy camp closed on 07 November 2017; 2- SRSG residence planned to be closed on 30 November 2017; 3- Container Yard planned to be closed on 31 December 2017. However, as the follow-on Mission, MINUJUSTH has decided to revise the original consolidation plan provided by MINUSTAH, the amended / new consolidation plan should be addressed to MINUJUSTH.
2	The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should actively engage the Host Government to obtain a final and consolidated environmental clearance certificate from the Ministry of Environment covering all locations the Mission operated from since its inception as required by the Liquidation Manual.	Important	Yes	Chief, Operations and Resource Management.	31 December 2017	Clarification: para 4.12.4 states that “a clearance certificate for each vacated site, countersigned by the representative from Ministry of Environment <i>where possible</i> . An example can be found in Annex M” The Mission tried to contact the Government of Haiti on various occasions without receiving a reply. Copies of communications/Note

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

Management Response

Audit of camp closure and environmental clean-up in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
						<p>Verbal are available. The Mission's request to have a focal point within the Ministry of Environment was not attended. However, the Mission has worked hard to ensure every site is handover in compliance with the DPKO-DFS Environmental Policy and DPKO-DFS Waste Management Policy and Environmental Certificates has been obtained for every location that has been handed over counter signed by the property owner (for private land) and by a representative of the Government of Haiti (for government properties).</p> <p>MINUSTAH did its best in contacting the government on this issue without any feedback.</p>
3	The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should conduct an assessment of the volume of hazardous and non-hazardous waste held at the Mission's property disposal yard and allocate additional staffing resources to the Property Disposal Unit during the liquidation period to enable the unit to safely dispose of the waste.	Important	Yes	Chief, Operations and Resource Management.	31 December 2017	A memo for the hiring of additional ICs to carry out the task in addition to carry out the incineration of medical waste and the encapsulation of incineration ashes has been submitted and approved.
4	The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should obtain supporting documentation to confirm that contractors dispose of waste at approved sites or facilities in accordance with international standards and safety measures and following local rules and regulations.	Important	Yes	Chief, Operations and Resource Management.	31 December 2017	The Property Management Section Liquidation Team will contact the scrap contractor to get confirmation that indeed the waste collected is in accordance with the laws and regulations of the Government of Haiti.

Management Response

Audit of camp closure and environmental clean-up in the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
5	The MINUSTAH Liquidation Team should officially notify the Host Government of the presence of errant unexploded ordnance at the Ganthier site and establish follow-up mechanisms to ensure that the site is free from ammunition or explosive.	Important	Yes	Chief, Operations and Resource Management.	31 December 2017	The Mission will officially notify the Government of Haiti and establish follow up mechanisms to ensure in liaison with UNMAS that the site is free from ammunition or explosive.