



INTERNAL AUDIT DIVISION

REPORT 2019/144

Audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic

The Mission needed to finalize its security sector reform support strategy and enhance work plan development and implementation

**24 December 2019
Assignment No. AP2019/637/07**

Audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic (MINUSCA). The objective of the audit was to assess the effectiveness of the security sector reform support programme in MINUSCA. The audit covered the period from 1 July 2017 to 30 June 2019 and included a review of: strategic and work planning; work plan implementation; and performance assessment and staff training.

MINUSCA was providing support to the Government of the Central African Republic to establish key policies and legislative documents to reform security institutions of the country and recruit and train defence and security personnel. However, MINUSCA had not developed a security sector reform support strategy which was necessary to provide overall guidance to the Mission's components on implementation of security sector reform mandates and operational activities. Also, some of the planned activities in the Mission's work plan for its security sector reform support programme were not fully implemented and lacked specific and measurable outputs and targets.

OIOS made eight recommendations. To address the issues identified in the audit, MINUSCA needed to:

- Finalize its security sector reform support strategy;
- Ensure that Mission leadership enhances coordination with other security sector reform actors and follows up on the status of issues discussed and recommendations made during coordination meetings;
- Ensure that the work plan of the Security Sector Reform Section is developed with specific, measurable and realistic outputs and targets;
- Support national authorities to establish tools for monitoring pledges and contributions received to strengthen the country's security sector;
- Ensure that planned capacity building activities are carried out in a timely manner;
- Enhance the Mission leadership's advocacy for the national authorities to establish a policy on vetting of uniformed personnel and ex-combatants to be integrated into defence and security forces;
- Designate focal points and implement procedures for systematic collection, classification and archiving of data in the COSMOS repository system; and
- Formulate a training budget for the Security Sector Reform Section based on staff needs assessment and monitor the utilization of the budget to benefit all staff.

MINUSCA accepted the recommendations and has initiated action to implement them.

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	1
III. AUDIT RESULTS	2-8
A. Strategic and work planning	2-4
B. Work plan implementation	4-7
C. Performance assessment and staff training	7-8
IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	8

ANNEX I Status of audit recommendations

APPENDIX I Management response

Audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic

I. BACKGROUND

1. The Office of Internal Oversight Services (OIOS) conducted an audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic (MINUSCA).
2. Pursuant to Security Council resolutions 2151, 2301, 2387 and 2448, the MINUSCA Security Sector Reform (SSR) Section, in coordination with other Mission components and international partners, is responsible for supporting the Government of the Central African Republic (CAR) by: (a) providing strategic and technical advice on the development and implementation of a national SSR strategy; (b) assisting the national authorities to vet its defence and security personnel relating to possible human rights violations, and develop an incentive structure for internal security forces (ISF) comprising police and gendarmerie; and (c) conducting capacity building and development activities.
3. The SSR Section was headed by a Chief at the D-1 level reporting to the Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary-General, Political and Civilians Protection. The Section had three cells, namely, Policy and Planning, Operations and Coordination, and the Defence Support Sector Liaison Team. During the financial year 2018/19, the SSR Section had 11 approved posts consisting of 7 international, 2 national staff and 2 United Nations volunteers, assisted by 8 military staff officers. The approved operating budgets of the Section for 2017/18 and 2018/19 were \$680,000 and \$250,000, respectively.
4. Comments provided by MINUSCA are incorporated in italics.

II. AUDIT OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

5. The objective of the audit was to assess the effectiveness of the security sector reform support activities in MINUSCA.
6. This audit was included in the 2019 risk-based work plan of OIOS due to the strategic, operational and reputational risks arising from MINUSCA not achieving its mandate to support the government of CAR in developing and implementing a national strategy on SSR.
7. OIOS conducted this audit from June to September 2019. The audit covered the period from 1 July 2017 to 30 June 2019. Based on an activity-level risk assessment, the audit covered higher and medium risk areas in SSR support which included: strategic and work planning; work plan implementation; and performance assessment and staff training.
8. The audit methodology included interviews with key personnel, review of relevant documentation, and analytical review of data.
9. The audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing.

