



INTERNAL AUDIT DIVISION

REPORT 2018/087

Audit of protection of civilians operations in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali

The Mission needed to strengthen its oversight of the functioning of working groups for protection of civilians and the development of threat risk assessments to improve the effectiveness of its protection of civilians operations

24 September 2018
Assignment No. AP2017/641/04

Audit of protection of civilians operations in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of protection of civilians (PoC) operations in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali (MINUSMA). The objective of the audit was to assess the efficiency and effectiveness of PoC operations in MINUSMA. The audit covered the period from 1 January 2016 to 31 March 2018 and included the following key aspects of PoC operations in the Mission: governance and oversight; threat risk assessments; PoC operational activities such as patrols by military and police components; contingency planning; and public information strategy.

MINUSMA established a senior mission leadership team to oversee the development and implementation of its PoC strategy, and a PoC Unit and joint working groups at headquarters and in the regions to plan and implement actions to protect civilians. However, oversight of the functioning of the working groups was not sufficiently effective and the threat risk assessments of the regions were not properly developed.

OIOS made seven recommendations. To address issues identified in the audit, MINUSMA needed to:

- Strengthen its managerial oversight of the functioning of PoC working groups to enforce attendance at meetings and properly review and monitor the implementation of action plans on PoC operations;
- Provide adequate guidance on and update threat risk assessments, including ranking of hotspots, to prioritize PoC activities of the Mission;
- Provide necessary accommodation and facilities in the regions for female individual police officers;
- Expedite the recruitment of the nine remaining community liaison assistants and develop and implement mechanisms to manage their deployment and performance;
- Develop and implement adequate community alert networks to improve sharing of relevant information among stakeholders and contribute to achieving the mandate of protecting civilians;
- Put in place target timelines for all regions to develop and regularly test their contingency plans for PoC; and
- Develop and implement a Mission-wide communication and public information strategy incorporating the PoC element.

MINUSMA accepted the recommendations and has initiated action to implement them.

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	1-2
III. AUDIT RESULTS	2-8
A. Governance and oversight	2-3
B. Threat risk assessment	3
C. Operational activities	4-7
D. Contingency planning and public information strategy	7-8
IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	8
ANNEX I Status of audit recommendations	
APPENDIX I Management response	

Audit of protection of civilians operations in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali

I. BACKGROUND

1. The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of protection of civilians (PoC) operations in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali (MINUSMA).
2. Over the past two decades, the United Nations Security Council has placed increasing importance on PoC and the role of the United Nations peacekeeping missions in protecting local populations. MINUSMA has a PoC mandate derived from successive Security Council resolutions, which is implemented through a three-tier approach comprising: dialogue and engagement with the Government and perpetrators of violence against civilians; physical protection through, for example, patrols conducted separately by the MINUSMA police and military components and jointly with the Malian security forces; and creating a protective environment through long-term peacebuilding initiatives.
3. The main threats to the local civilians were inter-armed group tensions, improvised explosive devices (IEDs), targeted kidnappings and assassinations, inter-and intra-community tensions, armed banditry and intimidation. The number of recorded incidents increased from 658 to 994 (by 51 per cent) and the number of victims from 621 to 715 (by 15 per cent) in 2016 and 2017 respectively.
4. The MINUSMA PoC Unit is responsible for coordinating the PoC activities and for reporting and providing advice to the Mission management and regional working groups. The Unit, which is headed by a Senior PoC Advisor at the P-5 level, has six approved posts including two United Nations volunteers. For the period reviewed by the audit, there was no separate budget for the PoC programme because it was a Mission-wide activity implemented jointly by the police, military and civilian components within their respective budgetary allocations.
5. Comments provided by MINUSMA are incorporated in italics.

