



INTERNAL AUDIT DIVISION

REPORT 2018/070

Audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali

There was a need to develop a recruitment plan and strengthen oversight of recruitment actions

11 July 2018
Assignment No. AP2017/641/13

Audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali (MINUSMA). The objective of the audit was to assess the efficiency and effectiveness of the recruitment process in MINUSMA, and compliance with established guidelines and procedures governing the selection and recruitment of international staff in field missions. The audit covered the period from 1 July 2015 to 31 January 2018 and included recruitment planning, processing of recruitment actions, temporary job openings (TJOs) and reference checking.

MINUSMA developed a recruitment strategy that set out best practices for the recruitment and selection of the Mission's staff and had adequately constituted assessment panels. To further strengthen controls, MINUSMA needed to: implement recommendations from the civilian staffing review to optimize the Mission's capacity; adequately monitor the recruitment process; ensure compliance with United Nations gender requirements, and Department of Peacekeeping Operations/Department of Field Support standard operating procedure and ST/AI/2010/3 and ST/AI/2016/1 on staff selection; document TJO recruitments and provide justification for each recruitment and exceptional extension; and take appropriate action to withdraw the offer of employment of staff whose credentials cannot be positively verified.

OIOS made 10 recommendations. To address issues identified in the audit, MINUSMA needed to:

- Implement recommendations from the civilian staffing review to achieve optimum staffing levels;
- Develop and implement a recruitment plan;
- Improve the applicants' evaluation and substantive assessment;
- Ensure that assessment panel members have completed the competency-based interviewing training;
- Comply with the United Nations guidelines on gender parity in staff selection;
- Strengthen controls over the exercise of delegated authority for recruitment of international staff;
- Monitor timeliness of recruitment actions;
- Ensure that recruitment actions are documented and recorded in Inspira;
- Improve justification and documentation of TJOs; and
- Comply with the reference checking requirements.

MINUSMA accepted the recommendations and has initiated action to implement them.

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	1-2
III. AUDIT RESULTS	2-8
A. Recruitment planning	2-3
B. Processing recruitment actions	3-7
C. Temporary job recruitment	7
D. Reference checking	8
IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	9
 ANNEX I Status of audit recommendations	
 APPENDIX I Management response	

Audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali

I. BACKGROUND

1. The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali (MINUSMA).
2. The Under-Secretary-General for Field Support delegated to MINUSMA on 15 February 2013 and on 14 March 2016, the authority to recruit and select internationally recruited staff up to the D-1 level in compliance with the regulations, rules and procedures governing the staff selection system as set out in ST/AI/2010/13. All applications are submitted and processed using the Inspira web-based tool. The staff selection system policy also requires the Mission to utilize the personnel rosters as the primary instrument for recruitment, placement and promotion for generic job opening vacancies.
3. The Recruitment of International Staff Unit within the Human Resources Section in MINUSMA is responsible for overseeing the overall performance and success of the recruitment process by developing, implementing and monitoring the workforce plan for MINUSMA to ensure that vacancies are promptly identified and filled in a timely manner. The Human Resources Section is headed by an Acting Chief at the P-4 level who reports to the Director of Mission Support through the Deputy Director of Mission Support. The Section has an authorized staffing of 44 positions.
4. From 1 July 2015 to 31 January 2018, MINUSMA recruited a total of 361 international staff comprising 20 at the D (Director) level, 185 at the P (Professional) level and 156 at the FS (Field Service) level divided into the substantive, mission support and security components as shown in the table.

Number of international staff recruited from 1 July 2015 to 31 January 2018

	2015	2016	2017	2018	Total
Substantive	35	56	55	3	149
Mission support	40	62	65	5	172
Security	1	13	25	1	40
Total	76	131	145	9	361

Source: MINUSMA recruitment report, Inspira.

5. Comments provided by MINUSMA are incorporated in italics.

II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

6. The objective of the audit was to assess the efficiency and effectiveness of the recruitment process in MINUSMA, and compliance with established guidelines and procedures governing the selection and recruitment of international staff in field missions.
7. This audit was included in the 2017 risk-based work plan of OIOS because of the criticality of international staff recruitment to the achievement of the MINUSMA mandate.
8. OIOS conducted this audit from November 2017 to May 2018. The audit covered the period from July 2015 to January 2018. Based on an activity-level risk assessment, the audit covered higher and medium

risk areas in the recruitment and selection of international staff, which included recruitment planning, processing of recruitment actions, temporary job openings (TJOs) and reference checking.

