



INTERNAL AUDIT DIVISION

REPORT 2019/052

Audit of the Ninth session of the World Urban Forum convened by the United Nations Human Settlements Programme

There was need to strengthen the arrangements for organizing the World Urban Forum and enhancing its impact

25 June 2019
Assignment No. AA2019/250/01

Audit of the Ninth session of the World Urban Forum convened by the United Nations Human Settlements Programme

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of the Ninth session of the World Urban Forum (WUF9) convened and organized by the United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat). The objective of the audit was to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of UN-Habitat's governance, risk management and control processes over the effective management of WUF9. The audit covered the period from 2017 to 2019 and included a review of: strategic management; financial management; and performance monitoring and reporting.

The audit indicated the need to strengthen the arrangements for organizing the World Urban Forum (WUF) and enhancing its impact.

OIOS made six important recommendations. To address the issues identified in the audit, UN-Habitat needed to:

- Strengthen results-based management by revising the WUF project document to include the achievement of expected impact and outcomes in accordance with UN-Habitat's strategic goals;
- Make the WUF an integral part of the work plans of its branches and regional offices to ensure accountability for achievement of results;
- Include resource mobilization as part of the events at future WUFs;
- Establish a mechanism to ensure that resources disbursed on its behalf by other entities for WUF activities are properly monitored and fully accounted for;
- Ensure that reports of the WUF are prepared in a timely manner for use by internal and external stakeholders; and
- Improve the mechanism for monitoring the implementation of key activities and achievement of expected outcomes of WUFs.

UN-Habitat accepted the recommendations and has initiated action to implement them.

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
I. BACKGROUND	1-2
II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	2
III. AUDIT RESULTS	2-7
A. Strategic management	2-5
B. Financial management	5-6
C. Performance monitoring and reporting	6-7
IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	7
ANNEX I Status of audit recommendations	
APPENDIX I Management response	

Audit of the Ninth session of the World Urban Forum convened by the United Nations Human Settlements Programme

I. BACKGROUND

1. The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of the Ninth session of the World Urban Forum (WUF9) convened and organized by the United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat).

2. The General Assembly mandated UN-Habitat to promote socially and environmentally sustainable towns and cities with the goal of providing adequate shelter. UN-Habitat has an important role under the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, especially Goal 11 of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) on making cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable. Furthermore, in its resolution 71/256, the General Assembly underlined the role of UN-Habitat as a focal point on sustainable urbanization and human settlements, in the implementation, follow-up to and review of the New Urban Agenda.

3. In its resolution 69/226 of 19 December 2014, the General Assembly recognized the World Urban Forum (WUF) as the foremost global arena for interaction among policymakers, local government leaders, non-governmental organizations and expert practitioners in the field of sustainable urban development and human settlements. UN-Habitat has convened this non-legislative technical forum since 2002 in accordance with General Assembly resolution 56/206. In 2012, UN-Habitat established a WUF secretariat to coordinate the Forum's activities.

4. The Governing Council of UN-Habitat, in resolution 26/6 of May 2017, requested the Executive Director of UN-Habitat to "improve and define a timely planning process, for UN-Habitat itself and for all external stakeholders involved, based on a results-based framework, identifying clearly focused objectives and measurable indicators of success, designing conducive event formats and strengthening reporting mechanisms to enable the effective collection of the substantive outcomes of sessions of the Forum."

5. UN-Habitat convened WUF9 in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia in February 2018. WUF9 was aimed at renewing global commitment in the implementation of the New Urban Agenda as an accelerator for the achievement of the Agenda 2030 and SDGs. The goals of WUF9 were defined as follows:

- (a) Raise awareness of sustainable urbanization among stakeholders and constituencies, including the general public;
- (b) Improve the collective knowledge of sustainable urban development through inclusive open debates, sharing of lessons learned and the exchange of best practices and good policies;
- (c) Increase coordination and cooperation between different stakeholders and constituencies for the advancement and implementation of sustainable urbanization; and
- (d) Provide a platform to incorporate the inputs of multilateral organizations and stakeholders into the reporting of the implementation of the New Urban Agenda.

6. WUF9 had a budget of \$6 million that was funded by the Government of Malaysia with \$4 million disbursed to UN-Habitat and \$2 million to be disbursed upon written authorization and on behalf of UN-Habitat. During the period 2017 to 2019, the WUF9 secretariat employed 11 staff members (four Professional and seven General Service).