II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

6. The objective of the audit was to assess the efficiency and effectiveness of PoC operations in MINUSMA.
7. This audit was included in the 2017 risk-based work plan of OIOS due to the critical nature of PoC for the local population and to the achievement of the MINUSMA mandate.
8. OIOS conducted this audit from January to May 2018. The audit covered the period from 1 January 2016 to 31 March 2018. Based on an activity-level risk assessment, the audit covered higher and medium risk areas in the PoC operations in MINUSMA which included: governance and oversight; threat risk assessments; PoC operational activities such as patrols by military and police components; and contingency planning and public information strategy.
9. The audit methodology included: (a) interviews of key personnel, (b) reviews of relevant documentation, and (c) visits to Timbuktu, Gao, Kidal, Menaka and Mopti.

10. The audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing.

III. AUDIT RESULTS

A. Governance and oversight

Needed to improve oversight of the functioning of PoC working groups

11. The Departments of Peacekeeping Operations and Field Support (DPKO/DFS) policy on the protection of civilians in United Nations peacekeeping (hereafter referred to as the DPKO/DFS PoC policy) requires the establishment of: (a) a strategic level senior management group on PoC to oversee the development and implementation of the Mission's PoC strategy; and (b) an operational coordination structure involving all components of the Mission. Toward this end, the MINUSMA PoC strategy requires the establishment of PoC working groups in the five regions and a working group at headquarters in Bamako to identify threats to civilians and make appropriate decisions to mitigate them.

12. The Mission established a senior mission leadership team, a strategic level organ comprising the Special Representative of the Secretary-General (SRSG), the Deputy SRSG-Political, the Deputy SRSG-Humanitarian Coordinator, the Force Commander and the Police Commissioner. This senior mission leadership team took strategic decisions on the development and implementation of the Mission's PoC strategy and provided overall guidance on operational responses to PoC threats. The Mission also regularly collaborated with external stakeholders, such as the United Nations Country Team, international and national non-governmental organizations and other protection and humanitarian actors.

13. MINUSMA also established the headquarters PoC working group and the regional PoC working groups involving civilian, police and military components to plan, implement, report, measure and evaluate the implementation of the PoC programme in MINUSMA. The working groups were supervised by the senior mission leadership team and respective heads of offices. The headquarters PoC working group was mainly responsible for providing overall advice on PoC activities, whereas the regional PoC working groups were responsible for developing threat assessments and implementing action plans to mitigate the threats.

14. However, some members of the headquarters PoC working group did not consistently attend the meetings held. Out of the 20 members expected to attend the meetings, only one member attended all the meetings, with seven members attending less than half of them. Interview of the members indicated that they could not attend all meetings due to other commitments within and outside the Mission.

15. Furthermore, a review of some key recommendations recorded in the action plans resulting from meetings of the headquarters PoC working group indicated that MINUSMA did not effectively follow up on their implementation. For example, 4 out of the 13 recommended actions from April and May 2017 were not included in the June/July 2017 action plan although they had not been implemented. These included important issues such as the need to: (a) implement a strategic, coordinated patrol system in three key locations to reduce the scope of insecurity and threats to civilians; (b) expedite the implementation of two income-generating quick-impact projects in relation to activities for unemployed youths; (c) engage with the Malian Justice Department to enhance its capacity to implement fair treatment and fair trial of accused citizens; and (d) increase support of the Human Rights Protection Division of the Mission to the special investigation committee.

16. The above occurred because of inadequate oversight by senior management. The Mission did not effectively monitored implementation of recommended actions for PoC and supervise functioning of the

PoC working groups. In addition, the Mission did not have a mechanism to enforce mandatory attendance of members or their representatives at PoC working group meetings and hold non-participating members accountable. The above contributed to the weaknesses in the Mission's PoC operations, as discussed in this report.

