



Office of Internal Oversight Services

INTERNAL AUDIT DIVISION

AUDIT REPORT 2013/111

Audit of the civil affairs programme in the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur

Overall results relating to the civil affairs programme in the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur were initially assessed as partially satisfactory. Implementation of three important recommendations remains in progress

FINAL OVERALL RATING: PARTIALLY SATISFACTORY

5 December 2013

Assignment No. AP2013/634/02

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. OBJECTIVE AND SCOPE	1-2
III. AUDIT RESULTS	3-5
A. Programme management	2-5
B. Coordinated management	5
IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	6
 ANNEX I Status of audit recommendations	
 APPENDIX I Management response	

AUDIT REPORT

Audit of the civil affairs programme in the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur

I. BACKGROUND

1. The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of the civil affairs programme in the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur (UNAMID).
2. In accordance with its mandate, OIOS provides assurance and advice on the adequacy and effectiveness of the United Nations internal control system, the primary objectives of which are to ensure: (a) efficient and effective operations; (b) accurate financial and operational reporting; (c) safeguarding of assets; and (d) compliance with mandates, regulations and rules.
3. The role of the Civil Affairs Section was to support the functioning of institutions established under the Darfur Peace Agreement through the holding of workshops on governance and peace building, with the aim of promoting a culture of peace.
4. The Civil Affairs Section was headed by a Chief at the D-1 level who reported directly to the Deputy Joint Special Representative/Principal. The Civil Affairs Section had an authorized staffing level of 122 posts, comprising 34 international posts, 78 national posts and 10 United Nations volunteers. The estimated staffing cost for the fiscal year 2012/13 was \$6.84 million. Funding for civil affairs activities was included in the Communications and Public Information Division budget.
5. Comments provided by UNAMID are incorporated in italics.

II. OBJECTIVE AND SCOPE

6. The audit was conducted to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of UNAMID governance, risk management and control processes in providing reasonable assurance regarding the **effective management of the civil affairs programme in UNAMID**.
7. This audit was included in the 2013 OIOS risk-based work plan due to the operational and reputational risks of not implementing an effective civil affairs programme, as mandated.
8. The key controls tested for the audit were: (a) programme management reporting; and (b) coordinated management. For the purpose of this audit, OIOS defined these key controls as follows:
 - (a) **Programme management reporting** - controls that provide reasonable assurance that a system exists to report programme performance timely, accurately and completely.
 - (b) **Coordinated management** - controls that provide reasonable assurance that potential overlaps in the performance of civil affairs programmes are mitigated, and that issues affecting or involving other United Nations partners and actors are identified, discussed and resolved timely and at the appropriate forums. This key control includes regular meetings among United Nations partners and other actors involved in programme delivery, and other tools, forums or mechanisms to discuss issues.

9. The key controls were assessed for the control objectives shown in Table 1.

10. OIOS conducted the audit from February to June 2013. The audit covered the period from 1 July 2011 to 30 June 2013. The audit did not include a review of quick impact projects implemented by the Civil Affairs Section as these were covered in a separate assignment (AP2011/634/05), whose report was dated 5 May 2012.

11. OIOS conducted an activity-level risk assessment to identify and assess specific risk exposures, and to confirm the relevance of the selected key controls in mitigating associated risks. Through interviews, analytical reviews and tests of controls, OIOS assessed the existence and adequacy of internal controls and conducted necessary tests to determine their effectiveness.

III. AUDIT RESULTS

12. The UNAMID governance, risk management and control processes examined were initially assessed as **partially satisfactory** in providing reasonable assurance regarding **the effective management of the civil affairs programme in UNAMID**. OIOS made five recommendations to address the issues identified. The Civil Affairs Section provided a vital role as the Mission’s interface for contacts with civil society and government authorities and held workshops on various governance and peace building aspects to promote a culture of peace. However, UNAMID needed to: (a) improve the work planning process; (b) develop indicators to measure the impact of programme activities; (c) augment the gap in the skill sets of the civil affairs staff by developing in-house training programmes; and (d) improve the database for documenting civil affairs activities and workshops.

13. The initial overall rating was based on the assessment of key controls presented in Table 1 below. The final overall rating is **partially satisfactory** as implementation of three important recommendations remains in progress.