7. Comments provided by UN-Habitat are incorporated in italics.

II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

8. The objective of the audit was to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of UN-Habitat's governance, risk management and control processes over the effective management of WUF9.

9. This audit was included in the 2019 risk-based work plan of OIOS due to the risk that potential weaknesses in management of WUF9 may have an adverse impact on achievement of its objectives.

10. OIOS conducted this audit in March and April 2019. The audit covered the period from 2017 to 2019. Based on an activity-level risk assessment, the audit covered risks areas relating to WUF9 which included strategic management, financial management, and performance monitoring and reporting.

11. The audit methodology included: (a) interviews with key personnel; (b) review of relevant documentation; (c) analytical review of data; and (d) sample testing of transactions.

12. The audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing.

III. AUDIT RESULTS

A. Strategic management

13. WUF9 organized by UN-Habitat in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia from 7 to 13 February 2018 was attended by over 24,000 participants from 164 countries, which was the highest for any WUF so far. It involved more than 600 events including 143 networking events, 168 side events, 96 exhibition booths, 60 training events, 33 "One United Nations" events, 33 launches of publications, 30 "Listen to Cities" events, six High-Level Roundtables, one Ministers' roundtable, 21 special sessions, 15 stakeholders' roundtables and many city events. However, as discussed below, there are significant opportunities for UN-Habitat to maximize the impact of future WUFs.

14. In resolution GC23/5 of April 2011, Committee of Permanent Representatives (CPR) of the Governing Council recommended that UN-Habitat adopt results-based management (RBM) for WUFs and focus on impact and outcomes. UN-Habitat defined impact as "changes in people's lives" and outcomes as "changes in institutional and behavioural capacities for development of conditions that occur between completion of outputs and the achievement of goals".

15. According to the UN-Habitat RBM handbook, "RBM is not a tool; it is a mindset, a way of working that looks beyond processes, activities, products and services to focus on the actual social and economic benefits of projects and programmes at the level of beneficiaries. RBM is a system, and like all systems its components must work harmoniously and cohesively for it to be effective". Some of the key elements of RBM are: (a) focusing the dialogue on results at all phases of the development process; (b) aligning programming, monitoring and evaluation with results; (c) keeping measurement and reporting simple; (d) managing for, not by results; and (e) using results information for learning and decision-making.

16. A basic principle of results planning is to start with the desired change (impact and outcomes) and then identify the outputs, activities and inputs required to achieve them. This requires a thorough analysis of the problem that needs to be solved, the changes that are desired, and the activities and inputs that are

necessary to achieve them. Planning lays the basis for implementation, monitoring, reporting and evaluation processes, and directs all steps in their proper sequence.

17. OIOS identified the following areas that need to be strengthened in the strategic planning for future WUFs.

Need for clear expected impact and outcomes of WUF9

18. UN-Habitat is mandated to promote socially and environmentally sustainable towns and cities with the goal of providing adequate shelter for all. In the 2014-2019 strategic plan and related work programmes and budgets for 2016-2017 and 2018-2019, UN-Habitat's goals were to promote "well-planned, well-governed and efficient cities and other human settlements with adequate infrastructure and universal access to employment, land and basic services including housing, water, sanitation, energy and transport".

19. On 25 September 2015, 193 countries adopted 17 SDGs to end poverty, protect the planet and ensure prosperity. Each goal has specific targets to be achieved by 2030. United Nations funds and programmes, including UN-Habitat, work to achieve these goals. For example, UN-Habitat has important roles regarding achievement of Goal 11 on making cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable. In addition, as a focal point for the New Urban Agenda, UN-Habitat has a role to ensure coherent, effective and timely implementation of the Agenda and report on the impact achieved.

20. The expected impact and outcome of WUF9 were not clearly defined and aligned to the UN-Habitat 2014-2019 strategic framework, work programmes and budget (2016-2017 and 2018-2019), and Agenda 2030 on SDGs. The lack of specific and measurable impact and outcomes were noted in the following:

(a) UN-Habitat presented to the CPR a "WUF Results Based Approach" which did not have specific and measurable expected impact and outcomes.

(b) UN-Habitat also presented to the CPR the "Vision and Strategy" for WUF which articulated a "WUF9 Results Oriented Framework" with five expected accomplishments. However, there were no specific and measurable expected results of how WUF9 would change people's lives.

(c) The project document for WUF that was reviewed and approved by UN-Habitat's Project Appraisal Group (PAG) did not have specific and measurable expected impact and outcomes. While the document mentioned five expected accomplishments with related output indicators, these were not aligned to eventual impact and outcomes.