(1) MINUSMA should take steps to strengthen its managerial oversight of the functioning of protection of civilians (PoC) working groups to establish a mechanism to enforce attendance at meetings and to properly review and monitor the implementation of action plans on PoC operations.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 1 and stated that it would instruct working groups to strengthen their activities regarding threat risk assessment and follow-up of recommendations, as well as implementing a follow-up matrix circulated before and after each PoC working group meeting to increase attendance. The existing evaluation forms would be used to report the cases of not implementing the recommended actions due to the changing nature of threats. Recommendation 1 remains open pending receipt of evidence of improved attendance at PoC working group meetings and receipt of PoC meeting minutes documenting proper review and follow-up of required actions.

B. Threat risk assessment

Need to improve threat risk assessments

17. The DPKO/DFS PoC policy requires, as a key strategic planning tool, the Mission to review situations of impending physical violence on civilians as threats and evaluate the risk associated with each threat based on the likelihood of occurrence and the potential impact. The PoC policy provides guidance on some baseline standards and indicators to use in developing the risk assessment and defining the priorities to address the risks.

18. The Mission conducted threat risk assessments. However, the overall risk rating at each of the hotspot locations and main roads did not clearly indicate all relevant factors, such as presence of patrols by MINUSMA or Malian security forces and recent incidents at the locations and main roads.

19. This occurred because MINUSMA had not developed adequate guidance and procedures for the working groups to carry out the threat risk assessments to enable the Mission to prioritize PoC actions on the highest ranked locations. As of March 2018, MINUSMA started to pilot a new threat risk assessment form in one region which however did not provide the essential, consistent guidance covering all regions. The above contributed to the inability of the Mission to respond in timely to some reported PoC situations.

(2) MINUSMA should take actions to provide guidance on and update threat risk assessments on protection of civilians (PoC), including ranking of hotspots, to prioritize PoC activities of the Mission.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 2 and stated that all regions but one had been using a new threat risk assessment framework and a guidance note on ranking of hotspots was being prepared in consultation with the national protection cluster. The Mission also stated that an untimely response may be due to a capacity gap, competing Mission priorities and security and seasonal access limitations, especially in the central region with floodplains inaccessible for half a year. Recommendation 2 remains open pending receipt of the updated PoC threat risk assessments and guidance on the ranking of hotspots.

C. Operational activities

The number of patrols fell due to increased requirements to provide security escorts for civilians

20. The results-based budgets (RBB) for MINUSMA for fiscal years 2015/16 and 2016/17 established that the military component was to conduct 15,144 and 8,208 missions and patrols, respectively. The RBB for fiscal year 2017/18 provided relevant indicators of achievement such as reducing the numbers of human rights violations raised with armed groups and intercommunal conflicts to under 15 and 50 respectively.

21. A review of the 2015/16 budget performance report indicated that the military component conducted a total of 19,600 missions and patrols against the budget of 15,144. During fiscal year 2016/17, the military component conducted only 3,738 against the 8,208 planned missions and patrols; an underachievement of the plan by 45 per cent. In addition, the military component did not effectively monitor the achievement of indicators on the number of human rights violations.

22. The low number of missions and patrols resulted because the military component allocated more time to the protection of United Nations personnel and property in response to the deteriorating security situation in the country, such as providing convoy escorts for Mission vehicles transporting supplies on the main roads. The budgeted patrols and missions were also reduced by 46 per cent between 2015/16 and 2016/17 fiscal years to take into account the fact that more resources would be deployed in protecting United Nations property, personnel and other assets. The military component explained that it was not monitoring the RBB indicators of achievement due to many external factors that were beyond its control. OIOS plans to conduct an audit of military operations later in 2018/19, and will review this area in more detail, thus no recommendation on military patrolling is being made at this time.

The police component needed to increase the number of patrols in the Kidal region

23. As part of the three-tier approach in the DPKO/DFS PoC policy and the MINUSMA concept of operations, the Mission is required to conduct patrols to build confidence among the communities and serve as a deterrent to potential perpetrators of violence against civilians with the presence of the police in the area.