III. AUDIT RESULTS

A. Strategic and work planning

Need to finalize the security sector reform support strategy

10. To effectively support the security sector reform of the country, MINUSCA was required to develop a Mission-specific support strategy and establish reform priorities and timelines.

11. MINUSCA developed a draft strategy for SSR support to CAR in 2018. However, as of September 2019, the SSR Section had not reviewed and finalized it for implementation by the concerned Mission components. OIOS' review of the draft strategy indicated that it was incomplete as it did not include key elements such as: (a) guiding principles of United Nations programming on gender and human rights considerations; (b) clear, realistic, measurable and time-bound objectives; (c) human and financial resources required; and (d) coordination mechanisms to integrate and harmonize the work of the various actors. This was attributable to the SSR Section's focus on implementation of four other unforeseen priority activities assigned by the Mission's leadership. The absence of a formal strategy hindered effective planning and implementation of some SSR mandated activities, as elaborated later in the present report.

(1) MINUSCA should finalize its security sector reform support strategy to provide overall guidance to the Mission's components on the implementation of security sector reform mandates and operational activities.

MINUSCA accepted recommendation 1 and stated that the SSR Section would finalize the strategy for SSR including: guiding principles of United Nations programming; clear, measurable and time bound objectives; required resources; and coordination mechanisms. Recommendation 1 remains open pending receipt of the approved security sector reform support strategy.

Need to strengthen SSR coordination mechanisms

12. To achieve coherence and efficiently utilize scarce resources in supporting SSR in the country, MINUSCA needs to ensure effective coordination with United Nations Country Team (UNCT), national authorities and other external partners/donors.

13. MINUSCA had established two major coordination mechanisms – an SSR Task Force with the United Nations Development Programme, and the CAR SSR International Coordination Group with UNCT and international partners, to be chaired by MINUSCA leadership, for which the SSR Section served as the secretariat. However, the MINUSCA SSR Task Force and the CAR SSR International Coordination Group did not function as intended. For instance, a joint annual work plan was not prepared as agreed during the first meeting of the Task Force in October 2016. Also, the Task Force and the Group did not meet regularly, and the issues discussed during the meetings, although documented, were not systematically followed up.

14. The above resulted because MINUSCA leadership, due to other priority engagements, had not yet reviewed and formally approved the draft terms of reference of the Task Force and Group and had not regularly convened their meetings and followed up on the status of issues discussed and recommendations made during each meeting. This resulted in overlap of SSR-related efforts by other Mission components such as the Justice and Corrections Section, as the SSR Section acknowledged, and a risk that the international support for the country's security sector reform was not sufficiently cohesive. For example, support provided by both the SSR and the Justice and Corrections Sections and the other international

partners regarding their contributions to the development and adoption of an interagency concept for prison security through demilitarization of corrections services was not adequately coordinated and integrated.

(2) MINUSCA should ensure its leadership enhance coordination with other security sector reform actors in the country and ensure effective functioning of coordination mechanisms through regular meetings and follow-up on the status of issues discussed and recommendations made during meetings.

MINUSCA accepted recommendation 2 and stated that the draft of the MINUSCA SSR Task Force terms of reference would be reviewed and submitted to the new Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary-General for approval. The SSR Section had already engaged in discussions with the police component and was reviewing the objectives and mechanisms of the international working group on the Integrated Strategic Framework, taking into consideration the new dynamic with a new European Union Civilian Mission and the need to reinforce the objectives and coherence of the international assistance. Recommendation 2 remains open pending receipt of evidence of the measures taken to ensure effectiveness of coordination mechanisms and of follow-up done on the status of issues discussed and recommendations made during meetings.

Need to improve work planning for effective mandate delivery

15. MINUSCA is required to develop annual work plans with specific, measurable and realistic outputs and targets for effective accomplishment of mandated activities.

16. The SSR Section developed its 2017/18 and 2018/19 annual work plans in line with the Mission's mandate as defined in relevant Security Council resolutions and the national SSR strategy, reflecting the Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 16 (peace, justice and strong institutions). The 2018/19 work plan incorporated gender perspectives advocating SDG 5 (gender equality), including support activities related to gender analysis in all national security institutions and the production of a compendium of female competencies in security institutions to increase the participation of women.