9. The audit methodology included interviews of key personnel, reviews of relevant documentation, analytical reviews of data and sample testing of the recruitment process for a random sample of 111 international staff, i.e., 16 position-specific job openings (PSJOs), 44 recruitments from roster (RfRs), 40 TJOs and 11 reassignments from downsizing missions, representing 30 per cent of a total of 361 international staff recruited during the audit period.

10. The audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing.

III. AUDIT RESULTS

A. Recruitment planning

There was a need to implement recommendations from the civilian staffing review to achieve optimum staffing levels

11. The Department of Peacekeeping Operations (DPKO), Department of Field Support (DFS) and Department of Safety and Security (DSS) conducted a joint civilian staffing review (CSR) of all peacekeeping missions over a period of four years (2013-2016) to assist in optimizing staffing and aligning human resources with the priorities of the missions' respective mandates.

12. The CSR for MINUSMA was conducted from May to August 2016 to review the structure and capacities of MINUSMA and ensure alignment with the Mission's successive mandates. The CSR made the following recommendations for fiscal years 2016/17 and 2017/18 for MINUSMA to:

- Conduct a comprehensive needs analysis of the Mission's capacity and structure as many substantive work strands were not aligned with the Mission's broader priorities and contributed to overstretching, lack of focus, dispersion of efforts and sub-optimal use of human, material and financial resources;
- Develop a nationalization strategy to build capacities for future transfer of tasks from international to national staff in those functions where local capacity is available;
- Review and consider outsourcing opportunities for maintenance of the vehicle fleet light workshop in Bamako, car wash, select engineering works and facilities maintenance; and
- Rebalance resources where they are most needed taking into consideration existing service level agreement with the Regional Support Centre in Entebbe (RSCE) for the provision of administrative support.

13. The Mission did not consistently implement the CSR recommendations as it did not conduct a formal needs analysis, develop a nationalization strategy, develop a plan to rebalance resources where most needed and outsource some activities to optimize its capacity. The Mission advised that the non-compliance with the CSR recommendations was due to changes in its mandates that occurred in 2017 and 2018. OIOS was of the view that the changes of the Mission's mandates should have been supported by a comprehensive needs analysis. The above conditions increased the risk that the Mission's staffing might not be optimized and aligned with mandated priorities.

(1) MINUSMA should implement the civilian staffing review recommendations including the establishment and implementation of a nationalization strategy, a plan to outsource selected support activities and to rebalance resources where they are most needed, and the conduct of a comprehensive needs analysis of the Mission's capacity and structure.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 1 and stated that the Mission was finalizing a nationalization strategy that would be implemented by 2020. The Mission had already outsourced some of its support activities, e.g., construction projects, vehicle maintenance activities, medical services, and was in the process of outsourcing cleaning services. Recommendation 1 remains open pending the finalization and implementation of a nationalization strategy and comprehensive needs analysis of the Mission's capacity and structure.

Need to develop and implement a recruitment plan

14. The DPKO/DFS standard operating procedures on staff selection system for peacekeeping operations and special political missions (SOP on staff selection) require the Chief Human Resources Officer to develop a recruitment plan at the start of each budget cycle to ensure that current and projected vacant posts are filled in a timely manner and to prioritize critical positions required to maintain operational priorities of the Mission. The recruitment plan shall also serve as a tool to monitor the recruitment process of the Mission.

15. MINUSMA drafted a recruitment strategy that set out best practices for the recruitment and selection of staff. However, due to inadequate oversight by the Acting Chief, Human Resources Section, a recruitment plan was not developed to monitor the Mission's recruitment process.

16. The absence of a recruitment plan hampered managers' ability to timely identify and address recruitment challenges. As a result, the Mission was inadequately staffed, with a vacancy rate of 23 per cent as of April 2018, and relied heavily on TJOs to fill vacant positions instead of RfRs. Some 79 (or 21 per cent) of 361 jobs filled during the audit period were filled through TJOs, with 80 per cent of the justification being the need to urgently fill vacant positions.