24. An OIOS audit of United Nations police operations in MINUSMA conducted in October 2017 (assignment number AP2017/641/8) indicated that the budgeted number of police patrols for fiscal years 2015/16 and 2016/17 were not realistic. Therefore, OIOS analysis of the performance of the police component was based on a comparative review of the police patrols conducted from January 2016 to December 2017. This analysis indicated that the police conducted 15,133 patrols in 2017, representing a six per cent increase from the previous year. The objectives of the patrols included interviews with the local population to gather information and explain the MINUSMA mandate. The police also used the patrols to provide humanitarian assistance and undertook other activities such as educating the local population on emerging security issues. These activities were intended to strengthen the relationship and foster trust with the local population. Weekly patrols were conducted in seven regions.

25. However, the weekly patrols in one region significantly decreased in 2017 due to increased IED threats and the need for an increased number of civilian escorts on field missions. In addition, the police component was reliant on a military unit specializing in explosive ordnance disposal to inspect access routes prior to patrols being undertaken. The United Nations Mine Action Service, in April and May 2018, trained and equipped the newly rotated Formed Police Unit (FPU) in this region with IED detection equipment to enable them to conduct the required patrols. By July 2018, the FPU was conducting eight patrols per week. The Mission stated that it would continue to conduct threat assessments of its areas of operation and decide

on the best course of action to implement its PoC mandate including the determination of the optimum number of patrols. As the Mission explained its approach, OIOS is not making a recommendation on the patrol activities in this particular region.

Increased deployment of armoured personnel carriers was underway

26. In August 2016, the Police Division of the Office of the Rule of Law and Security Institutions, DPKO, in consultation with police-contributing countries, issued a new statement of unit requirements (SUR) for FPU, requiring deployment of 103 police armoured personnel carriers (APCs) with a capacity for protecting against mines and IEDs.

27. As of March 2018, the MINUSMA police component had 90 APCs, instead of 103, because DPKO had not effectively followed up with police-contributing countries to revise the relevant memoranda of understanding to ensure full compliance with the SUR in August 2016. In response to the Santos Cruz Report on improving security for United Nations peacekeepers, the Mission formulated action plans, which included harmonizing the memoranda of understanding with the SUR. The Mission also established a working group responsible for monitoring the implementation of the action plans. The working group reviewed progress monthly and provided updates to DPKO/DFS. As action was being taken, no recommendation was made to address the shortfall in APCs.

Need to deploy more women in the military and police components

28. The policy on gender equality in United Nations peacekeeping requires MINUSMA to be inclusive, non-discriminatory and gender-balanced to ensure that peacekeepers consult equally with women and men of the local population in all decisions affecting them. The principle of gender balance requires the Mission's staffing profile to reflect the United Nations' commitments to the equal representation of men and women in the military and police components of the Mission.

29. There was a significant underrepresentation of women among the military and police components. As of March 2018, out of the 1,431 personnel deployed in FPU, only 67 (or 5 per cent) were women. Out of the 306 individual police officers, only 57 (or 19 per cent) were women. Among the military, out of the 11,477 deployed, only 314 (or 3 per cent) were women.

30. The policy on gender equality was recently launched and its implementation requires time and effort by all stakeholders. For its part, however, the Mission had not built enough accommodation and other facilities for women, particularly in Kidal and Menaka to enable their deployment. Due to a shortfall in women police officers, MINUSMA was having challenges in effectively engaging with the local female population during patrols and other missions to investigate incidents and to facilitate dialogue, reconciliation and cohesion among communities.

(3) MINUSMA should construct the necessary accommodation and facilities in the regions for female individual police officers to enable their deployment.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 3 and stated that it would take all necessary efforts to provide accommodation and facilities for female individual police officers, while DPKO/DFS would lead the development of a gender-sensitive strategy to guide the recruitment of police officers. Recommendation 3 remains open pending receipt of evidence of the construction of accommodation and facilities for female individual police officers in the regions.

Need to recruit and deploy community liaison assistants as planned

31. The MINUSMA PoC strategy requires the Mission to deploy community liaison assistants (CLAs) close to the local population, authorities and civil society organizations. CLAs work together with the military and police components and contribute to information gathering and creation of a trust-based relationship between MINUSMA and the local population.