17. However, OIOS noted the following in the formulation of the work plans:

- Outputs and activities in the 2017/18 work plan were broad and did not include indicators and targets for assessing achievement, change or performance.
- While activities in the 2018/19 annual work plan were sufficiently detailed, some did not include any indicators of achievement, or the indicators were unclear.
- Outputs and activities in both work plans did not indicate planned start and completion dates.
- The work plans did not identify funding sources and other Mission components, such as the Justice and Corrections Section and the police component, even though they were involved in implementation of some of the activities.
- The work plans did not adequately consider available resources as the Section could not implement several planned activities including: (a) organization of one coordination workshop for monitoring and evaluation of progress made in the country's SSR; (b) facilitation of five workshops to support the implementation of a national security policy; and (c) 14 capacity building training sessions.

18. The above occurred as the SSR Section did not seek guidance from the Strategic Planning Unit on proper work plan development, which could impact the achievement of SSR objectives.

(3) MINUSCA should ensure that the Security Sector Reform Section's work plan is developed with specific, measurable and realistic outputs and targets.

MINUSCA accepted recommendation 3 and stated that SSR would discuss with the new Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary-General to initiate the review of the work plan and define the priorities. Recommendation 3 remains open pending receipt of the SSR Section's work plan that includes specific, measurable and realistic outputs and targets.

B. Work plan implementation

Need to advocate for the establishment of contributions tracking tools

19. The SSR Section made a provision in its 2018/19 work plan to support the Government in mobilizing political, financial, and technical assistance for the implementation of the national SSR strategy. While a number of international donors indicated their willingness to contribute, there were no tools to track pledges made by various donors, contributions received, and follow up on pledges not received. Hence, the exact amount of resources pledged and received by various security sectors to date was unknown. Further, most contributions were to benefit the defence sector, and little interest was shown towards internal security sectors, such as water and forestry, customs and border control.

20. MINUSCA had not, in conjunction with other stakeholders, appropriately advocated for: (a) the development and adoption of tools by the national authorities to monitor and follow up on pledges; and (b) funding to cover all security sub-sectors. This could result in uncoordinated and/or duplicative fundraising efforts and impact the achievement of national SSR objectives.

(4) MINUSCA should, in coordination with other security sector reform actors, support national authorities to establish tools for following up and monitoring pledges and contributions received, taking into account the less funded sub-sectors.

MINUSCA accepted recommendation 4 and stated that the SSR Section would continue to support the two national coordination platforms respectively chaired by the Ministry of Defence and the Ministry of Internal Security which have the function and objectives for monitoring donations and pledges. The SSR Section, in collaboration with the police component and the national authorities, was in the process of developing a system of indicators of needs and would continue to focus resources on the Ministry of Water and Forestry to be able to prioritize the initiated advocacy on border control. Recommendation 4 remains open pending receipt of evidence of tools developed to follow up and monitor pledges and contributions received taking into account the less funded sub-sectors.

Support was provided for implementing the provisions of the Khartoum Global Peace Agreement

21. The President of CAR on 12 February 2019 requested the support of MINUSCA and other international partners in the implementation of the provisions of the Khartoum Global Peace Agreement of 6 February 2019 for the Government to conceptualize and operationalize several SSR mechanisms. Accordingly, MINUSCA, in collaboration with other international partners, developed a concept note and concept of operations for the Special Mixed Units for Security (USMS), its legal framework, operating budgets and deployment plans. Also, the Mission contributed to the development of standard operating procedures to help local prefects establish Technical Committees for Security and Prefectoral Implementation Committees which would serve as a tool to share information and prevent conflict between communities or armed groups throughout the country.

Need to adequately plan and allocate necessary resources to implement capacity building activities

22. The SSR Section in its 2018/19 annual work plan identified capacity building and support activities to strengthen the capacity of the national security sector.