(d) There was no logical connection between WUF9 activities and expected accomplishments.

(e) The risk assessment in the project document was focused on addressing risks of hosting an event and not the risks to realization of strategic impact and outcomes of WUF9.

21. While all UN-Habitat branches and regional offices were requested to provide inputs for the logical framework for the Forum, the inputs were not consolidated into a single logical framework for UN-Habitat as a whole. Such consolidation of inputs should have enabled proper alignment of WUF9's expected accomplishments with those of UN-Habitat.

22. During a PAG meeting held on 25 October 2017, one participant raised concerns about the lack of results orientation of WUF9. The participant had observed that the project document for WUF was only output-oriented and not results-oriented. Therefore, the "so what" questions needed to be answered at the level of expected accomplishment if WUF was to be transformative. These questions included: "What

global, regional, local transformations do we expect from WUF? How do we measure these transformations? What is the expected return on WUF investments? What global benefits or transformations have occurred as a result of past WUFs?” There was no evidence that these concerns were addressed to enhance the effectiveness of WUF9.

23. In the absence of a clear results chain linking WUF activities with specific and measurable expected results in terms of impact and outcomes, it was not possible to objectively assess whether WUF9 effectively supported the achievement of UN-Habitat’s strategic goals and the 2030 Agenda on Sustainable Development.

24. UN-Habitat explained that it would improve the results-based planning of WUF10 by engaging a consultant to prepare a consolidated logical framework that would actively involve the branches and regional offices. The consolidated logical framework would guide WUF10 events and the 6-year WUF programme.

(1) UN-Habitat should strengthen results-based management by revising the World Urban Forum project document to include the achievement of expected impact and outcomes in accordance with UN-Habitat’s strategic goals.

UN-Habitat accepted recommendation 1 and stated that it would further link the results framework of WUF with the recently approved strategic plan 2020-2023 in coordination with PAG. Recommendation 1 remains open pending receipt of the revised WUF project document.

Need for accountability and clear roles and responsibilities for results

25. The UN-Habitat RBM handbook requires definition of clear roles and responsibilities for accountability for results. “The committing to results management requires that staff and management be held accountable for appropriate levels of results. This requires ownership of the process of developing and implementing results.”

26. The roles and responsibilities for achievement of specific and measurable results for Branches and Regional Offices before, during and after the WUF were not clearly defined to facilitate accountability for achievement of UN-Habitat strategic results. Key staff indicated that WUF9 activities were not integrated into UN-Habitat’s substantive work to enhance accountability for results. Key staff were not aware of specific action plans and related responsibilities that they were accountable for after WUF9.

27. According to some staff interviewed, previous WUFs were integrated in UN-Habitat’s substantive activities while the WUF secretariat provided logistical support. In this way, accountability was safeguarded. But in the case of WUF9, the involvement of substantive staff in development of the concept note and project document was limited. The concept note was developed by the host government with input from UN-Habitat. While travel funds were provided for staff to attend WUF9, limited or no resources were available for substantive preparation which are critical to achieving results. UN-Habitat stated that significant changes were underway in preparation for WUF10 that was to be held in Abu-Dhabi in 2020.

(2) UN-Habitat should make the World Urban Forum an integral part of the work plans of its branches and regional offices to ensure accountability for achievement of results.

UN-Habitat accepted recommendation 2 and stated that as part of WUF planning, it will ensure that organizational units will include WUF-related activities in their annual workplan. Recommendation 2 remains open pending receipt of the annual work plans of branches and regional offices that include WUF-related activities.

Need for a targeted resource mobilization plan

28. UN-Habitat's resource mobilization plans for 2016-2017 and 2018-2019 focused on increasing its resource base to effectively execute its mandate of sustainable urbanization. The expected accomplishments included the following: (a) increasing levels of non-earmarked funding; (b) broadening the donor base; (c) improving donor relationship through enhanced trust, transparency and accountability; and (d) efficient and effective coordinated decentralized fund raising. In 2016-2017, UN-Habitat's main funding sources were governments (76.5 per cent), the United Nations (13.6 per cent) and the private sector (4.4 per cent). Local governments and civil society contributed 1.9 per cent each, whereas others accounted for 1.7 per cent.

