



INTERNAL AUDIT DIVISION

REPORT 2017/054

Audit of ground transport operations in the United Nations Organization Stabilization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo

There was a need to make the Road Safety Committee functional, deactivate all expired driving permits and implement a vehicle idling reduction strategy

23 June 2017

Assignment No. AP2016/620/04

Audit of ground transport operations in the United Nations Organization Stabilization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The objective of the audit was to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of governance, risk management and control processes over ground transport operations in the United Nations Organization Stabilization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo (MONUSCO). The audit covered the period from 1 January 2015 to 30 September 2016 and included reviews of oversight and monitoring of vehicle operations and issuance and control of driving permits. The audit did not cover the repair and maintenance of vehicle which was covered in a separate audit in 2016, and rental of vehicles which was covered as part of the audit of outsourced services.

MONUSCO had: properly constituted its Vehicle Establishment Committee; implemented adequate and effective controls over the liberty use of its vehicles; and ensured that all serviceable vehicles were covered by third-party insurance. However, the Mission needed to make the Road Safety Committee functional, deactivate all expired driving permits and implement a vehicle idling reduction strategy.

OIOS made three recommendations. To address issues identified in the audit, MONUSCO needed to:

- Take effective action to ensure that the Road Safety Committee performs its mandated functions;
- Implement a vehicle idling reduction strategy and a monitoring and reduction mechanism; and
- Deactivate all expired or unreturned driving permits.

MONUSCO accepted the recommendations and initiated action to implement them.

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	1
III. OVERALL CONCLUSION	1
IV. AUDIT RESULTS	2-5
A. Oversight of vehicle operations	2-3
B. Utilization and insurance of vehicles	3-4
C. Issuance and control of driving permits	4-5
V. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	5
APPENDIX I Management response	

Audit of ground transport operations in the United Nations Organization Stabilization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo

I. BACKGROUND

1. The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of ground transport operations in the United Nations Organization Stabilization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo (MONUSCO).
2. The MONUSCO Transport Section is responsible for managing and maintaining light passenger and heavy commercial vehicles, specialized equipment and motorcycles. As at 30 September 2016, MONUSCO had 1,493 light passenger vehicles, 265 heavy commercial vehicles, 277 specialized equipment and 19 motorcycles, all at a combined cost of \$91 million.
3. The Transport Section is headed by a staff at the P-5 level who reports to the Chief, Service Delivery and is supported by 366 staff comprising 319 national staff, 28 United Nations volunteers and 19 international staff. The 2014/15 and 2015/16 budgets for the Transport Section were \$23 million and \$26 million respectively.
4. Comments provided by MONUSCO are incorporated in italics.

II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

5. The objective of the audit was to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of governance, risk management and control processes over ground transport operations in MONUSCO.
6. This audit was included in the OIOS 2016 risk-based work plan due to the financial and operational risks related to management of ground transport in MONUSCO.
7. OIOS conducted this audit from October to December 2016. The audit covered the period from 1 January 2015 to 30 September 2016. Based on an activity-level risk assessment, the audit covered high and medium risk areas of ground transport operations, which included: oversight and monitoring of vehicle operations and issuance and control of driving permits. The audit did not cover the repair and maintenance of vehicles which was covered as a separate audit in 2016, and rental of vehicles which was covered as part of the audit of outsourced services in 2017.
8. The audit methodology included: (a) interviews of key personnel; (b) review of relevant documentation; (c) analytical review of data; and (d) sample testing of issued driving permits and CarLog reports. The audit team conducted fieldwork at Goma.

III. OVERALL CONCLUSION

9. MONUSCO had: properly constituted its Vehicle Establishment Committee (VEC); implemented adequate and effective controls over the liberty use of its vehicles; and ensured that all serviceable vehicles were covered by third-party insurance. However, the Mission needed to: (a) ensure that the Road Safety Committee performs its mandated functions; (b) implement a vehicle idling reduction strategy and a monitoring and reduction mechanism; and (c) deactivate all expired or unreturned driving permits.