23. In collaboration with the European Union Training Mission (EUTM) and key bilateral partners, the SSR Section provided regular strategic and technical guidance to the SSR pillar of the National Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration/Security Sector Reform/National Reconciliation Coordination, the Defence and Security Commission of the National Assembly, and Ministries of Defence and Internal Security. This contributed to legislations relating to these entities and the development of key policies, such as the adoption of the National Defence Plan by the President of CAR.

24. However, several planned capacity building activities had not been conducted. For example, the SSR Section had not implemented: (a) 12 out of 16 planned activities to strengthen the capacity of relevant ministries and national institutions; and (b) 2 of the 3 activities to strengthen the capacity of the CAR civil society. Further, in April 2019, the Mission Support Division rejected a request of the SSR Section for \$100,000 to purchase some equipment to support capacity building.

25. The SSR Section had not adequately planned and allocated the necessary resources, which affected timely and effective implementation of SSR objectives and in some cases necessitated unplanned priority activities such as supporting the provisions of the Khartoum Global Peace Agreement at the request of senior leadership.

(5) MINUSCA should ensure that its planned capacity building activities are implemented in a timely manner through better planning and allocation of necessary resources.

MINUSCA accepted recommendation 5 and stated that the SSR Section would advocate with MINUSCA's leadership to limit the requests for new activities not previously planned in the SSR Section's work plan. SSR Section would reduce its joint planning activities with the National Security Sector Reform Coordination and better engage with the sectoral activities. Recommendation 5 remains open pending receipt of an action plan to ensure timely implementation of capacity building activities.

Support was provided to the establishment of integration mechanisms for ex-combatants

26. In 2018/19, the SSR Section participated in the activities of the Strategic Working Group on Integration established by the President of CAR to enhance a national integration framework for ex-combatants subsequent to DDR pilot projects. The SSR Section's support was effective for the Government to achieve: (a) training and integration of 232 ex-combatants demobilized through the 2016 and 2017 DDR pilot projects; (b) the development of an integration plan submitted to the CAR President in March 2018; and (c) establishment of a Steering Committee on Integration in January 2019 to inclusively oversee integration activities. Also, the Section assisted the development of an SSR national communication plan in August 2019 and participated in several field visits to the regions to promote awareness of local populations, local authorities and armed groups on integration, rank harmonization and USMS.

Need to advocate for the operationalization of national vetting mechanisms

27. The SSR Section' work plans included several activities to improve the credibility of newly recruited security forces and address concerns on human right violations.

28. MINUSCA assisted the national authorities in printing of thousands of copies of the CAR Military Justice Code and related flyers for distribution. The Mission also assisted national authorities in conducting a nationwide campaign in 2019 to sensitize 1,822 uniformed personnel, consisting 1,547 males and 275 females, on the Military Justice Code and System. Further, MINUSCA provided support to the development of a capacity building plan for the Office of Military Justice, as planned. MINUSCA established a Task Force, composed of related Mission components, prepared a concept note for setting up a nationally owned mechanism for vetting of uniformed personnel and ex-combatants selected for integration into the country's armed forces (FACA) and ISF.

29. However, a nationally owned vetting mechanism was not yet operational. This was because the MINUSCA leadership had not actively carried out advocacy actions to ensure the issuance of a presidential decree and adoption by the national authorities of a national policy on vetting, which were preconditions for operationalizing the vetting mechanism. Pending fulfillment of these preconditions, MINUSCA assisted local administration authorities and government institutions with ad-hoc requests for verification/vetting of 500 ISF personnel, 20 judiciary police officers, 300 corrections officers, FACA candidates for their retirement scheme, and 280 armed groups members. For this assistance, the Section used its own standard operating procedures on vetting and databases on human rights violations. Despite the progress, in the absence of a nationally owned vetting mechanism, the SSR process could lack credibility and result in the local population's mistrust toward security forces.

(6) MINUSCA should enhance its leadership's advocacy effort for the national authorities to establish a policy on vetting of uniformed personnel and ex-combatants to be integrated into defence and security forces.