(2) MINUSMA should establish and implement a recruitment plan to adequately monitor the Mission's recruitment process.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 2 and stated that the Mission would finalize a recruitment plan by 30 September 2018. Recommendation 2 remains open pending receipt of a copy of the recruitment plan and evidence of its implementation.

B. Processing of recruitment actions

Need to improve the applicants' evaluation and substantive assessment

17. The DPKO/DFS SOP on staff selection and ST/AI/2016/1 and ST/AI/2010/3 require human resource officers to conduct a preliminary analysis/evaluation of candidates' applications to determine whether they possess relevant qualifications, such as education, work experience and language proficiency as indicated in the job opening and the evaluation criteria. Also, the SOP on staff selection requires hiring managers with the assistance of human resources officers to conduct substantive assessments to test applicants' knowledge against competencies specified in the job opening. Substantive assessments can include technical tests such as in-tray exercises, case studies, written tests or simulation.

18. A review of records for the 111 recruitment actions indicated that human resources officers did not consistently conduct the assessment tests to ensure that selected candidates met the requirements of the job openings:

- Interview of 19 staff selected against posts having French proficiency as a required criterion indicated that 10 (or 53 per cent) of the staff hired did not meet this requirement: five were not proficient in French and the other staff had no knowledge of French;
- For five posts having proficiency in computer applications and packages (word processor, spreadsheet editor, database management system, enterprise resource planning) as a required criterion, there was no documentation to show that the required technical skills were critically evaluated against the job opening requirements; and
- For 4 of the 16 PSJOs sampled, the applicants were not subjected to any form of substantive knowledge assessment against the competencies criteria of the position.

19. This occurred because the human resources officers and hiring managers had not established an oversight mechanism to ensure that the selected candidates met the requirements of job openings. As a result, there was a risk that MINUSMA may recruit staff without the requisite knowledge and skills to effectively perform their duties.

(3) MINUSMA should consistently conduct evaluation and substantive assessment of all the applicants against the required criteria in job openings.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 3 and stated that it would conduct refresher training for all hiring managers and sensitize them on the conduct of evaluation and substantive assessment of applicants. Recommendation 3 remains open pending receipt of evidence that hiring managers consistently conduct evaluation and substantive assessment of all applicants.

Need to ensure that assessment panel members have completed the competency-based interviewing training

20. ST/AI/2010/3 on the staff selection system requires the Mission to establish assessment panels comprised of at least three members including two subject matter experts at the same level or higher of the job opening and one from outside the unit/section where the job is located. The panel should also include one female staff. Additionally, the DPKO/DFS SOP on staff selection requires all assessment panel members to complete the United Nations competency-based interviewing (CBI) training prior to being selected as members of an assessment panel.

21. A review of the composition for 14 assessment panels comprising 28 members that were established for the recruitment of 16 PSJOs indicated that the panels were appropriately constituted. However, 11 (or 40 per cent) of the 28 panel members did not complete the mandatory CBI training. This was due to lack of oversight by human resources officers to ensure that all panel members had completed the CBI training prior to being selected as a panel member. This increased the risk of recruiting staff who do not have the required skill set.

(4) MINUSMA should establish and implement adequate supervisory controls to ensure that all panel members complete the United Nations competency-based interviewing training.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 4 and stated that the Integrated Mission Training Centre would develop a database of the Mission staff who had completed the CBI training. This database would be used by the Human Resources Section for selecting members of the interview panel. Recommendation 4 remains open pending receipt of evidence that all panel members selected to conduct interviews have completed the CBI training.

The Mission needed to comply with the United Nations guidelines on gender parity in staff selection

22. The DPKO/DFS SOP on staff selection requires the Mission to pay due consideration to gender parity goals. A memorandum issued by the MINUSMA Special Representative of the Secretary-General (SRSG) on 2 March 2017 requires all hiring managers to properly apply gender balance and parity to the Mission's recruitment activities. Hiring managers are required to give priority to the recruitment of female candidates for both international and national staff categories. Where female applicants are not selected, the justification should be documented in the selection memorandum. In addition, the Chief Human Resources Officer is required to provide the SRSG with quarterly reports to monitor hiring managers' compliance with the gender parity policy.