29. While UN-Habitat succeeded in mobilizing some resources at WUF9, the project document did not include a targeted resource mobilization plan for the Forum. Implementation of a targeted resource mobilization plan at WUFs could reduce the funding gaps. For example, as of November 2017, UN-Habitat projected funding gaps for 2018-2019 in one out of four regional offices and five out of seven branches. Given the significant interest and participation generated by WUF9, the Forum may provide an opportunity for greater engagement of existing donors and expansion of potential donors.

(3) UN-Habitat should include resource mobilization as part of the events at future World Urban Forums.

UN-Habitat accepted recommendation 3 and stated that its External Relations Division will work with the Resource Mobilization Unit and substantive teams to develop a clear and coherent resource mobilization plan by December 2019. Recommendation 3 remains open pending receipt of the resource mobilization plan for the WUF.

B. Financial management

Host country provided contributions in accordance with the agreement

30. The Government of Malaysia agreed to contribute \$6 million to UN-Habitat towards the cost of hosting WUF9 in terms of the host agreement signed on 10 March 2017. The \$6 million was to be used for expenditure listed in Annex II of the agreement. The Government was to disburse \$4 million directly to UN-Habitat and \$2 million was to be disbursed by the Government upon written authorization on behalf of UN-Habitat.

31. UN-Habitat received the \$4 million from the host country in June 2017. As of March 2019, total expenditures and commitments amounted to \$3,984,010 leaving a surplus of \$15,989. The expenditure was mainly for travel (\$1.8 million) and staff-related costs (\$1.5 million).

Need to establish an accountability mechanism for funds received from the host country

32. In terms of Article IV of the host country agreement, the Government would deposit \$2 million with UN-Habitat by 31 March 2017, and a further \$2 million by 31 July 2017. The Government would further disburse on behalf of and with the written authorization of UN-Habitat the remaining sum of \$2 million for expenditures agreed and set out in Annex II of the agreement.

33. On 16 January 2018, the Government of Malaysia informed UN-Habitat of its decision to appoint Entity A under the Ministry of Urban Well-Being, Housing and Local Government to manage the financial arrangements for the \$2 million that was to be disbursed on behalf of UN-Habitat.

34. On 23 January 2018, UN-Habitat authorized the Government of Malaysia to disburse the \$2 million to Entity A for expenditures set out in Annex II of the agreement. UN-Habitat stated that it “would require official documents on the expenses incurred”.

35. UN-Habitat did not develop and implement adequate mechanisms to oversee the utilization of the \$2 million by Entity A on WUF9. For example:

(a) There was no detailed budget of what costs Entity A was to incur for WUF9. Notably, Annex II did not distinguish the expenditure to be incurred by UN-Habitat and Entity A. Instead, it listed activities to be financed from the entire \$6 million under the host country agreement.

(b) The authorization by UN-Habitat to the host country did not provide details of the expenditure that was to be incurred.

(c) UN-Habitat did not monitor the utilization and deliverables of the \$2 million. No official documents on expenditures incurred were available during the audit. Nevertheless, in October 2018, January 2019 and March 2019, UN-Habitat requested Entity A to provide a statement of expenditure for the \$2 million but this was yet to be received as of 12 April 2019.

36. UN-Habitat stated that it was working with the host country of WUF10 to identify the costs to be paid directly into UN-Habitat’s account and the remaining balance to be kept by the host country to spend in-country as per UN-Habitat instructions.

(4) UN-Habitat should establish a mechanism to ensure that resources disbursed on its behalf by other entities for World Urban Forum activities are properly monitored and fully accounted for.

UN-Habitat accepted recommendation 4 and stated that it will work with the Government of Malaysia to obtain a full accounting on the use of funds disbursed to Entity A on its behalf. UN-Habitat stated that it is also working with the WUF10 host country to agree on standard operating procedures and detailed budget for the funds to spend in-country. Recommendation 4 remains open pending receipt of evidence that an accountability mechanism has been established for monitoring and accounting of funds to be disbursed on behalf of UN-Habitat at WUF10.

C. Performance monitoring and reporting

Need to ensure timely and effective reporting

37. UN-Habitat had committed to the CPR to deliver the WUF9 report to the Governing Council by October 2018. As of March 2019, almost one year after the WUF9 was convened, the report of the Forum was not finalized. Untimely reporting of results of WUF9 to the Governing Council and other stakeholders could have an adverse impact on the reputation of UN-Habitat and affect its ability to prepare key reports such as the Secretary-General’s quadrennial report on the New Urban Agenda for which WUF9 was meant to provide input. Also, delays in reporting represent a lost opportunity to immediately communicate tangible outcomes of the WUF and demonstrate the usefulness of the Forum to stakeholders.