MINUSCA accepted recommendation 6 and stated that it would enhance its leadership advocacy efforts for the national authorities to establish a nationally-owned vetting mechanism for integration of uniformed personnel and ex-combatants in the CAR security forces, including advocacy to ensure issuance of a Presidential decree to establish a national policy. Recommendation 6 remains open pending receipt of evidence of actions taken for the national authorities to adopt and implement a vetting policy.

MINUSCA provided support in recruitment of defence and security forces

30. In November 2018, the President of CAR requested the support of MINUSCA in recruitment of 1,023 FACA personnel to avoid mistakes of past recruitments that had not been well organized, and to mitigate risks of the process being flawed and unfair. This was an unplanned activity assigned to the SSR Section by the Mission leadership. The Section, in conjunction with other partners, assisted the national authorities in processing candidates' files, administering aptitude and medical tests, verifying/vetting selected candidates, handling complaints, publicizing recruitment results and regrouping of selected candidates to commence training. In addition, MINUSCA, in collaboration with EUTM, national authorities and other international partners, conducted an after-action-review of the recruitment process for lessons learned, which was shared with the Government for capacity building in this area.

The Mission assisted in deploying defence and internal security forces to regions and improving their sustainability to expand state authority

31. To achieve its 2018/19 work plan objective to promote expansion of state authority by supporting the deployment of FACA and ISF personnel in priority areas, the SSR Section supported ad-hoc redeployments of some FACA and ISF units trained by EUTM to four regions. Also, MINUSCA in collaboration with EUTM, assisted the national government in the development of key strategic and policy documents pertaining to the deployment of FACA and ISF outlining the principles, conditions, and

redeployment scheduling. Further, in January 2019, the Section assisted the national authorities in developing guidelines and an assessment tool/dashboard to review capability and performance of the units deployed to regions to ensure their sustainability. The Section, FACA and ISF have agreed to establish focal points and meet on a monthly basis to jointly address any issues raised.

The Mission provided support to the country on arms embargo exemption requests

32. The Security Council in its resolution 2127 (2013) imposed a general arms embargo on CAR territory to address the illicit proliferation of weapons and ammunition. In line with its 2018/19 work plan, the SSR Section carried out activities to assist the Government with the arms embargo exemption and notification requests to the Sanctions Committee of the Security Council to receive arms, assistance and related materials to support the ongoing SSR. This resulted in the approval by the Sanctions Committee of 17 exemption requests and 18 notifications submitted by the Government to provide training, weapons and equipment for FACA and ISF.

C. Performance assessment and staff training

Need to enhance evidence-based performance reporting and record management

33. MINUSCA is required to evaluate the effectiveness and continued relevance of its activities and assess the progress towards achievement of its objectives, and maintain sufficient evidence to support performance management.

34. Although the Mission's SSR activities had been evaluated in the past, MINUSCA started implementing the Comprehensive Performance Assessment System (CPAS) to assess performance across all areas of the Mission. At the time of the audit, the SSR Section had submitted to the Strategic Planning Unit the first three phases of the requirements: (a) mapping the context (based on the mandate); (b) defining the expected results; and (c) defining the evidence of the changes (indicators), and was planning to conduct self-evaluations as the next step. In view of the actions taken, OIOS did not make a recommendation.

35. However, the SSR Section did not properly maintain information generated in the course of its work to enable effective data collection for performance assessment. Weekly reports, capacity building/training/workshops documents and activity reports were not stored in the COSMOS repository system, which included limited information and lacked systematic organization, classification and archiving as of the audit date. This resulted because the SSR Section had not designated COSMOS focal points in each of its three cells and implemented procedures for systematic collection, classification/indexing, and archiving of data.

(7) MINUSCA should ensure that the Security Sector Reform Section: (a) designates and trains COSMOS repository system focal points; (b) implements procedures for systematic collection, classification/indexing and archiving of data; and (c) expedites the transfer of all relevant data from personal computers to COSMOS.

MINUSCA accepted recommendation 7 and stated that only one SSR Section staff was trained on CPAS and COSMOS and was the focal point for COSMOS. Upon recruitment of two P-4 SSR officers, they would be designated as COSMOS focal points with two P-3s as backup. One P-4 and one P-3 would remain the focal points for archiving and compiling all SSR information/documentation to be uploaded to COSMOS. Recommendation 7 remains open pending receipt of evidence of focal points being appointed and trained, transfer of all relevant data from

personal computers to COSMOS, and a copy of procedures for systematic collection, classification/indexing and archiving.