23. Recruitment records of the 111 posts reviewed showed that 21 had a total of 51 equally qualified female candidates who were recommended but not selected and there was no documented reason for not selecting them. Also, the Human Resources Section did not prepare the quarterly reports to monitor hiring managers' compliance with the gender parity policy which negated senior managers' ability from timely identifying and addressing challenges to gender parity.

24. This occurred because the Human Resources Section did not implement adequate procedures over the selection process to ensure hiring managers were complying with the United Nations gender parity guidelines on staff selection and the MINUSMA SRSG memorandum of 2 March 2017. As a result, MINUSMA ratio of female to male was low at 25 per cent female to 75 per cent male, representing a gender parity gap of 25 per cent. MINUSMA might miss the opportunity to reach the United Nations parity goal of 50/50 per cent by 2030.

(5) MINUSMA should: (a) establish and implement adequate supervisory controls to ensure effective implementation of relevant policy and guidelines on gender parity; and (b) provide the Special Representative of the Secretary-General with quarterly reports on the Mission's progress in achieving gender parity.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 5 and stated that it would review the existing procedures and documents to ascertain any gaps and take appropriate corrective actions. Recommendation 5 remains open pending receipt of evidence that hiring managers consistently comply with relevant policy and guidelines on gender parity, and the Human Resources Section issues a quarterly report on the Mission's progress in achieving gender parity.

Need to strengthen controls over the exercise of delegated authority

25. The United Nations Recruiter's Manual requires missions to perform recruitment activities in line with delegation of authority from the Under-Secretary-General for Field Support for positions up to and including the D-1 level. In MINUSMA, this authority is delegated to the SRSG who sub-delegates it to the Director of Mission Support (DMS). To facilitate the recruitment process, the DMS was required to sub-delegate to the Chief Human Resources Officer the administration and management of the Mission's recruitment and selection process.

26. On two occasions during the transition from one Chief Human Resources Officer to another, the DMS did not sub-delegate his delegation of authority to the Acting Chief Human Resources Officer who undertook recruitment actions for 9 job openings. This occurred because the Mission did not have a mechanism to monitor and ensure that appropriate sub-delegation of authority was in place for the recruitment of international staff. This exposed the Mission to the risk of unauthorized recruitment of staff.

(6) MINUSMA should establish adequate monitoring control over its delegation of authority for recruitment to ensure proper use of sub-delegated authority.

MINUSMA accepts recommendation 6 and stated that the gap in the delegation of authority for recruitment would be addressed once the recruitment of the Chief Human Resources Officer was completed and the Officer-in-Charge for the Human Resources Section got designated. Recommendation 6 remains open pending receipt of evidence that the DMS consistently delegates his authority to the Chief/Officer-in-Charge of the Mission's Human Resources Section.

Timeliness of recruitment actions needed to be monitored

27. The Office of Human Resources Management's guidance on implementation of delegation of authority for recruitment indicates that the timelines for completion of RfRs and PSJOs are 50 days and 197 days respectively.

28. Average recruitment timelines for the 111 posts were 99 days for RfRs and 248 days for PSJOs. The recruitment was delayed because the human resources officers and hiring managers did not adequately monitor the recruitment timelines and take prompt actions to address issues that were automatically notified to them through Inspira. As a result, there was a risk that MINUSMA was inadequately staffed to effectively deliver on its mandate; the Mission's vacancy rate was 23 per cent compared to the 15 per cent target.

(7) MINUSMA should adequately monitor the recruitment timelines and take prompt actions to mitigate recruitment delays.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 7 and stated that it would revamp the current recruitment monitoring report for an effective monitoring of the recruitment process. Recommendation 7 remains open pending receipt of evidence that the recruitment of international staff is processed within the required timelines.

Need to adequately document the recruitment process

29. ST/AI/2010/3 and ST/AI/2016/1 on the United Nations staff selection system require the hiring unit/section to maintain documentation consisting of written, printed or electronic material that provides information or evidence of the recruitment process. The record must be reasoned and objectively justifiable.

30. The Mission did not implement a mechanism to ensure that the recruitment process was adequately documented and recorded in Inspira. Five out of 111 job openings lacked some of the required supporting documentation such as job opening announcements, personal history profiles, comparative analysis reports, list of the candidates interviewed and the selection memoranda.