38. UN-Habitat stated that the Executive Director had already established a WUF10 Task Force under the Chairmanship of the Director, External Relations Division. The Chair had also set up ‘Mini Task Groups’ to manage various work streams of WUF10 including ‘reporting.’ To ensure the timely preparation and dissemination of the WUF10 report, a reporting team would stay behind in Abu Dhabi for an additional week to complete a draft report for the relevant governing body’s review and clearance.

(5) UN-Habitat should ensure that reports of the World Urban Forum are prepared in a timely manner for use by internal and external stakeholders.

UN-Habitat accepted recommendation 5 and stated that in the Secretary-General's report A/73/307 to the General Assembly, UN-Habitat committed to submit the final report to the UN-Habitat governing body in 2019. Accordingly, UN-Habitat finalized the final report of WUF9 and submitted it to the first session of the UN-Habitat Assembly held from 27-31 May 2019. Recommendation 5 remains open pending receipt of evidence of the measures taken to ensure that reports of the WUF are finalized in a timely manner.

Need to improve the performance monitoring

39. According to the UN-Habitat RBM handbook, monitoring is a continuous or periodic process that provides performance information on the degree of progress made towards achievement of desired change or results at a particular time. Accordingly, the WUF project document was required to be updated with the progress on expected accomplishments every six months, and for outputs and activities to be updated monthly in the Project Accrual and Accountability System (PAAS).

40. There were inadequate mechanisms to monitor the achievement of results intended for WUF9. There were no action plans detailing the activities, milestones, responsibilities and accountability for what would happen after WUF9. Essential information for monitoring purposes was generally not updated in PAAS as required, and the related responsibility and accountability were not clearly spelled out. Without effective monitoring, UN-Habitat may be unable to determine the extent of implementation of post-WUF9 activities and demonstrate the achievement of the desired outcome.

(6) UN-Habitat should improve the mechanism for monitoring the implementation of key activities and achievement of expected outcomes of World Urban Forums.

UN-Habitat accepted recommendation 6 and stated that it would develop a logical framework that will provide the WUF Unit with monitoring mechanisms of key activities and achievement of expected outcomes and impact of the WUF by proposing key performance indicators. Moreover, the Evaluation Unit will also guide the WUF Unit on the requisite structures and processes to put in place as monitoring mechanisms. Recommendation 6 remains open pending receipt of evidence that the mechanism for monitoring key activities and achievement of expected outcomes of WUFs has been strengthened.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

41. OIOS wishes to express its appreciation to the management and staff of UN-Habitat for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.

(Signed) Eleanor T. Burns
Director, Internal Audit Division
Office of Internal Oversight Services

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of the Ninth session of the World Urban Forum convened by the United Nations Human Settlements Programme

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
1	UN-Habitat should strengthen results-based management by revising the World Urban Forum project document to include the achievement of expected impact and outcomes in accordance with UN-Habitat's strategic goals.	Important	O	Receipt of the revised WUF project document.	31 December 2019
2	UN-Habitat should make the World Urban Forum an integral part of the work plans of its branches and regional offices to ensure accountability for achievement of results.	Important	O	Receipt of the annual work plans of branches and regional offices that include WUF-related activities.	31 December 2019
3	UN-Habitat should include resource mobilization as part of the events at future World Urban Forums.	Important	O	Receipt of the resource mobilization plan for the WUF.	31 December 2019
4	UN-Habitat should establish a mechanism to ensure that resources disbursed on its behalf by other entities for World Urban Forum activities are properly monitored and fully accounted for.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that an accountability mechanism has been established for monitoring and accounting of funds to be disbursed on behalf of UN-Habitat at WUF10.	31 December 2019
5	UN-Habitat should ensure that reports of the World Urban Forum are prepared in a timely manner for use by internal and external stakeholders.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of the measures taken to ensure that reports of the WUF are finalized in a timely manner.	31 December 2019
6	UN-Habitat should improve the mechanism for monitoring the implementation of key activities and achievement of expected outcomes of World Urban Forums.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that the mechanism for monitoring key activities and achievement of expected outcomes of WUFs has been strengthened.	31 December 2019

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

³ C = closed, O = open

⁴ Date provided by UN-Habitat in response to recommendations.