Need to provide training to all staff of the SSR Section

36. To enable effective work plan delivery, the SSR Section is required to provide adequate professional development opportunities to its staff. However, the Section was not effectively utilizing its training budget to benefit all its staff. During 2017/18 and 2018/19, the Section's training budget was used for only four staff to attend five external trainings to enhance their professional capacity. Also, 55 and 71 per cent of its training budget for 2017/18 and 2018/19, respectively, was used for the Director of the Section to attend external workshops/meetings. In addition, training reports were not prepared for two of the five external training attended by the staff and the required knowledge sharing sessions with the rest of the Section did not take place. This was because the SSR Section did not adequately analyze staff training needs to establish a training plan, and properly budget and utilize its training funds.

(8) MINUSCA should: (a) formulate a training budget for the Security Sector Reform Section based on needs assessment for all staff and monitor the utilization of the budget; and (b) share post-training reports and conduct knowledge sharing sessions after attending external training to benefit all Section staff.

MINUSCA accepted recommendation 8 and stated that the SSR Section was in the process of assessing the training needs of its staff and would develop and implement a training plan accordingly. SSR Section would also ensure that post-training reports are prepared and knowledge sharing sessions with the rest of the staff are conducted. Recommendation 8 remains open pending receipt of the results of the staff learning needs assessment and a copy of the SSR Section's training budget and action plan to monitor its utilization to the benefit of all Section staff.

IV. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

37. OIOS wishes to express its appreciation to the management and staff of MINUSCA for the assistance and cooperation extended to the auditors during this assignment.

(Signed) Eleanor T. Burns
Director, Internal Audit Division
Office of Internal Oversight Services

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
1	MINUSCA should finalize its security sector reform support strategy to provide overall guidance to the Mission's components on the implementation of security sector reform mandates and operational activities.	Important	O	Receipt of a copy of the approved security sector reform support strategy.	30 June 2020
2	MINUSCA should ensure its leadership enhance coordination with other security sector reform actors in the country and ensure effective functioning of coordination mechanisms through regular meetings and follow-up on the status of issues discussed and recommendations made during meetings.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of the measures taken to ensure effectiveness of coordination mechanisms and of follow-up done on the status of issues discussed and recommendations made during meetings.	30 June 2020
3	MINUSCA should ensure that the Security Sector Reform Section's work plan is developed with specific, measurable and realistic outputs and targets.	Important	O	Receipt of a copy of the SSR Section's work plan that includes specific, measurable and realistic outputs and targets.	30 June 2020
4	MINUSCA should, in coordination with other security sector reform actors, support national authorities to establish tools for following up and monitoring pledges and contributions received, taking into account the less funded sub-sectors.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of tools developed to follow-up and monitor pledges and contributions received taking into account less funded sub-sectors.	30 June 2020
5	MINUSCA should ensure that its planned capacity building activities are implemented in a timely manner through better planning and allocation of necessary resources.	Important	O	Receipt of an action plan to ensure timely implementation of capacity building activities.	30 June 2020

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

³ C = closed, O = open

⁴ Date provided by MINUSCA in response to recommendations.

STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

Audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical ¹ / Important ²	C/ O ³	Actions needed to close recommendation	Implementation date ⁴
6	MINUSCA should enhance its leadership's advocacy effort for the national authorities to establish a policy on vetting of uniformed personnel and ex-combatants to be integrated into defence and security forces.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of actions taken for the national authorities to adopt and implement a vetting policy.	30 June 2020
7	MINUSCA should ensure that the Security Sector Reform Section: (a) designates and trains COSMOS repository system focal points; (b) implements procedures for systematic collection, classification/indexing and archiving of data; and (c) expedites the transfer of all relevant data from personal computers to COSMOS.	Important	O	Receipt of evidence of focal points being appointed and trained and transfer of all relevant data from personal computers to COSMOS and a copy of procedures for systematic collection, classification/indexing and archiving.	30 June 2020
8	MINUSCA should: (a) formulate a training budget for the Security Sector Reform Section based on needs assessment for all staff and monitor the utilization of the budget; and (b) share post-training reports and conduct knowledge sharing sessions after attending external training to benefit all Section staff.	Important	O	Receipt of the results of the staff learning needs assessment and a copy of the SSR Section's training budget and action plan to monitor its utilization to the benefit of all Section staff.	30 June 2020