31. This resulted as human resources managers did not establish and implement an adequate oversight mechanism to ensure that the recruitment process was adequately documented and recorded in Inspira. As a result, there was a risk of irregular recruitment actions and selection of staff that did not have the required skills for the position.

(8) MINUSMA should establish and implement an oversight mechanism to ensure that the recruitment process is documented and recorded in Inspira.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 8 and stated that it would ensure that the recruitment process was properly documented and maintained in Inspira. The Mission would also periodically check the recruitment records for completeness and accuracy. Recommendation 8 remains open pending receipt of evidence of complete and accurate documentation of the recruitment process.

C. Temporary job openings

Need to improve justification and documentation of temporary appointments

32. The DPKO/DFS SOP on staff selection for temporary appointments provides the following: (a) a selection memorandum and a comparative analysis report for each recruitment should be approved by the DMS; and (b) the temporary appointment could be extended exceptionally beyond 364 days and up to a maximum 729 days where there is a surge requirement in field operations, a special project in the field continues for more than one year or operational needs related to field operations unexpectedly continue for more than the initial period of 364 days.

33. A review of the recruitment process for the sampled 40 TJOs indicated the following:

- Seven temporary appointments were exceptionally extended for more than 364 days without proper justification;
- The recruitment of candidates for 26 TJOs were not justified in the staff members' selection memorandum to ascertain that the TJOs resulted from operational needs. Also, selection memorandum for three TJO recruitments were not documented to ascertain that the recruitment was approved by the DMS;
- The job opening for three TJOs were not retained by the Mission to ensure that the vacancies were adequately advertised; and
- Comparative analysis reports for nine TJO recruitments beyond three months were not documented to ensure that staff were recruited through a competitive selection process.

34. The above conditions occurred because the Human Resources Section did not prioritize the establishment of oversight mechanisms for the documentation and monitoring of the TJO recruitment process. This increased the risk of irregular recruitments through TJOs.

(9) MINUSMA should document temporary job opening recruitments to ensure justification of each recruitment and exceptional extension.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 9 and stated that it would document TJO recruitments to ensure that they were justified, including exceptional extensions. Recommendation 9 remains open pending receipt of evidence that hiring managers and the Human Resources Section consistently comply with the DPKO/DFS SOP on staff selection for TJOs.

D. Reference checking

Need to comply with the reference checking requirements

35. DPKO/DFS SOP on staff selection requires the Reference Checking Unit at the United Nations Global Service Centre (UNGSC) in Brindisi to perform reference checks prior to offering an appointment to selected candidates. Reference checks consist of verifying the candidates' educational qualifications and employment history as indicated in the application. RSCE is responsible for the onboarding of MINUSMA staff including monitoring of reference checks of the staff conducted by UNGSC. Recruitments or offers of employment which are based on credentials that are not positively verified are required to be nullified or withdrawn.

36. A review of the recruitment process for 111 international staff indicated the following:

- Reference checks were not conducted for 33 (or 30 per cent) of the sampled recruited staff. Two of them separated from the Mission in February 2018 after working for two years, without being reference checked;
- Reference checks for six staff members who were still employed with the Mission were still ongoing. The reference check for one staff had been pending for more than four years and checks for the remaining five had been pending for eight months each; and
- Responses to UNGSC reference checks indicated that credentials for three staff, who were still working with the Mission, could not be positively verified. However, the Mission had not initiated necessary actions to withdraw their offer of employment.

37. This occurred due to a lack of oversight by the Human Resources Section and inadequate coordination and follow-up between MINUSMA, RSCE and UNGSC to ensure that selected candidates were adequately reference checked. Inadequate reference checks may lead to recruitment of unsuitable candidates for positions.

(10) MINUSMA should: (a) put in place a coordination and follow-up mechanism to ensure that reference checks are conducted prior to onboarding of recruited staff; and (b) take appropriate actions to withdraw the offer of employment of staff whose credentials cannot be positively verified.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 10 and stated that it would ensure that all reference checks were initiated prior to staff members' onboarding and completed in a reasonable time. The Mission had already taken action for four cases with negative reference checks and would, going forward, properly address instances of negative reference checks. Recommendation 10 remains open pending receipt of evidence that reference checks are completed within the required timelines and that the Mission has adequately addressed instances where the staff credentials cannot be positively verified.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

38. OIOS wishes to express its appreciation to the management and staff of MINUSMA for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.