Table 1: Assessment of key controls

Business objective	Key controls	Control objectives			
		Efficient and effective operations	Accurate financial and operational reporting	Safeguarding of assets	Compliance with mandates, regulations and rules
Effective management of the civil affairs programme in UNAMID	(a) Programme management reporting	Partially satisfactory	Partially satisfactory	Not assessed	Partially satisfactory
	(b) Coordinated management	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Not assessed	Satisfactory
FINAL OVERALL RATING: PARTIALLY SATISFACTORY					

A. Programme management

There was a need to develop a work planning process in consultation with relevant parties

14. The Department of Peacekeeping Operations/Department of Field Support (DPKO/DFS) Civil Affairs Handbook required the preparation of annual work plans that included activities to be conducted,

timeframes for completion of planned activities, required resources and indicators for measuring planned activities against actual progress.

15. The preparation and finalization of the 2011/12 work plan for the Civil Affairs Section was delayed due to the departure of the Chief of Section. Also, both the 2011/12 and 2012/13 work plans had not been formally reviewed and approved by the Deputy Joint Special Representative/Principal. Additionally, while sector teams were required to prepare work plans, these were not formally reviewed and approved by the Chief of Section to validate them and to ensure that the plans were consistent with those of the Headquarters and the civil affairs mandate. Also, the Civil Affairs Section in preparing the 2012/13 work plan, did not formally document the process it used to consult with officials of the Government of Sudan, other national actors including civil society organizations, and the United Nations Country Team. This resulted as the Civil Affairs Section did not have a formal process for preparing, discussing and approving annual work plans.

(1) The UNAMID Civil Affairs Section should formalize the work planning process and ensure that (a) sector level work plans are reviewed and approved, and (b) there is an adequate consultative process with staff involved in civil affairs activities in the Mission and with the Government of Sudan, other national actors, civil society organizations and the United Nations Country Team.

UNAMID accepted recommendation 1 and stated that the Civil Affairs Section adopted a bottom up approach towards development of the work plan, and a retreat that included personnel from sectors was held in April 2013 to develop the work plan. Recommendation 1 remains open pending receipt of a copy of the 2014 work plan instructions outlining the work planning process, and procedures for review and approval of sector-level work plans and consultation with other stakeholders.

Programme work planning and implementation needed to improve

16. The DPKO/DFS Civil Affairs Handbook required use of performance indicators consisting of variables, which provided a simple and reasonable basis for assessing progress and achievements. The Civil Affairs Section did not sufficiently define its programme indicators and achievements in its work plans. For example, the 2011/12 work plan included a task for the Civil Affairs Section to conduct 12 meetings with the Local Peace Reconciliation Councils/Committees, Wisdom Council, Darfur Peace & Reconciliation Council, the Heidelberg Group and the Darfur Internal Dialogue Consultations. However, there were no metrics identified to measure and report on the expected accomplishment of these meetings. As a result, the Civil Affairs Section was unable to measure the impact of all its output activities. Instead, the Civil Affairs Section relied on the results-based budgeting framework to report on its performance.

17. Additionally, for fiscal year 2011/12, the Civil Affairs Section planned to execute 23 activities, of which 11 were achieved, three partially achieved and nine (40 per cent) were not executed. For example, one of the activities was not completed because funds were not allocated by UNAMID to host 12 of the planned workshops included in the plan. Moreover, 13 activities were planned for fiscal year 2012/13, but as of May 2013, five were achieved, six were partially achieved and three had not been initiated. The implementation of the work plan was negatively affected by the 26 per cent vacancy rate in the Section. As of August 2013, OIOS determined that the Civil Affairs Section had taken necessary action to address the vacancies.

18. Moreover, a review of skills and knowledge of 26 civil affairs staff indicated that eight of the officers did not have the requisite educational background for their positions, as they had been transferred from different functions. There was a need for the Civil Affairs Section to augment the gap in the skill sets of the Section's staff for them to perform their functions effectively.

(2) UNAMID should develop indicators and mechanisms that allow expected accomplishments of the Civil Affairs Section to be measured and reported on.

UNAMID accepted recommendation 2 and stated that the Civil Affairs Section would seek funds to engage an independent consultant to conduct an impact analysis of its activities. Recommendation 2 remains open pending receipt of evidence that adequate indicators and mechanisms have been developed and implemented to measure and report on UNAMID civil affair activities.

(3) UNAMID should assess the training needs of its civil affairs staff and develop in-house training programmes to enhance their capacity to perform their functions more effectively.

UNAMID accepted recommendation 3 and stated that it conducted its first training needs assessment in 2009/10, and during 2012 and 2013 designed special training programmes to meet the needs of its national professional officers with the assistance of the Mission's Integrated Mission Training Centre and the Training Centre in Entebbe. UNAMID would also continue to conduct annual needs assessment of staff and develop an annual training schedule. Based on the action taken by UNAMID, recommendation 3 has been closed.