32. Only 21 out of 30 CLA posts were filled as of March 2018. Out of the 21 CLAs, only 14 were working closely with the military and police components to perform their core tasks; the remaining 7 were assigned to other tasks. Also, CLAs were not all based at their designated duty stations, citing security reasons. The Mission also explained that one CLA resigned in March 2018 because of threats from his community.

33. The vacancies occurred because the Mission did not have an adequate mechanism to manage and administer CLAs deployment, taking into account security concerns. To address this, the Mission issued standard operating procedures on the recruitment, administration, supervision and performance evaluation of CLAs in June 2018. There was an increased risk that MINUSMA may not receive important information and miss the opportunity to establish trust with communities in implementing its mandate to protect civilians.

(4) MINUSMA should take steps to expedite the recruitment of the nine remaining community liaison assistants and develop and implement mechanisms to manage their deployment and performance.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 4 and stated that one additional CLA had been recruited for Kidal and the recruitment of other CLAs was ongoing. Their duty stations would be reviewed according to the developments and needs. Recommendation 4 remains open pending receipt of evidence that all CLAs have been recruited, and steps taken to improve the deployment and performance of CLAs.

Need to implement community alert networks

34. MINUSMA prepared the concept for implementing a community alert network in November 2017. The key objective of such network was to enhance the early warning system and for the Mission and other national and community actors to timely respond to imminent attacks.

35. However, at the time of the audit, no community alert network was in place due to budgetary constraints. As a result, there was a missed opportunity for MINUSMA to strengthen its PoC operations to achieve their objectives more effectively.

(5) MINUSMA should develop and implement adequate community alert networks to improve sharing of relevant information among stakeholders and contribute to achieving the mandate of protecting civilians.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 5 and stated that the budget provisions for a project to strengthen community alert networks for an enhanced PoC was approved for the fiscal year 2018/19 and the project would commence in August 2018. Recommendation 5 remains open pending receipt of evidence that community alert networks have been implemented.

The Mission provided the required training

36. The DPKO/DFS PoC policy requires MINUSMA to conduct in-mission PoC training for the military, police and civilian staff. All new civilian staff, individual police officers, military observers and staff officers attended induction training, which included a briefing on PoC. Also, the PoC officers in the regions provided training for the military contingents and FPU's in the regions on request. OIOS concluded that the Mission provided trainings on PoC as required.

D. Contingency planning and public information strategy

Need to develop contingency plans for all regions

37. The Mission's PoC strategy requires the development and maintenance of contingency plans through the regional PoC working groups. As part of such contingency plans, the Mission is required to develop potential PoC scenarios, such as deliberate targeting of civilians by armed groups, massive and critical inter-ethnic violence and violent civil unrest.

38. As at 31 May 2018, the PoC working group in one region had not yet submitted their PoC contingency plans to the PoC Unit. The working groups in four other regions submitted draft plans that had not been finalized. Further, these draft plans were not comprehensive, as the only scenario developed was that of civilians seeking protection at MINUSMA bases. Furthermore, none of the regions had conducted tests to ensure that the plans would work effectively.

39. The Mission had issued guidelines to all the regions in May 2015 to guide the preparation of contingency plans. However, target timelines to complete and test contingency plans had not been established. The lack of effective regional contingency plans increased the risk of failure to respond to threats and adequately protect civilians.

(6) MINUSMA should put in place target timelines for all regions to develop and regularly test their contingency plans for protection of civilians.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 6 and stated that Mission leadership would ensure, through the Senior PoC Adviser, that regional offices finalize their contingency plans and propose timelines for their testing. The Mission further stated that an unforeseen critical event would be covered under the Mission's crisis management procedures. Recommendation 6 remains open pending receipt of evidence that all the regions have finalized and tested their contingency plans.