(Signed) Eleanor T. Burns
Director, Internal Audit Division
Office of Internal Oversight Services

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

**Audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the
United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali**

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
1	MINUSMA should implement the civilian staffing review recommendations including the establishment and implementation of a nationalization strategy, a plan to outsource selected support activities and to rebalance resources where they are most needed, and the conduct of a comprehensive needs analysis of the Mission's capacity and structure	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of finalization and implementation of a nationalization strategy and comprehensive needs analysis of the Mission's capacity and structure.	30 June 2020
2	MINUSMA should establish and implement a recruitment plan to adequately monitor the Mission's recruitment process.	Important	O	Receipt of a copy of the recruitment plan and evidence of its implementation.	30 September 2018
3	MINUSMA should consistently conduct evaluation and substantive assessment of all the applicants against the required criteria in job openings.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that hiring managers consistently conduct evaluation and substantive assessment of all applicants.	31 December 2018
4	MINUSMA should establish and implement adequate supervisory controls to ensure that all panel members complete the United Nations competency-based interviewing training.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that all panel members selected to conduct interviews have completed the CBI training.	31 October 2018
5	MINUSMA should: (a) establish and implement adequate supervisory controls to ensure effective implementation of relevant policy and guidelines on gender parity; and (b) provide the Special Representative of the Secretary-General with quarterly reports on the Mission's progress in achieving gender parity.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that hiring managers consistently comply with relevant policy and guidelines on gender parity, and the Human Resources Section issues a quarterly report on the Mission's progress in achieving gender parity.	31 December 2018

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

³ C = closed, O = open

⁴ Date provided by MINUSMA in response to recommendations.

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

**Audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the
United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali**

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
6	MINUSMA should establish adequate monitoring control over its delegation of authority for recruitment to ensure proper use of sub-delegated authority.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that the Director of Mission Support consistently delegates his authority to the Chief/Officer-in-Charge of the Mission's Human Resources Section.	31 August 2018
7	MINUSMA should adequately monitor the recruitment timelines and take prompt actions to mitigate recruitment delays.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that the recruitment of international staff is processed within the required timelines.	31 December 2018
8	MINUSMA should establish and implement an oversight mechanism to ensure that the recruitment process is documented and recorded in Inspira.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of complete and accurate documentation of the recruitment process.	31 December 2018
9	MINUSMA should document temporary job opening recruitments to ensure justification of each recruitment and exceptional extension.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that hiring managers and the Human Resources Section consistently comply with the DPKO/DFS SOP on staff selection for TJOs.	31 December 2018
10	MINUSMA should: (a) put in place a coordination and follow-up mechanism to ensure that reference checks are conducted prior to onboarding of recruited staff; and (b) take appropriate actions to withdraw the offer of employment of staff whose credentials cannot be positively verified.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that reference checks are completed within the required timelines and that the Mission has adequately addressed instances where the staff credentials cannot be positively verified.	30 September 2018

APPENDIX I

Management Response

Management Response

**Audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the
United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali**

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
1	MINUSMA should implement the civilian staffing review recommendations including the establishment and implementation of a nationalization strategy, a plan to outsource selected support activities and to rebalance resources where they are most needed, and the conduct of a comprehensive needs analysis of the Mission's capacity and structure.	Important	Yes	SRSG/DMS	30 th June 2020	<p>Nationalization of roles for a mission of MINUSMA's size require extensive deliberations and a considerable transitional period. The mission has a draft nationalization strategy in-line with Field Personnel Division (FPD) guidelines in place and tentatively foresees initiation of nationalization efforts by 2020.</p> <p>With regard to the outsourcing of support activities, the Mission has already outsourced almost all construction projects, vehicle maintenance activities, medical services, etc. Furthermore, the Mission is in the process of outsourcing cleaning services.</p>
2	MINUSMA should establish and implement a recruitment plan to adequately monitor the Mission's recruitment process	Important	Yes	CHRO	30 September 2018	A Recruitment Plan consisting of all budgeted posts as well as associated tentative/definitive deadlines will be finalized by 30 September 2018.
3	MINUSMA should consistently conduct evaluation and substantive assessment of all the applicants against the required criteria in job openings.	Important	Yes	CHRO	Ongoing	MINUSMA will continue to conduct refresher trainings for all its hiring managers and sensitize them on recruitment related regulations and to