APPENDIX I

Management Response

United Nations

United Nations Multidimensional Integrated
Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic



Nations Unies

Mission Multidimensionnelle Intégrée des Nations Unies
pour la Stabilisation en République centrafricaine

INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

MEMORANDUM INTERIEUR

TO: Mr. Daeyoung Park, Chief
A: Peacekeeping Audit Service
Internal Audit Division, OIOS

DATE: 16 December 2019

FROM: Mr. Mankeur Ndiaye
DE: Special Representative of the Secretary-General
United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization
Mission in the Central African Republic

REFERENCE MINUSCA-
COS-RMCU/04/2019

A blue ink handwritten signature of Mr. Mankeur Ndiaye, which appears to read "Mankeur Ndiaye".

SUBJECT: **Draft Report on an audit of Security Sector Reform in the United Nations**
OBJET: **Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic**
(Assignment No. AP2019/637/07)

1. With reference to your memorandum of 15 December 2019 (OIOS:2019-637-07-04), on the above captioned-subject matter, please find attached MINUSCA's response (Appendix 1) for your consideration.

Regards,

Cc:

Mr. Musa Gassama, Officer-in Charge, Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary-General, Political and Protection of Civilians, MINUSCA
Ms. Vivian van de Perre, Chief of Staff, MINUSCA
Ms. Carole Baudoin, Officer in Charge, Security Sector Reform Section, MINUSCA
Mr. Richard Glass, Strategic Planning Officer, MINUSCA
Ms. Tiphaine Dickson, Risk Management and Compliance Officer, MINUSCA
Mr. Laud Botchwey, Chief Resident Auditor for MINUSCA, OIOS
Ms. Cynthia Avena-Castillo, Professional Practices Section, OIOS

Management Response

Audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical¹/ Important²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
1	MINUSCA should finalize the Mission's security sector reform support strategy to provide overall guidance to the Mission components on the implementation of security sector reform mandates and operational activities.	Important	Yes	Chief SSR Section	30 June 2020	MINUSCA will finalize a strategy for the Security Sector Reform Section including: (a) guiding principles of the United Nations programming such as gender and human rights considerations, (b) clear, measurable and time-bound objectives (c) required human and financial resources and (d) coordination mechanism to integrate and harmonize the work of various actors.
2	MINUSCA should ensure its leadership enhance coordination with other security sector reform actors in the country and ensure effective functioning of the coordination mechanisms through regular meetings and follow-up on the status of issues discussed and recommendations made during meetings.	Important	Yes	MINUSCA DSRSG	(a) 30 March 2020	The Security Sector Reform Section (a) will review the draft of the MINUSCA Security Sector Reform Task force terms of reference for submission and approval of the new Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary General for consideration, guidance and approval. The review of the terms of reference will include the lessons learned from the previous years and the new dynamic and priorities of the Mission Support to the implementation of the peace agreement and to the Restoration of State Authority (RESA) Strategy.

¹ Critical recommendations address critical and/or pervasive deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance cannot be provided with regard to the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

² Important recommendations address important (but not critical or pervasive) deficiencies in governance, risk management or control processes, such that reasonable assurance may be at risk regarding the achievement of control and/or business objectives under review.