Need to implement a communication and public information strategy

40. The DPKO/DFS PoC policy requires the Mission to develop and implement a communication and public information strategy in relation to PoC to ensure that all stakeholders, particularly the local community, are aware of the Mission's PoC mandate.

41. The Mission did not develop a PoC communication and outreach plan. As an ad hoc approach, MINUSMA used its Radio Mikado, patrols and visits to meet with community leaders and individuals such as merchants at weekly markets protected by MINUSMA. However, this ad hoc approach had limitations such as inadequate infrastructure for Radio Mikado and difficulty to schedule and conduct regular, frequent visits due to security and logistical reasons.

42. This happened because the Mission did not have an overall communication and public information strategy. As a result, there was an increased risk that civilians and communities were not aware of the Mission's PoC responsibility and activities for seeking assistance from or supporting the Mission.

(7) MINUSMA should develop and implement a Mission-wide communication and public information strategy incorporating the protection of civilians element.

MINUSMA accepted recommendation 7 and stated that it was revising the communication strategy which would incorporate the PoC element. Recommendation 7 remains open pending receipt of documents containing a Mission-wide communication and public information strategy incorporating the PoC element.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

43. OIOS wishes to express its appreciation to the management and staff of MINUSMA for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.

(Signed) Eleanor T. Burns
Director, Internal Audit Division
Office of Internal Oversight Services

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of protection of civilians operations in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
1	MINUSMA should take steps to strengthen its managerial oversight of the functioning of protection of civilians (PoC) working groups to establish a mechanism to enforce attendance at meetings and to properly review and monitor the implementation of action plans on PoC operations.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of improved attendance at PoC working group meetings and receipt of PoC meeting minutes documenting proper review and follow-up of required actions.	31 December 2018
2	MINUSMA should take actions to provide guidance on and update threat risk assessments on protection of civilians (PoC), including ranking of hotspots, to prioritize PoC activities of the Mission.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of the updated PoC threat risk assessments and guidance on the ranking of hotspots.	30 June 2019
3	MINUSMA should construct the necessary accommodation and facilities in the regions for female individual police officers to enable their deployment.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of construction of accommodation and facilities for female individual police officers in the regions.	30 June 2019
4	MINUSMA should take steps to expedite the recruitment of the nine remaining community liaison assistants and develop and implement mechanisms to manage their deployment and performance.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that all CLAs have been recruited, and steps taken to improve the deployment and performance of CLAs.	30 June 2019
5	MINUSMA should develop and implement adequate community alert networks to improve sharing of relevant information among stakeholders and contribute to achieving the mandate of protecting civilians.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of implementing community alert networks.	30 June 2019
6	MINUSMA should put in place target timelines for all regions to develop and regularly test their contingency plans for protection of civilians.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence that all the regions have finalized and tested their contingency plans.	30 June 2019

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

³ C = closed, O = open

⁴ Date provided by MINUSMA in response to recommendations.

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of protection of civilians operations in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical/ Important²	C/ O³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date⁴
7	MINUSMA should develop and implement a Mission-wide communication and public information strategy incorporating the protection of civilians element.	Important	O	Receipt of documents containing a Mission-wide communication and public information strategy incorporating the PoC element.	30 June 2019