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

Management Response

**Audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the
United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali**

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
						conduct evaluations in line with the UN standards.
4	MINUSMA should establish and implement adequate supervisory controls to ensure that all panel members complete the United Nations competency-based interviewing training.	Important	Yes	Chief IMTC, CHRO	31 October 2018	To ensure that panel members complete the United Nations competency based interviews, the Integrated Mission Training Center (IMTC) unit has taken up the role of CBI Trainings. The mission will ensure that a database of all CBI Certified Trainers is maintained and HR will make reference to the database before selecting members of the interview panel. The expected completion date is 31st October 2018.
5	MINUSMA should: (a) establish and implement adequate supervisory controls to ensure effective implementation of relevant policy and guidelines on gender parity; and (b) provide the Special Representative of the Secretary-General with quarterly reports on the Mission's progress in achieving gender parity.	Important	Yes	CHRO	Ongoing	(a) Although all approval documents require hiring managers to confirm that all possible efforts are being made to ensure compliance to UN policies / goals regarding gender parity, the mission will still review the existing procedures / documents to ascertain any gaps and will take corrective action accordingly (b) All mission reports including the mission SRSG level reports always have latest information on mission's progress with regards to achieving gender parity.
6	MINUSMA should establish adequate monitoring control over its delegation of authority for recruitment to ensure proper use of sub-delegated authority.	Important	Yes	DMS	31 August 2018	Due to the temporary appointment of the Chief HR Officer to another Mission and the reassignment of the OIC, HR Officer, as well as

Management Response

**Audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the
United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali**

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
						<p>management's decision to provide an opportunity to a female candidate to fill the CHRO post, delays in the recruitment process occurred, creating a gap and the need for oversight on the sub-delegation of recruitment authority. This situation will be addressed once the OIC HR gets designation and the CHRO joins the Mission, which should be soon.</p> <p>Despite of the above however, the management is of the view that this situation did not adversely affect the Mission's recruitment process or created any risks affecting the integrity of the process.</p>
7	MINUSMA should adequately monitor the recruitment timelines and take prompt actions to mitigate recruitment delays.	Important	Yes	CHRO	31 December 2018	Mission HR team regularly produces Recruitment Status reports. The current format will be revamped to allow an interface to more closely monitor recruitment timelines. Expected completion date is 31 December 2018.
8	MINUSMA should establish and implement an oversight mechanism to ensure that the recruitment process is documented and recorded in Inspira.	Important	Yes	CHRO	31 December 2018	MINUSMA will establish and implement an oversight mechanism to ensure that recruitment process is properly documented and maintained in Inspira. MINUSMA HR team is currently maintaining all records pertaining to recruitment in Inspira and will ensure that they are

Management Response

**Audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the
United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali**

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
						periodically checked for completeness and accuracy.
9	MINUSMA should document temporary job opening recruitments to ensure justification of each recruitment and exceptional extension.	Important	Yes	CHRO	Ongoing	MINUSMA already has an extensive process in place that lays down the requirements, which are to be followed by all hiring managers for approval and any subsequent extension of temporary appointments. The mission has the authority to extend the temporary appointments beyond one year that is only done once required review and approval process has been completed. For monitoring purposes, the Mission HR team will ensure that staff files are well documented.
10	MINUSMA should: (a) put in place a coordination and follow-up mechanism to ensure that reference checks are conducted prior to onboarding of recruited staff; and (b) take appropriate actions to withdraw the offer of employment of staff whose credentials cannot be positively verified.	Important	Yes	CHRO	30 September 2018	(a) MINUSMA HR team currently coordinates the initiation of reference checking process with Regional Service Centre in Entebbe and will continue ensuring that all reference checks are initiated prior to staff member's onboarding and subsequently completed in a reasonable time (b) The Mission has already taken action for four cases where reference checks were not positive and will continue to initiate corrective actions

Management Response

Audit of the recruitment and selection of international staff in the
United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
						whenever there is an instance of negative reference check.