APPENDIX I

Management Response

UN HABITAT
UNITED NATIONS HUMAN SETTLEMENTS PROGRAMME
Programme des Nations Unies pour les établissements humains
OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

Ref: UNH-OED-OL-190531-05

Nairobi, 20 June 2019

Dear Mr. Gurpur

Subject: UN-Habitat comments on the Draft report on an audit of the Ninth session of the World Urban Forum convened by the United Nations Human Settlements Programme (Assignment No. AA2019/250/01)

Dear Mr. Kumar

I am pleased to present our comments to the above-mentioned detailed results in the attached document as well as the Annex 1.

Furthermore, I would like to propose the following factual clarifications:

- Paragraph 37: In the report A/73/307 from the UN Secretary-General to the General Assembly, UN-Habitat committed to submit the final report to its Governing Body in 2019. While the draft report was yet not ready by October 2018 as observed by OIOS, it was finalised and submitted on time to the UN-Habitat Assembly held from 27-31 May 2019.
- Paragraph 38: replace “CPR” with “relevant governing body” to reflect the new governance structure of UN-Habitat.

UN-Habitat is pleased to accept all audit recommendations and I would like to take this opportunity to thank OIOS for the services provided to UN-Habitat.

Yours sincerely,



Maimunah Mohd Sharif
Under-Secretary-General and
Executive Director

Mr. Gurpur N. Kumar, Deputy Director
Internal Audit Division, OIOS

Management Response

Audit of the Ninth session of the World Urban Forum convened by the United Nations Human Settlements Programme

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
1	UN-Habitat should strengthen results-based management by revising the World Urban Forum project document to include the achievement of expected impact and outcomes in accordance with UN-Habitat's strategic goals.	Important	Yes	Director, External Relations Division	31 December 2019	UN-Habitat accepts the recommendation. UN-Habitat would further link the result framework of WUF with the recently approved strategic plan 2020-2023 in coordination with the Programme Advisory Group.
2	UN-Habitat should make the World Urban Forum an integral part of the work plans of its branches and regional offices to ensure accountability for achievement of results.	Important	Yes	Director, External Relations Division	31 December 2019	UN-Habitat accepts the recommendation As part of the WUF planning, UN-Habitat will ensure that organizational units will include WUF related activities in their annual workplan.
3	UN-Habitat should include resource mobilization as part of the events at future World Urban Forums.	Important	Yes	Director, External Relations Division	31 December 2019	UN-Habitat accepts the recommendation External Relations Division will work with the Resource Mobilization Unit and substantive teams to develop a clear and coherent resource mobilization plan by December 2019.

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

Management Response

Audit of the Ninth session of the World Urban Forum convened by the United Nations Human Settlements Programme

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
4	UN-Habitat should establish a mechanism to ensure that resources disbursed on its behalf by other entities for World Urban Forum activities are properly monitored and fully accounted for.	Important	Yes	Director, External Relations Division	31 December 2019	<p>UN-Habitat accepts the recommendation.</p> <p>UN-Habitat will work with the Government of Malaysia to obtain a full accounting on the use of funds disbursed to Entity A on its behalf.</p> <p>UN-Habitat is also working with WUF 10 host country to agree on standard operating procedures which incorporate procedures for financial reporting and detailed budget of the funds to be spent in the country.</p>
5	UN-Habitat should ensure that reports of the World Urban Forum are prepared in a timely manner for use by internal and external stakeholders.	Important	Yes	Director, External Relations Division	31 December 2019	<p>UN-Habitat accepts the recommendation.</p> <p>In the report A/73/307 from the UN Secretary-General to the General Assembly, UN-Habitat committed to submit the final report to the UN-Habitat Governing Body in 2019.</p> <p>Accordingly, UN-Habitat finalized the final report of WUF 9 and submitted it to the first session of the UN-Habitat Assembly held from 27-31 May 2019.</p>

Management Response

Audit of the Ninth session of the World Urban Forum convened by the United Nations Human Settlements Programme

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
6	UN-Habitat should improve the mechanism for monitoring the implementation of key activities and achievement of expected outcomes of World Urban Forums.	Important	Yes	Director, External Relations Division	31 December 2019	UN-Habitat accepts the recommendation UN-Habitat would develop a logical framework that will provide the WUF Unit with monitoring mechanisms of key activities and achievement of expected outcomes and impacts of the WUF by proposing key performance indicators. Moreover, the Evaluation Unit will also guide the WUF Unit on the requisite structures and processes to put in place as monitoring mechanisms.