IV. AUDIT RESULTS

A. Oversight of vehicle operations

The Vehicle Establishment Committee was properly constituted and making recommendation to right-size the vehicle fleet

10. The Department of Peacekeeping Operations/Department of Field Support (DPKO/DFS) Surface Transport Manual requires MONUSCO to establish a VEC to define and propose the vehicle establishment for each unit/section. The DFS Guidelines for the Transition Plan for a Global DFS Vehicle Fleet requires the VEC to: (a) review the light passenger vehicle ratio and allocation based on actual operational demand; and (b) review planned vehicle acquisitions with a view to replacing four-wheel-drive vehicles with light passenger vehicles where appropriate.

11. Review of MONUSCO administrative instruction 2015/021 on the VEC, terms of reference of the VEC, minutes of all four VEC meetings and implementation of VEC recommendations indicated that the VEC was properly constituted with members from all Mission components and it had clear terms of reference. The members regularly participated in VEC meetings and, in June 2016, reviewed the location-specific requirements for light passenger vehicles taking into consideration the actual operational needs of each unit/section. Based on the review, the VEC proposed adjustments to existing allocations and the respective units/sections confirmed the adequacy of the revised allocations. The VEC also reviewed the Mission's planned vehicle acquisitions, which resulted in the Mission replacing 14 four-wheel-drive vehicles with light passenger vehicles and withdrawing 24 others from Entebbe.

12. The Mission was implementing the VEC recommendations including the recommendation to: (a) write off 32 old vehicles; and (b) transfer 22 vehicles considered as surplus to the Regional Service Centre Entebbe (RSCE). MONUSCO: (a) initiated and approved the write-off of all the 32 vehicles in October 2016 and had disposed of 5 vehicles by April 2017; (b) transferred the 22 surplus vehicles to the RSCE dispatch pool; and (c) communicated its proposal to reallocate vehicles to the Surface Transport Section in DFS. MONUSCO was yet to implement this proposal as it was awaiting the decision of DFS on this matter.

13. OIOS concluded that the MONUSCO VEC was properly constituted and making recommendations to right-size the MONUSCO vehicle fleet.

Need to make the Road Safety Committee functional

14. The DPKO/DFS Road Safety Management Manual requires MONUSCO to establish an Advisory Committee on Traffic Safety/Road Safety to: (a) review road accident and driving conduct trends, and recommend policy changes and action plans to improve the overall standard of road and driving safety; (b) review traffic offences and recommend corrective actions; and (c) establish a calendar for annual road and driving safety campaigns.

15. MONUSCO had established its Advisory Committee on Traffic Safety in February 2012 and conducted annual road and safety driving campaigns. In July 2016, MONUSCO conducted a week of safe driving campaign activities that included presentations to staff, distribution of leaflets and posters, and broadcasting safety driving messages to staff via e-mail, telephone and computer pop-ups, and on the Mission intranet. MONUSCO provided staff with a booklet on road sense and defensive driving including "dos" and "don'ts" on the road and sent periodic road safety campaign messages to staff via e-mail. In cases of road accidents, the Security Investigation Unit (SIU) and Military Police were informed and

conducted investigations of the causes of the accidents. All major vehicle accidents were referred to SIU and Military Police who sent their investigation reports to the Local Property Survey Board for review and recommendation of appropriate action. However, SIU did not have calibrated breathalyzers to administer alcohol tests in some locations to be able to conduct an in-depth investigation. This issue was already raised by OIOS in its report on an audit of conduct and discipline in MONUSCO (2015/140), and recommended that the SIU be provided with adequate equipment and appropriately trained staff to conduct such tests. MONUSCO had not yet fully implemented this recommendation.

16. On 31 January 2017, MONUSCO replaced its Advisory Committee on Traffic Safety with a Road Safety Committee to perform the functions. However, there was no evidence that the Advisory Committee on Traffic Safety/Road Safety Committee carried out some of its mandated tasks as the Committee did not: meet (the Committee had last convened on 28 February 2013) during the audit period; and recommend administrative sanctions against 557 of 570 drivers whose CarLog reports showed to have violated speed limits 3 to 17 times from the sample period selected for audit. This occurred because: the Mission did not follow up to ensure that the Committee convened to perform its functions; and the Transport Section did not prepare reports of speed violations for review by the Committee.

17. As a result, the Mission missed the opportunity to effectively address traffic violations, mainly excessive speeding, which was reported by SIU and Military Police as the major reason for the increase in the number of major accidents from 38 per cent in the year 2014/15 to 63 per cent in 2015/16.