Need to analyze conflicts and determine its drivers

19. The DPKO/DFS Civil Affairs Handbook stated that conflict analysis may include the identification of conflict drivers and an analysis of their nature, an assessment of obstacles to the establishment of peace as well as recommendations for responses at the national and local level.

20. UNAMID produced maps of: (a) Darfur ethnic groups and transhumance routes; and (b) the locations of active armed movements/coalitions in Darfur, and these were used by the Civil Affairs Section to depict conflict areas in Darfur and to prepare reports of locations of ongoing conflicts, and areas controlled by the armed movements and their roles. However, the Civil Affairs Section had not identified conflict drivers or conducted analysis of their nature, and without this, UNAMID was precluded from addressing the root causes of conflicts, formulating adequate strategies and adjusting activities of the Civil Affairs Section and other mission components to address them. Subsequent to the audit, in June 2013, the Civil Affairs Section took action and started to determine conflict drivers. In September 2013, UNAMID published a paper documenting the root causes of tribal conflicts titled "Tribal Conflicts in Darfur, Implications on mediation and UNAMID mandate implementation". OIOS verified that the Section was systematically documenting them and therefore no recommendation was made.

The civil affairs database needed to be enhanced

21. The database used by the Civil Affairs Section to record its activities and achievements was incomplete and not well organized to facilitate the easy retrieval of information. This resulted from the absence of procedures and guidelines to regularly update the database and to classify documents and reports on civil affairs activities for easy retrieval. The lack of complete and up-to-date information on past activities and results impacted the ability of the Civil Affairs Section to use this information in planning and formulating strategies.

(4) UNAMID should implement procedures to ensure that civil affairs reports and documents are properly classified and uploaded in the civil affairs database regularly and completely.

UNAMID accepted recommendation 4 and was seeking the assistance of the Communications and Information Technology Section to update and maintain the database. Recommendation 4 remains

open pending receipt of evidence that adequate procedures are implemented to properly classify and upload civil affairs reports in the Civil Affairs Section's database.

The Civil Affairs Section workshop materials and presentations needed to be reviewed

22. The DPKO/DFS Civil Affairs Hand Book required civil affairs managers to provide adequate guidance on the type of information disseminated to external parties, and to implement procedures to ensure that it was not contrary to the Mission-wide analysis and strategy.

23. The Civil Affairs Section was mandated to hold workshops on governance and peace building; however, some civil affairs officers responsible for facilitating these workshops were not adequately trained in governance issues and were still given the responsibility to prepare and develop workshop presentation materials. These materials were not reviewed and approved by the Head of the Civil Affairs Section or a designate. Also, some workshops were facilitated by lecturers from local universities along with the staff of the Civil Affairs Section, but there was no evidence that the content presented by external parties was cleared and approved by the Head of the Civil Affairs Section or a designate. This was due to inadequate procedures to ensure that materials being presented or disseminated were being reviewed.

(5) UNAMID should ensure that all workshop presentation materials are reviewed and approved by the Head of Civil Affairs Section or a designate to ensure that they articulate the Mission's intents, strategies and visions for the implementation of Security Council mandates prior to hosting any workshop.

UNAMID accepted recommendation 5 and stated that in September 2013 the Head of Civil Affairs Section sent a memorandum to staff to submit all presentation materials to Mission Headquarters for review and clearance prior to hosting any workshop. Based on the action taken by UNAMID, recommendation 5 has been closed.

B. Coordinated management

Deliberations with the United Nations Country Team and other stakeholders were being well documented

24. The Civil Affairs Section had established mechanisms to coordinate its activities with both internal and external partners. Meetings with other substantive sections in the mission were also conducted to avoid duplication of work. For instance, the Civil Affairs Section coordinated their activities with the Gender Section, the Political and Rule of Law Section and external partners including the United Nations Country Team and government offices, such as the Darfur Regional Authority institutions. The deliberations were captured in minutes of the meeting and/or notes to file. With regards to coordination with the United Nations Country Team, all deliberations were captured in minutes of meetings by the secretariat in the office of the Deputy Joint Special Representative/Principal.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

25. OIOS wishes to express its appreciation to the Management and staff of UNAMID for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.