Management Response

Audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical¹/ Important²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
					(b) 30 June 2020	The Security Sector Reform Section has (b) already engaged discussions with UNPOL and is reviewing the objectives and mechanisms of the international working group on the Integrated Strategic Framework (ISF); considering the new dynamic with a new European Union Civilian Mission and the need to reinforce the objectives and coherence of the international assistance, including indicators of reference and results. A similar approach was initiated with EUTM regarding the co-chairing the Defense International Working Group.
3	MINUSCA should ensure that the Security Sector Reform Section's work plan is developed with specific, measurable and realistic outputs and targets.	Important	Yes	Chief SSR Section	30 June 2020	During the second semester of the 2019/2020 work plan, Security Sector Reform Section (a) will concentrate its efforts to implement the planned activities, limiting to the essential while keeping in mind the implementation of the security provisions of the Peace Agreement; (b) will discuss with the new Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary General to initiate the review of the workplan and define the priorities; (c) the 2020/2021 workplan will considerably reduce its expectation, especially the limited commitment of the Government of Central African Republic.

Management Response

Audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical¹/ Important²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
4	MINUSCA should, in coordination with other security sector reform actors, support national authorities to establish tools for following up and monitoring pledges and contributions received, taking into account the less funded sub-sectors.	Important	Yes	Chief SSR Section	30 June 2020	As indicated in the comments of Recommendation 2, the Security Sector Reform Section will continue to support the two national coordination platforms respectively chaired by the Ministry of Defense and the Ministry of Internal Security. These groups have the function and objectives (a) to monitor the various donations and pledges announced by the donors. The Security Sector Reform Section in collaboration with MINUSCA UNPOL and the mentioned-above Ministries are developing a system of indicators of needs; (b) continue the focus resources on the Ministry of Water and Forestry's to be able to prioritize the initiated advocacy on border control.
5	MINUSCA should ensure its planned capacity building activities are implemented in a timely manner through better planning and allocation of necessary resources.	Important	Yes	Chief SSR Section	30 June 2020	Security Sector Reform will advocate with MINUSCA's leadership to limit the requests to new activities not previously planned in the Security Sector Reform workplan. Security Sector Reform will reduce its joint planning activities with the national Security Sector Reform coordination and will better engage with the sectorial activities.
6	MINUSCA should enhance its leadership's advocacy effort for the national authorities to establish a policy on	Important	Yes	MINUSCA DSRSG	30 June 2020	MINUSCA will increase and enhance its leadership's advocacy efforts for the national authorities to establish a

Management Response

Audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical¹/ Important²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
	vetting of uniformed personnel and ex-combatants to be integrated into defense and security forces.					nationally-owned vetting mechanism regarding the integration of uniformed personnel and ex-combatants in the CAR security forces, including advocacy to ensure the issuance of a Presidential decree to establish and operationalize a national policy to enhance trust in the credibility of the SSR process among the local populations.
7	MINUSCA should ensure that the Security Sector Reform Section: (a) designate and train COSMOS repository system focal points; (b) implement procedures for systematic collection, classification/indexing and archiving of data; and (c) expedite the transfer of all relevant data from personal computers to COSMOS.	Important	Yes	Chief SSR Section	30 June 2020	Security Sector Reform has currently not yet reached its full staffing capacity with three (3) missing staff members. Only one (1) staff member was trained on CPAS and COSMOS and is the focal point for COSMOS. As soon as (a) the two (2) P4 Security Sector Reform officers will be recruited, they will be designated as COSMOS Focal Point with two (2) P3 as backup; (b and c) One (1) P4 and one (1) P3 will remain the focal points for archiving and compiling all Security Sector Reform information/documentation to be uploaded to COSMOS.
8	MINUSCA should: (a) formulate training budget for the Security Sector Reform Section based on needs assessment for all staff and monitor utilization of the budget; and (b) share post training reports and conduct knowledge sharing sessions after	Important	Yes	Chief SSR Section	30 June 2020	Security Sector Reform Section is in the process of assessing the training needs of its staff and will develop and implement a training plan accordingly. Security Sector Reform Section will also ensure that post training reports

Management Response

Audit of security sector reform support in the United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic

Rec. no.	Recommendation	Critical¹/ Important²	Accepted? (Yes/No)	Title of responsible individual	Implementation date	Client comments
	attending external training to benefit all Section staff.					are prepared and knowledge sharing sessions with the rest of the staff are conducted.