APPENDIX I

Management Response

APPENDIX I

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical⁵/ Important⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
1	MINUSMA should take steps to strengthen its managerial oversight of the functioning of protection of civilians (PoC) working groups to establish a mechanism to enforce attendance at meetings and to properly review and monitor the implementation of action plans on PoC operations.	Important	Yes	Heads of office, Sector Commanders, Force Deputy-Chief of Staff-Operations; Senior Protection of civilians Adviser; Chief of Staff; Protection of Civilians Unit	31 December 2018	<p>MINUSMA will ensure that the various working groups at HQ and regional levels continue to meet at an appropriate frequency with adequate participation. They will be instructed to strengthen their activities with regards to threat risk assessments and follow-up of recommendations.</p> <p>Moreover, actions recommended during a Protection of civilian working groups (PoC) working group meeting may not be implemented due to the changing nature of threats. These cases should be reported in existing evaluation forms and this will be enforced.</p> <p>The Mission will implement the recommendation by ensuring a follow-up matrix is circulated before and after each PoC working groups' meetings. For the regional PoC working group meetings, the Mission will request that minutes, including the signed list of participants, be sent to the POC team in Bamako, with a deadline for submission.</p>
2	MINUSMA should take actions to provide guidance on and update threat risk assessments on protection of civilians	Important	Yes	Heads of office, Sector Commanders, Force Deputy-	30 June 2019	This recommendation will be taken care of with the PoC working groups meeting on a regular basis and with a proper follow-up process.

⁵Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

⁶ Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical⁵/ Important⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
	(PoC), including ranking of hotspots, to prioritize PoC activities of the Mission.			Chief of Staff- Operations; Senior Protection of civilians Adviser		<p>In addition, all regions but Kidal (staffing reason) have been using a new threat risk assessment framework. A guidance note on the ranking of hot spots is also in preparation in consultation with the national Protection Cluster.</p> <p>Nevertheless, reasons for an untimely response may not be a proper or improper risk assessment but a capacity gap and competing Mission priorities. Furthermore, MINUSMA's delayed reaction may not only be due to security but also seasonal access limitations, especially in Central Region with floodplains inaccessible for 6 months a year. (Paragraph 19)</p>
3	MINUSMA should construct the necessary accommodation and facilities in the regions for female individual police officers to enable their deployment.	Important	Yes	Chief of Staff; Director Mission Support; Gender Unit; MINUSMA Police	30 June 2019	The Mission will make all necessary efforts to provide necessary accommodation and facilities for female individual police officers. DPKO/DFS would be in the lead to develop a gender-sensitive strategy for generating police units and recruit uniformed personnel.
4	MINUSMA should take steps to expedite the recruitment of the nine remaining community liaison assistants and develop and implement mechanisms to manage their deployment and performance.	Important	Yes	Director Mission Support; Civil Affairs Division	30 June 2019	The recruitment of community liaison assistants (CLAs) is ongoing: one more CLA was recruited for Kidal bringing the number to twenty-two (22) CLAs on board out of thirty (30). CLAs duty stations will be reviewed according to the developments/needs which changed since they were first deployed, i e.. Lere base was handed

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical⁵/ Important⁶	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
						over to the government of Mali, security situation etc.
5	MINUSMA should develop and implement adequate community alert networks to improve sharing of relevant information among stakeholders and contribute to achieving the mandate of protecting civilians.	Important	Yes	Civil Affairs Division; Human Rights and Protection Division	30 June 2019	A project aiming at Strengthening Community Alert Networks for an enhanced Protection of Civilians was approved in the Mission budget FY 2018/19 and will start in August 2018.
6	MINUSMA should put in place target timelines for all regions to develop and regularly test their contingency plans for protection of civilians.	Important	Yes	Chief of Staff; Heads of offices Protection of Civilians Unit	30 June 2019	MINUSMA Leadership will ensure, through the POC Adviser, that regional offices finalize their contingency plans and propose timelines for their testing. According to paragraph 40 of MINUSMA PoC Strategy, in case of an unforeseen critical event, the Mission will above all refer to the MINUSMA Standard operating procedures on Crisis Management and, if pertinent to the crisis, in conjunction with the MINUSMA guidelines on civilians seeking protection at MINUSMA bases.
7	MINUSMA should develop and implement a Mission-wide communication and public information strategy incorporating the protection of civilians element.	Important	Yes	Strategic Communications and Public Information Division; Protection of civilians working groups; Chief of Staff; Protection of Civilians Unit	30 June 2019	Strategic Communications and Public Information Division is revising MINUSMA communication strategy in light of Security Council Resolution (SCR) 2423. POC will be included in the said strategy.