(Signed) David Kanja
Assistant Secretary-General for Internal Oversight Services

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of the civil affairs programme in the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur

Recom. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
1	The UNAMID Civil Affairs Section should formalize the work planning process and ensure that (a) sector level workplans are reviewed and approved, and (b) there is an adequate consultative process with staff involved in civil affairs activities in the Mission and with the Government of Sudan, other national actors, civil society organizations and the United Nations Country Team.	Important	O	Receipt of a copy of the 2014 work plan instructions outlining the policy for formalizing the work planning process, and includes procedures for review and approval of sector-level work plans and consultation with other stakeholders.	1 April 2013
2	UNAMID should develop indicators and mechanisms that allow expected accomplishments of the Civil Affairs Section to be measured and reported on.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that adequate indicators and mechanisms have been developed and implemented to measure and report on UNAMID civil affair activities.	30 June 2014
3	UNAMID should assess the training needs of its civil affairs staff and develop in-house training programmes to enhance their capacity to perform their functions more effectively.	Important	C	Action taken.	Implemented
4	UNAMID should implement procedures to ensure that civil affairs reports and documents are properly classified and uploaded in the civil affairs database regularly and completely.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that adequate procedures are implemented to properly classify and upload civil affairs reports in the Civil Affairs Section's database.	31 March 2014
5	UNAMID should ensure that all workshop presentation materials are reviewed and approved accordingly by the Head of Civil Affairs Section or a designate to ensure that they articulate the Mission's intents, strategies and visions for the implementation of Security Council mandates prior to hosting any workshop.	Important	C	Action taken.	Implemented

¹ Critical recommendations address significant and/or pervasive deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

³ C = closed, O = open

⁴ Date provided by UNAMID

APPENDIX I

Management Response

AFRICAN UNION

الاتحاد الأفريقي



UNAMID



UNITED NATIONS

الأمم المتحدة

African Union – United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur

Office of the Joint Special Representative

8 November 2013

To: Ms. Eleanor T. Burns
Chief, Peacekeeping Audit Service
Internal Audit Division, OIOS

From: Mohamed Ibn Chambas
Special Joint Representative
UNAMID

Subject: **Draft Report on the audit of Civil Affairs programme in UNAMID**
(Assignment No.: AP2013/634/02)

1. With reference to your memorandum of 24 October 2013, on the subject matter, please find appended herewith the management response (Annex I) to the draft audit report for your consideration and records.

Thank you.

cc: Ms. Retta Reddy, Chief, Civil Affairs Division

Management Response

Audit of the civil affairs programme in the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ⁵ / Important ⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
1	The UNAMID Civil Affairs Section should formalize the work planning process and ensure that (a) sector level workplans are reviewed and approved, and (b) there is an adequate consultative process with staff involved in civil affairs activities in the Mission and with the Government of Sudan, other national actors, civil society organizations and the United Nations Country Team.	Important	Yes	Chief of Civil Affairs	01 April 2013	This recommendation has been implemented. Civil Affairs adopts a bottom up approach toward development of the workplan. A retreat of all leaders from the sectors was held in April 2013 to develop the workplan. The Civil Affairs Section provided evidence to the auditors.
2	UNAMID should develop indicators and mechanisms that allow expected accomplishments of the Civil Affairs Section to be measured and reported on.	Important	Yes	Chief of Civil Affairs	30 June 2014	The Civil Affairs Section will seek funds from mission to engage an independent consultant to conduct an impact analysis of its activities.
3	UNAMID should assess the training needs of its civil affairs staff and develop in-house training programmes to enhance their capacity to perform their functions more effectively.	Important	Yes	Chief of Civil Affairs	30 June 2014	The first needs assessment was conducted in 2009/2010. Additionally, in 2012 and 2013 special training programs were designed to meet the needs of the National Professional Officers with the assistance of the Integrated Mission Training Centre and the Training Centre in Entebbe. The Civil Affairs Section will conduct annual needs assessment of staff and develop an annual training schedule with the Integrated Mission Training Centre.

⁵ Critical recommendations address significant and/or pervasive deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

⁶ Important recommendations address important deficiencies or weaknesses in governance, risk management or internal control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

Management Response

Audit of the civil affairs programme in the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ⁵ / Important ⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
4	UNAMID should implement procedures to ensure that civil affairs reports and documents are properly classified and uploaded in the civil affairs database regularly and completely.	Important	Yes	Chief of Civil Affairs	31 March 2014	Civil Affairs has been seeking the assistance of the Communications and Information Technology Service to update and maintain the database. However, due to poor internet connections and interruptions field offices often experience difficulty in uploading documents.
5	UNAMID should ensure that all workshop presentation materials are reviewed and approved accordingly by the Head of Civil Affairs Section or a designate to ensure that they articulate the Mission's intents, strategies and visions for the implementation of Security Council mandates prior to hosting any workshop.	Important	Yes	Chief of Civil Affairs	11 September 2013	Civil Affairs now as a matter of routine reviews all workshop presentation materials. Most materials have been developed with the support of the Department of Peacekeeping Operations Training Unit New York. The Chief of Civil Affairs on 11 September 2013 sent a memo out to all staff to submit all presentation materials to United Nations Headquarters in New York for review and clearance.