(1) MONUSCO should take effective action to ensure that the Road Safety Committee performs its mandated functions.

MONUSCO accepted recommendation 1 and stated that the new Road Safety Committee held its inaugural meeting on 7 March 2017 and would meet quarterly thereafter. The last meeting took place in May 2017 and resulted in the Committee recommending sanctions to drivers violating traffic rules. Recommendation 1 remains open pending OIOS verification of the adequacy of the functioning of the Road Safety Committee.

B. Utilization and insurance of vehicles

Need to implement a vehicle idling reduction strategy

18. The DPKO/DFS Surface Transport Manual requires the Transport Section to adopt and implement a vehicle idling reduction strategy and the MONUSCO 2015/16 Environmental Action Plan requires the Section to implement a vehicle idling monitoring and reduction mechanism.

19. Interviews with the Transport Section indicated that it did not have a vehicle idling reduction strategy and was not taking action to monitor and reduce vehicle idling.

20. The above occurred because MONUSCO had not prepared an idling reduction strategy and did not follow up to ensure the Transport Section generated the CarLog reports on vehicle idling. As a result, there was an unmitigated risk of air pollution and increased fuel consumption costs.

(2) MONUSCO should implement a vehicle idling reduction strategy and monitor vehicle idling.

MONUSCO accepted recommendation 2 and stated that the Road Safety Committee would decide on a vehicle idling reduction strategy in its next meeting. In the meantime, the Transport Section had

started generating vehicle idling reports for analysis, which would form the basis of discussions at the next Committee meeting. Recommendation 2 remains open pending receipt of evidence that MONUSCO has implemented a vehicle idling reduction strategy and is monitoring vehicle idling.

There were adequate and effective controls over liberty use of vehicles

21. The DPKO/DFS standard operating procedures on the non-official use of United Nations vehicles require the Chief Transport Officer to: generate monthly liberty mileage reports and have the concerned staff verify them; and initiate recovery of the cost of liberty use of vehicles from the concerned staff. In addition, MONUSCO Administrative Circular 006 issued on 2 May 2007 requires travels beyond a daily maximum of 100 kilometres that are not certified as official to be accounted for as liberty travel.

22. Review of mileage reports from the CarLog system for drivers located in all locations and communications related to the recovery of liberty charges indicated that the Transport Section generated liberty mileage reports that had to be verified by concerned staff. The reports showed that 419 drivers made trips of more than 100 kilometres on 914 trips during weekends and public holidays. OIOS confirmed that 166 of the trips were not certified as official and, for 62 other trips, the concerned staff did not respond to the verification requests from the Transport Section. For all these 228 trips, the Mission recovered related costs from the concerned staff members.

23. OIOS concluded that MONUSCO had implemented adequate controls over the liberty use of vehicles.

There were adequate controls to ensure that all vehicles were covered by third-party insurance

24. The DPKO/DFS Surface Transport Manual requires the Mission to: ensure that all United Nations-owned vehicles are covered by third-party insurance; and report, on a monthly basis, the number of its vehicles in use to the Surface Transport Section, DFS to arrange for worldwide insurance coverage.

25. A review of the Mission's vehicle holding records in the Galileo system and a sample of vehicle insurance reports showed that all serviceable vehicles were covered by third-party insurance maintained by the United Nations Headquarters. Additionally, the Mission had a regional insurance coverage for its vehicles in Rwanda, Burundi and Uganda. The Mission had on average 1,861 vehicles in the Democratic Republic of the Congo and insured on average 1,434 serviceable vehicles during the audit period. A review of the records of all vehicles that were excluded from the insurance coverage indicated that the Mission had correctly excluded these vehicles as they were either pending write-off, written off or unserviceable during the respective reporting periods. The Mission submitted all the monthly reports to DFS/Surface Transport Section as required.

26. OIOS concluded that MONUSCO had implemented adequate controls to ensure that its vehicles were covered by third-party insurance.

C. Issuance and control of driving permits

Controls over issuance of driving permits were effective

27. The DPKO/DFS Surface Transport Manual requires MONUSCO to issue a driving permit to a qualified driver after successful completion of: (a) driving tests (written and practical); (b) vision tests; and (c) submission of a valid national/military driving license. The Manual requires MONUSCO to test drivers for specialized equipment in the specific categories of vehicles.

28. Review of records of 115 of 6,153 active driving permits selected from MONUSCO driving permits database indicated that all drivers had: (a) taken and passed the required vision tests; (b) taken and passed the driving tests (written and practical) including for the specific category of vehicles; and (c) provided copies of the valid national/military driving licenses.

29. OIOS concluded that MONUSCO had implemented adequate controls to ensure only qualified drivers were issued with driving permits.

Need to deactivate expired and unreturned driving permits

30. The DPKO/DFS Surface Transport Manual requires MONUSCO to deactivate expired driving permits and cancel permits of personnel that have checked out of the Mission.

31. Review of active driving permits in the Mission's driving permits database as at 30 September 2016 indicated that six per cent (364 out of 6,153) had expired but not deactivated. The expired permits were held by military contingent personnel (327 of 364) responsible for driving very important personalities and civilian aviation contractor personnel (37 of 364) that did not return their driving permits to the Transport Section for cancellation upon check-out. All civilian mission staff had returned their driving permits upon check-out.

32. The above occurred because the Transport Section did not have effective procedures to obtain these permits for deactivation and cancellation. As a result, there was a risk of unauthorized use of United Nations vehicles.

(3) MONUSCO should take action to obtain and deactivate/cancel expired driving permits and permits of personnel leaving the Mission.

MONUSCO accepted recommendation 3 and stated that it would ensure that expired driving permits and those of staff leaving the Mission were consistently deactivated in a timely manner. Recommendation 3 remains open pending receipt of evidence that MONUSCO has consistently deactivated/cancelled expired driving permits and the permits of personnel leaving the Mission.

V. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

33. OIOS wishes to express its appreciation to the management and staff of MONUSCO for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.

(Signed) Eleanor T. Burns
Director, Internal Audit Division
Office of Internal Oversight Services

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

**Audit of ground transport operations in the
United Nations Organization Stabilization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo**

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
1	MONUSCO should take effective action to ensure that the Road Safety Committee performs its mandated functions.	Important	O	OIOS verification of the adequacy of the functioning of the Road Safety Committee.	31 December 2017
2	MONUSCO should implement a vehicle idling reduction strategy and monitor vehicle idling.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that MONUSCO has implemented a vehicle idling reduction strategy and monitored vehicle idling.	31 December 2017
3	MONUSCO should take action to obtain and deactivate/cancel expired driving permits and permits of personnel leaving the Mission.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that MONUSCO has taken action to obtain and deactivate/cancel all expired driving permits and permits of personnel leaving the Mission.	30 September 2017

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

³ C = closed, O = open

⁴ Date provided by MONUSCO in response to recommendations.

APPENDIX I

Management Response

Management Response

**Audit of ground transport operations in the
United Nations Organization Stabilization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo**

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Impleme ntation Date	Client comments
1	MONUSCO should take effective actions to ensure that the Road Safety Committee performs its mandated functions.	Important	Yes	Chief Transport Officer	31 December 2017	MONUSCO's Road Safety Committee (RSC) held its inaugural meeting on 07 March 2017 and will meet on a quarterly basis thereafter. The latest meeting took place in May 2017 and topics of discussion included traffic violation cases and recommendations were made accordingly. Sanctions will be issued to offending drivers in accordance with the RSC recommendations. In addition, the Mission's annual Road Safety Campaign commenced on 19 June 2017 with the aim of spreading road safety awareness and best practices among mission personnel.
2	MONUSCO should implement a vehicle idling reduction strategy and monitor vehicle idling.	Important	Yes	Chief Transport Officer, Head Environmental Protection Unit	31 December 2017	A vehicle idling reduction strategy will be decided upon in the next Road Safety Committee meeting. In the meantime, Transport Section has started generating vehicle idling reports for analysis which will form the basis of discussions at the next RSC meeting.
3	MONUSCO should take action to obtain and deactivate/cancel expired driving permits and permits of personnel leaving the Mission.	Important	Yes	Chief Transport Officer	30 September 2017	MONUSCO will ensure that expired driving permits and those of staff leaving the Mission are consistently deactivated in a timely manner.

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.